** ![C:\Documents and Settings\Administrator.MHE-F75804D1083\Desktop\298px-IGNOU_logo.svg[1].png]()**

Saint mary’s university COLLEGE (ethiopia) and INDIRA GANDHI NATIONAL OPEN UNIVERSITY (INDIA)

Factors affecting Productive safety net PROGRAMME (PSNP) implementation at local level: the CASE OF Wuchale Woreda, North Shewa Zone, Oromia REGION, Ethiopia

A THESIS

SUBMITTED TO

INDIRA GANDHI NATIONAL OPEN UNIVERSTY

FOR THE FUL-FILLMENT OF

MASTER DEGREE IN RURAL DEVELOPMENT

BY

TADELE ARARSA NIGIRTI

ID NO.: 089132663

OCTOBER, 2011

FITCHE, ETHIOPIA

DECLARATION

I hereby declare that the Dissertation entitled with FACTORS AFFECTING THE IMPLEMENTATION OF PRODUCTIVE SAFETY NET PROGRAMME AT LOCAL LEVEL: THE CASE OF WUCHALE WOREDA, NORTH SHOA ZONE, OROMIA RGION, ETHIOPIA submitted by me for the partial fulfillment of the M.A. in Rural Development to Indra Gandhi National Open University, (IGNOU) New Delhi is my own original work and has not been submitted earlier to IGNOU or to any other institution for the fulfillment of the requirement for any course of study. I also declare that no chapter of this manuscript in whole or in part is lifted and incorporated in this report from any earlier work done by me or others.

Place: St. Mary’s University College, Ethiopia Signature----------------

 Date: 27/10/2011 Enrolment No. 089132663

 Name: TADELE ARASA NIGIRTI

 Address: North Shoa Zone, Fitche, Ethiopia

ii

 CERTIFICATE

This is to certify that Mr./ Miss/ Mrs *TADELE ARARSA NIGIRTI* student of M.A. (RD) from Indira Gandhi National Open University, New Delhi was working under my supervision and guidance for his/her Project Work for the Course MRDP-001. His/ Her Project work entitled with FACTORS AFFECTING THE IMPLEMENTATION OF PRODUCTIVE SAFETY NET PROGRAMME AT LOCAL LEVEL: THE CASE OF WUCHALE WOREDA, NORTH SHOA ZONE, OROMIA RGION, ETHIOPIA which he/she is submitting, is his/ her genuine and original work.

Place: \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_ Signature\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

Date: \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_ Name: \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

 Address: \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

iii

 Biography

The author was born of his mother Yadashi Amana Kakaba and his father Ararsa Nigirti Buta at Jima town in March 27, 1966 and grew up at Ambo district West Shoa Zone of Oromia Region, Ethiopia. His primary, junior and secondary educations were completed at Ambo elementary and comprehensive secondary high schools at Ambo town. After accomplishing his secondary high school level of education, first, he joined the Gonder Teachers Training Institute and graduated with Certificate in 1989. Second, he joined the then Ambo College of agriculture and the present Ambo University and graduated with Diploma in General Agriculture in the year 1992. Third, he also joined the Alemaya University of Agriculture, which is now named as Haramaya University and graduated with B.Sc. in Plant Science in the year 1997.

 Regarding his work experience, he has been working for Ministry Of Agriculture as Productive Safety Net Programme(PSNP) Implementation Officer in North Shoa Zone, since November 2010. Previously, he served in the non government organizations (NGOs) in various capacities as follows: as a Project Coordinator of rural development projects, in West Arsi Zone, Oromia from July 2009 to June 2010 for Rural Organisation for Betterment of Agro-pastoralists (ROBA), NGO. He also worked for SOS Sahel International /UK from May 1998 to June 2009 in different positions: as a Project Manager of Food Security Support Project (FSSP), Agronomist, Relief and Training Monitor in Wolaita zone Kindo Koisha and as a Senior Natural Resource Management Expert of Food Security Capacity Enhancement Project (FSCEP) based at Awassa, SNNPR. Moreover, he involved as a researcher of Rural Livelihoods of Eastern Harerghe, Oromia region from July, 1997 to March, 1998 for CISP International NGO / Italy. On the other hand, the author also performed as primary and junior secondary schools teacher and unit leader in West Shoa Zone, Oromia Region from 1982 to 1995.

iv

Acknowledgements

#

# This report is dedicated to the people of Wuchale who have always been willing to give their time to discuss at length the many aspects of their lives on which this report is based, and from which we hope they will ultimately derive some tangible benefit.

