



St. Mary's University ቅዱስ ማርያም  
የኢትዮጵያ  
*Committed to Excellence*

# Assessment of Project Quality Management Practices: In The Case of Awash, Dashen and United Bank

**By: Michael Eshete**

A Research Paper Submitted to St. Mary's University School of  
Graduate studies Presented in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirement for  
Masters of Arts Degree in Project Management

Advisor: Muluadam Alemu (Ph.D)

St. Mary's University  
Addis Ababa, Ethiopia  
July 2021


St. Mary's University  
School of Graduate studies

Assessment of Project Quality Management Practices:  
In The Case of Awash, Dashen and United Bank

By: Michael Eshete

Thesis Approval Sheet

**Approved by Board of Examiners**

_____	_____	_____
Dean	Signature	Date
Muluadam Alemu (Ph.D) Advisor	 Signature	July 22, 2021 Date
_____	_____	_____
Internal Examiner	Signature	Date
_____	_____	_____
External Examiner	Signature	Date

## **Declaration**

I, Michael Eshete Kassaye, hereby declare that this work entitled—Assessment of Project Quality Management Practices: In The Case of Awash, Dashen and United Bank, is my own original work which is the outcome of my own effort and study that all sources of materials used for the study have been duly acknowledged. I have produced it independently except for the guidance and suggestion of the research advisor. This study has not previously in its entirety or in part submitted at any university for a degree.

**Declared by:**

**Name:** Michael Eshete

**Signature:** \_\_\_\_\_

**Date:** \_\_\_\_\_

**St. Mary's University**

**School of Graduate Studies**

This is to Certify that the thesis prepared by Michael Eshete, entitled: Assessment of Project Quality Management Practices: In The Case of Awash, Dashen and United Bank submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Arts Degree in Project Management complies with the regulations of the University and meets the accepted standards with respect to originality and quality.



June 18, 2021

Advisor: Muluadam Alemu (PH.D)

Signature & Date

## **Abstract**

The banking industry is one of the largest investments in Ethiopia. Almost all the services in the banking sectors are implemented as a project. Hence, project quality management has undeniable importance to those banking sectors to deliver their service with the desired quality. Since the services delivered by those banking sectors are almost similar quality is the key to with their competitors by increasing customer satisfaction. The main objective of the research is to explore the project quality management practice in selected private banks, find the potential gaps and put possible recommendations for those gaps. The empirical data were obtained from qualitative research methods and thematic analysis is used to analyze the raw data and generate a meaningful conclusion. Reliability and validity have also been taken into consideration. The result of this study indicates that those private banks do not have separate project quality management process which includes Plan Quality Management, Manage Quality, and Control Quality. They perform it implicitly by integrating with other tasks. The study also reveals other gaps in their project quality management process, which are lack of commitment, awareness and skill in different stakeholders and poor communication between them. For better and improved project quality management practices in those banks the researcher mainly recommends that there should be a separate and independent process of project quality management processes. This will make the banks to give it appropriate attention and manage it well.

**Keywords:** Project quality management, Plan Quality Management, Manage Quality, Control Quality

## **Acknowledgement**

First I would like to thank Almighty GOD who strengthens me. Next, I would like to thank all my friends who give me their continuous support and comment. There is my advisor Dr. Muluadam Alemu who makes this research real with his all priceless effort and advice to follow up me in all journeys in this project work. I would like to thank all the selected banks and their staffs for all hospitality and a great help. For their unlimited and unconditional love and support, I would like to pass my deepest gratitude to my family even though it is way less than what they are meant to me. Last but not least, I would like to thank my girlfriend, what is a king without a queen?