# Above all, I would like to thank the supreme, Almighty God, for making it possible. First and foremost, I exceedingly want to extend the deepest and heartfelt appreciation to my advisor Dr. Mengistu Huluka since the report would not have been possible without his continuous and critical review, wholehearted encouragement, guidance, inspiring suggestions, and professional expertise for the completion of this work.

#

Thanks are due in particular to Guluma Gutema, Wuchale Woreda Office of Agriculture staff and DAs of study kebeles for their continuous and profound contributions throughout the fieldwork. The woreda administration and the Peasant Associations chairmen and the staff of Wuchale woreda Office of Agriculture could not have been more helpful in facilitating the fieldwork and responding sometimes at very short notice to my every request and of course providing much needed shelter and hospitality. Particular thanks go to Helen Chala for her computer writing sometimes while I was busy. Furthermore, this report is also dedicated to my father Ararsa Nigirti who presently passed away for his parental hospitality and pieces of advice he made for my success of all levels of education. Moreover, thanks to my mother who is alive and my sons Ebsa Tadele, Bekele Tadele, Tsegaye Tadele. Finally, special thanks to Hawi Dinkisissa and my daughter Ayantu Tadele for their sustained patient, incessant motivation and always being there.

v

Table of Contents

 **Title Page**

[**Declaration………………………………………………**](#_Toc276467436)**…………………………ii**

**CERTIFICATE…………………………………………………………………………..iii**

**Biography………………………………………………………………………..........iv**

[**Acknowledements………… ……………………….**](#_Toc276467438)**.............................................v**

**TABLE OF CONTENTS…………………………………………………………………vi**

[**List of Tables…………………………………**](#_Toc276467445)**……………………………………viii**

**List of Figures………………………………………………………………………..ix**

**LIST OF BOXES …………………………………………………………………………ix**

[**Abbreviations and Acronyms………………………**](#_Toc276467447)**…………………………x**

[**Abstract…………………………………………………………………...…**](#_Toc276467437)**………xi**ii

[**CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION**](#_Toc306422239)………………………………………………………. .1

[**1.1.Background…**…………………...……………………………….](#_Toc306422240).......................1

[**1.2. Productive Safety Net Programme Development**](#_Toc306422241)…………………..7

[1.2.1. Overview of PSNP in Ethiopia](#_Toc306422242)………………………………………………………………….7

[1.2.2. Overview of PSNP in Wuchale Woreda](#_Toc306422298) ……………………………………….…11

####  1.2.2.1. General…………………………………………………………11

####  1.2.2.2. Institutional and Management Arrangements of

####  PSNP ……………………………………………………………....13

####  1.2.2.3. TARGETING……………………………………………..………..15

[**1.3. STATEMENT OF PROBLEMS**](#_Toc306422299)…………………………………………..…………………………………..16

[**1.4. General Objective**](#_Toc306422300)…………………………………………………….………………….………..…….18

 [**1.5. Specific Objectives**](#_Toc306422301)……………………….……………………………………..……..………………18

[**1.6. Research Questions**](#_Toc306422302)…………………………………………………………………………….……..…..18

[**1.7. Significance of the Study**](#_Toc306422303)…………………………………………………………………..………18

[**1.8. Scope and Limitations of the Study**](#_Toc306422304)……………………..……………..……...19

[**CHAPTER 2: Literature Review**](#_Toc306422305)………………………………….……………20

[**2.1. Conceptual Framework and Definitions**](#_Toc306422306)……………………………………...20

[2.1.1. Origin, Concept, and Objective of PSNP](#_Toc306422307)…………………………………..…….20

[2.1.2. EMPERICAL STUDIES](#_Toc306422308) …………………………………………………………………………………….22

####  2.1.2.1. GEOGRAPHICal Targeting within woreda…………22

####  2.1.2.2. Institutions and Process………………………………..23

 2.1.2.3. Targeting of Public Works and Direct Support...24

####  2.1.2.4. ERROR of Exclusion and Inclusion…………………..24

####  2.1.2.5. Period of Graduation and Registration…………..25

####  2.1.2.6. Process of Appeals and Grievance…………………..26

####  2.1.2.7. Attendance of Schooling and Child Labour…….27

####  2.1.2.8. Payments………………………………………………………27

vi

####  2.1.2.9. Public Asset Creation……………………………………..29

 [2**.1.3. Definition of Poverty.**](#_Toc306422311).........................................................................31

####  2.1.3.1. POVERTY AND FOOD SECURITY…………………………….31

 2.1.3.2. Sustainable LIVELIHOOD AND ITS FRAMEWORK…….33

####  2.1.3.3. Policies and Strategies of Food Security………...35

[**CHAPTER 3: METHODOLOGY OF RESEARCH**](#_Toc306422312) ………………………….…....…36

[**3.1. Description of the Study Area**](#_Toc306422314) …………………………………….……………….….36

 3.1.1. NORTH SHEWA ZONE……………………………………………………36

 3.1.2. WUCHALE DISTRICT………………..………………………...………….38

 3.1.2.1 LOCATION AND CLIMATE………..……….……………………….38

 3.1.2.2. SOCIOECONOMIC ASPECTS………..…………….………………..40

[**3.2. Research Methodology**](#_Toc306422317)……………………………………………………….…………..….. 42

 [3.2.1. Selection of the Study Area](#_Toc276467513) ……………………………………………..….…44

####  3.2.2. [Sample Size](#_Toc276467515)  …………………………………………………………………….…..44

####  [3.2.3. Data Type and Source](#_Toc276467517) ……………………………………………………………....45

####  [3.2.4. Analysis](#_Toc276467518) and Interpretation of Data ………………………... 46

[**CHAPTER 4: RESULTS AND DISCUSSIONS**](#_Toc306422318)…………………………………….…47

 [**4.1. DEMOGRAPHIC AND Socio-economic -characteristics of the respondents**](#_Toc306422319)……………………………………………………………………………………………….………….……47

 [4.1.1. SEX OF HOUSEHOLD HEADS](#_Toc306422320)………………..…………………………………………….…… 47

 [4.1.2. AGE OF HUSEHOLD HEADS……..](#_Toc306422321) ……………….…………………………………………..48

 [4.1.3. MARITAL STATUS OF HOSEHOLD HEADS](#_Toc306422322)…………….……………………….…….48

 [4.1.4. FAMILY SIZE OF HOUSEHOLD HEADS](#_Toc306422323)……………………………………….…..…….49

 [4.1.5. EDUCATION LEVEL OF HOUSEHOLD HEADS](#_Toc306422324)………………………….…….……50

 [4.1.6. Ownership OF Assets](#_Toc306422325)……………………………………………………………………………..51

[**4.2. Issues Related to PSNP Implementation and Management**](#_Toc306422326)..55

 [4.2.1. Targeting FOR PSNP……](#_Toc306422327) ……………………..……………………….………………………. 55

 [4.2.2. Appeals on targeting process……](#_Toc306422328) ……………………………………………….61

 [4.2.3. Payments OF TRANSFER](#_Toc306422329) ………………………………………………….………………..…..63

 [4.2.4. Participation OF Community in public works](#_Toc306422330)….………………….64

 [4.2.5. Situation of Gender and Child labor](#_Toc306422331)….……………………………………67

 [4.2.6. Arrangements OF Institutions](#_Toc306422332)…………….……………………………….……… 70

 [4.2.7. Institutions OF Woreda Level……](#_Toc306422333) ………………………………………………70

 [4.2.8. Bureaus OF Woreda Sector](#_Toc306422334)………………………………………….…………..………71

[**CHAPTER 5: CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATION**](#_Toc306422335)………….………...…73

[**5.1. Conclusions**](#_Toc306422336)**…**……………………………………………………………………..……………………………..…73