# Contents

Declaration.....	III
Abstract.....	V
Acknowledgement.....	VI
Acronyms and Abbreviations.....	IX
<b>CHAPTER ONE.....</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>Introduction</b>	
<b>1.1 Background of the study.....</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>1.2 Background of the organization.....</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>1.3 Statement of the problem.....</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>1.4 Research Questions.....</b>	<b>6</b>
<b>1.5 Research Objectives.....</b>	<b>6</b>
<b>1.5.1 General Objective.....</b>	<b>6</b>
<b>1.5.2 Specific Objectives.....</b>	<b>7</b>
<b>1.6 Significance of the study.....</b>	<b>7</b>
<b>1.7 Scope of the study.....</b>	<b>7</b>
<b>1.8 Limitation of the study.....</b>	<b>8</b>
<b>1.9 Organization of the study.....</b>	<b>8</b>
<b>CHAPTER TWO.....</b>	<b>9</b>
<b>Literature Review</b>	
<b>2.1 Theoretical Literature Review.....</b>	<b>9</b>
<b>2.1.1 Project and project management.....</b>	<b>9</b>
<b>2.1.1.1 Project.....</b>	<b>9</b>
<b>2.1.1.2 Project management.....</b>	<b>10</b>
<b>2.1.2 Project management body of knowledge.....</b>	<b>11</b>
<b>2.1.3 Quality.....</b>	<b>12</b>
<b>2.1.4 Project Quality.....</b>	<b>12</b>
<b>2.1.5 Project Quality Management.....</b>	<b>13</b>
<b>2.1.5.1 Planning Quality Management.....</b>	<b>15</b>
<b>2.1.5.2 Managing Quality.....</b>	<b>16</b>
<b>2.1.5.3 Controlling Quality.....</b>	<b>17</b>
<b>2.1.6 Benefits of quality.....</b>	<b>18</b>
<b>2.1.7 Roles of top management in Project quality management.....</b>	<b>18</b>
<b>2.2 Empirical Literature Review.....</b>	<b>19</b>
<b>2.2.1 Quality.....</b>	<b>19</b>
<b>2.2.2 Quality in Financial Institution.....</b>	<b>20</b>
<b>2.2.3 Project quality management.....</b>	<b>21</b>
<b>CHAPTER THREE.....</b>	<b>23</b>
<b>Research Design and Methodology</b>	
<b>3.1 Research Design.....</b>	<b>23</b>
<b>3.2 Research Approach.....</b>	<b>23</b>
<b>3.3 Total Population and the Sampling Size.....</b>	<b>24</b>
<b>3.3.1 Population.....</b>	<b>24</b>
<b>3.3.2 Sampling Technique.....</b>	<b>24</b>
<b>3.4 Data Collection Methods and Instruments.....</b>	<b>25</b>

3.4.1 Interview.....	25
3.4.2 Document Analysis.....	25
3.4.3 Observation.....	25
3.5 Methods of Data Analysis.....	26
3.6 Reliability and validity.....	26
3.7 Ethical Considerations.....	27
<b>CHAPTER FOUR.....</b>	<b>28</b>
<b>Results and Discussion</b>	
4.1 General information about the participants.....	28
4.2 The project management process practiced by the study Banks.....	29
4.3 Selection of project managers and availability of dedicated project offices.....	32
4.4 Quality management plan, standard and quality management process communication.....	32
4.5 Turn a key project management and the role of the top management.....	33
4.6 Discussion of Results.....	35
<b>CHAPTER FIVE.....</b>	<b>37</b>
<b>Summary and Conclusion</b>	
5.1 Introduction.....	37
5.2 Summary and Conclusion.....	37
5.3 Recommendations.....	38
5.4 Future Area of Research.....	39
<b>REFERENCES.....</b>	<b>40</b>
<b>APPENDIX.....</b>	<b>45</b>



## **Acronyms and Abbreviations**

PMI	Project Management Institute
PMBOK	Project Management Body of Knowledge
ISHOPA	Imperial Saving and Home Ownership Association
EPRDF	Ethiopian People's Revolutionary Democratic Front
EQA	Ethiopian Quality Award
PBS	Product Breakdown Structure
PMO	Project Management Office
RMO	Result Management Office
RFP	Request for Proposal
TOR	Term of Reference
OIB	Oromia International Bank
CEO	Chief Executive Officer
IT	Information Technology