[**5.2. RECOMMENDATION**](#_Toc306422337)……………………………………………………………………………………………..75

 [5.2.1. TARGETING OF BENEFICIARIES](#_Toc306422338)……………………………………………….…………….76

 [5.2.2. Transfer OF PAYMENTS](#_Toc306422339)……………………………………………………….…..……………77

 [5.2.3. Participation of Community in Public Works](#_Toc306422340)…………….……….78

 [5.2.4. Arrangements of Institution…….](#_Toc306422341) ………………………….…………………..79

**REFERENCES……………………………….…………………………………………..80**

**APPENDIXES**……………………………………………………………………..……..83

vii

**APPENDIX I**: **Principles of PSNP………**……………………………………..….83

**APPENDIX II: DETERMINING HOUSEHOLD ELIGIBILITY**…………………. .84

**APPENDIX III: QUESTIONAIRE USED FOR STUDY………**……...……………...85

List of Tables

Table 1.1. LIST OF PSNP AREAS AND BENEFICIARIES IN ETHIOPIA……………………………………………………………………………………...…9

Table 1. 2. PSNP HOUSEHOLDS IN THE WUCHALE WOREDA………………………..12

Table 2.1. COMPOSITION OF FOOD SECURITY TASK FORCES(FSTFS)…………………………………………………………………...…………...23

Table 2.2. SOME CHARACTERISTICS OF DIFFERENT PUBLIC WORKS IN ETHIOPIA……………………………………………………………………………………....30

Table 3.1. NUMBER OF LIVESTOCK IN THE DISTRICT…………………………….….41

TABLE 3.2. Definition of VARIABLES …………………………………………………………...46

Table 4.1. SEX STRUCTURE OF THE SAMPLE HOUSEHOLDS………………………..47

Table 4.2. SEX STRUCTURE OF THE SAMPLE HOUSEHOLDS………….…………….48

Table 4.3. MARITAL STATUS OF THE SAMPLE FARMERS………………………...….49

Table 4.4. THE FAMILY SIZE OF THE SAMPLED FARMERS…………………………49

Table 4.5. EDUCATION LEVEL OF THE SAMPLED HOUSEHOLDS……………….…..50

Table 4. 6. DOMESTIC ASSETS OF SAMPLE HOUSEHOLDS………………………...…51

Table 4. 7. LIVESTOCK OWNERSHIP STATUS OF SAMPLE HOUSEHOLDS…………52

Table 4.8. FARM SIZE OF SAMPLE HOUSEHOLDS……………………….………….….53

Table 4. 9. ANNUAL CROP PRODUCTION IN 2010 (in Quintal)………..…………....54

Table 4. 10. HOUSEHOLDS’ PERCEPTION ON THE MAJOR CRITERIA OF

 TARGETING…………………………………………………………….….….…57

Table 4. 11. MAJOR PROBLEMS AFFECTING THE PROCESS OF TARGETING….…..60

Table 4. 12. PERCEPTION OF HOUSEHOLDS ON THE CHALLENGES OF PARTICIPATION ON MAJOR DECISION MAKING PROCESS OF PSNP IMPLEMENTATION……………………………………….……………………….…………..66

viii

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1. PSNP Coordination Mechanism……………………………………….……………... 10

Figure 2. Woreda FSP Coordination and Management Mechanism…………………………….14

Figure 3. Sustainable Livelihoods Framework………………….……………………………….34

Figure 4. The Asset Pentagon…………………………………………………………………....34

Figure 5. Map of North Shewa Zone, Oromia, Ethiopia………………..………………….……39

Figure 6. Sex Category of Respondent Households…………………..…………………………47

Figure 7. Level of Education of Respondents…………………...………………………….……50

Figure 8. Major Problems in Targeting HHs………………..……………….………………......61

List of Boxes

Box 1: The PSNP budget arrangements……………………………………………...…………. 13

Box 2: Definition of Target Areas and Households……………………………………………..15

Box 3: Graduation……………………………………………………………………………….26

Box 4: International Consensus on Poverty……………………………………………………..32

Box 5: International Consensus on Food Security………………………………………………33

Box 6: Food Sufficiency……………………………...……………………………………….…33

Box 7: What is a Sustainable Livelihood?....................................................................................33

ix

  ABBREVIATION AND ACRONYMS

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| ADLI AIDSARDO BoARDBoFED BPRCBHWCBPWDCCICIDA  | Agricultural Development Led IndustrializationAcquired Immune Deficiency SyndromeAgriculture and Rural Development OfficeBureau of Agriculture and Rural DevelopmentBureau of Finance and Economic DevelopmentBusiness Process ReengineeringCommunity Based Health WorkersCommunity Based Participatory Watershed Development Complementary Community Investment Canadian International Development Agency |
| CFI  | Chronically Food Insecure  |
| CFSTF CSA DA DFID DARDO DPPC DRMDRMFSS DS EAFMEGS | Community Food Security Task Force Central Statistical AuthorityDevelopment AgentDepartment for International Development(UK)Department of Agriculture and Rural Development OfficeDisaster Prevention and Preparedness CommissionDisaster Risk ManagementDisaster Risk Management and Food Security SectorDirect SupportEconomically Active Family MemberEmployment Generation Scheme |
| ESMF EWRF  |  Environmental and Social Management Framework  Early Warning Response Female |
| FFSSCFGDFSFSCD FSD FSPGDP  |  Federal Food Security Steering Committee x Focus Group Discussion Food Security Food Security Coordination Directorate Food Security Desk Food Security Programme Gross Domestic Product |
| GoE |  Government of Ethiopia  |
| HABP HH HIV IFAD  |  Household Asset Building Programme  Household Human Immune Virus International Fund for Agricultural Development |
| KAC Kebele  |  Kebele Appeals Committee  A sub-district consisting of about 5000 residents and  representing the lowest administrative hierarchy |
| KFSTF  |  Kebele Food Security Task Force  |
| M&E KMM |  Monitoring and Evaluation  Kilo Meter Male |
| M & E MDG MERET  |  Monitoring and Evaluation Millennium Development Goal Managing Environmental Resources to enable Transition to Sustainable Livelihoods (Joint Programme between MoA and WFP) |
| MFI  |  Micro-Finance Institution  |
| MoARD  |  Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development  |
| MoFED MOWR |  Ministry of Finance and Economic Development  Ministry of Water Resources |
| NPDRM NGO |  National Policy for Disaster Response Management  Non-Government Organizationxi |
| ODI  |  Overseas Development Institute  |
| OFSP PA PASDEP  |  Other Food Security Programmes Peasant Association Plan for Accelerated and Sustained Development to End Poverty |
| PIM PRSP  |  Programme Implementation Manual  Poverty Reduction Strategic Paper |
| PSCAP  |  Public Sector Capacity Building Project  |
| PSNP  |  Productive Safety Net Programme  |
| PW  |  Public Work |
| PWCU  |  (Regional) Public Works Coordination Unit  |
| PWFU  |  (Federal) Public Works Focal Unit  |
| RCBRFM  |  Rural Capacity Building (Project)  Risk Financing Mechanism |
| SNNPRSPSS TTCUSAIDUSDWFP  |  Southern Nations; Nationalities and People’s Region  Statistical Package for Social Science  Total Technical Committee United States Agency for International Development United States Dollar  World Food Programme  |
| WFSTF WOARDWOFED  |  Woreda Food Security Task Force Woreda Office of Agriculture and Rural Development Woreda Office of Finance and Economic Development |
| ZARDO |  Zonal Agriculture and Rural Development Office xii |

 Abstract

*Food insecurity in Ethiopia is normally understood in terms of recurrent food crisis and famines, and responses to food insecurity have conventionally been dominated by emergency food-based interventions. In the ten years from 1994 to 2003, an average of five million Ethiopians were in need of emergency assistance, and since 1998 the numbers of food aid beneficiaries in Ethiopia fluctuated between 5 and 14 million every year (Devereux S, et al, 2006). In response to this, under the Food Security Programme, in 2005, the Government of Ethiopia started a major new initiative - the Productive Safety Net Programme (PSNP) that distinguishes between chronic and transitory food insecurity and aimed to assure food consumption and prevent asset depletion for food insecure households in chronically food insecure woredas, while stimulating markets, improving access to services and natural resources, and rehabilitating and enhancing the natural environment (MOARD, 2006). This research report examines Factors affecting Productive Safety net Programme (PSNP) implementation at local level: the Case of Wuchale Woreda, North Shewa Zone, Oromia Region, Ethiopia. Household surveys, focus group discussions, and key informant interviews were used as major sources of data. Analysis was based on quantitative and qualitative data gathered from primary sources, using both structured and unstructured questionnaires, from 172 randomly selected beneficiaries (132 PW, and 40 DS),* *focus group discussions, key informant interviews, and field* *observations. Secondary data were also collected from different sources. The study results revealed that the implementation of PSNP faced many challenges like poor geographical, administrative and community targeting. The process was also with corruption and nepotism as demonstrated by high rate of error of inclusion and error of exclusion. The other challenges that negatively affect the programme were lack of active community participation in decision making, and poor institutional arrangements.*

*Key Words: PSNP, Chronically Food Insecure, Challenge, Targeting, Wuchale*

xiii