# CHAPTER ONE

## INTRODUCTION

### 1.1 Background of the study

According to (PMI, 2017), a project is a temporary endeavor undertaken to create a unique product, service, or result. Projects are undertaken to fulfill objectives by producing deliverables. Fulfillment of project objectives produces one or more of the following deliverables: a unique product, a unique service or a capability to perform a service, a unique result and a unique combination of one or more products, services, or results.

Projects grow out of problems or opportunities. Banks create a lot of opportunities from the competition they are in, and also from problems which arise during the delivery of their existing services. Because of that, banks highly rely on projects. Nowadays banks turn their main focus to their customers and craft customer-based service delivery strategies. Hence, banks work hard to attract many customers. Since almost all the services given by those organizations are similar, the quality of those services will be serving as a jackpot to win the completion among them and lets them attract more customers. Since financial services, particularly banks, compete in the marketplace with generally undifferentiated products, service quality becomes a primary competitive weapon (Stafford, 1996).

Banks should deliver services with quality that meets, even exceeds beyond, their customer's expectation. Quality is of a product or service free of deficiencies or the characteristics of a product or service that satisfies customer needs (Asim & Zaki, 2012). Mikiyas (2018), concludes that project execution does influence the quality performance of projects by showing the relationship between project execution and quality performance, which is a high correlation coefficient of 0.81. So that project should be managed well before their closure to produce quality products or services from them. "The customer, or the recipient of the project's deliverables, expects a certain level of functionality and quality from the project"

Robert (2003). To deliver products or services with a quality of customer's expectation, there should be a proper and continuous project quality management throughout all the phases of the project life cycle. According to Gartner (2017), Project Life cycle has four phases named as initiating, planning, execution and closing.

FREZEWD (2016) also states that "In the case of our country, lots of different projects are undertaking. It is also common to observe these projects achieving their objective or else see those facing difficulty in the meeting schedule, cost and quality set at the beginning."

According to PMI (2017), Project Quality Management includes the processes for incorporating the organization's quality policy regarding planning, managing, and controlling project and product quality requirements in order to meet stakeholder's objective. Project Quality management also supports continuous process improvement activities as undertaken on behalf of the performing organization. The project quality management processes are: plan quality management, manage quality, and control quality.

Almost all the services in financial sectors like banks are implemented as a project, and if appropriate quality management process is not applied to those projects it will be very difficult, even impossible, to produce services with the desired quality from those projects. "A sound quality management program with processes in place that monitor the work in a project is a good investment. Not only does it contribute to client satisfaction, but it helps organizations use their resources more effectively and efficiently by reducing waste and revisions. Quality management is one area that should not be compromised. Since project quality management will plays a great role, the purpose of this study is to assess the project Quality Management Culture in selected private banks of Ethiopia.

## **1.2 Background of the organization**

Monetary and Banking proclamation of 1994 established the national bank of Ethiopia as a judicial entity, separated from the government and outlined its main function. Monetary and Banking Proclamation No.83/1994 and the Licensing and Supervision of Banking Business No.84/1994 laid down the legal basis for investment in the banking sector. Currently, private commercial banks in Ethiopia reached to sixteen. Among them Awash, Dashen and United banks are well known and giant private banks in Ethiopia. Awash Bank was established by 486 founding shareholders with a paid-up capital of birr 24.2 million and started operation on Feb 13, 1995. Dashen Bank was founded by eleven visionary shareholders with a paid up capital of birr 14.9 million in Sep. 1995 and opened its door for services on Jan. 1, 1996 and United Bank was incorporated as a share company on Sep. 10, 1998.

## **1.3 Statement of the problem**

In the world of competition, service quality is the most important parameter that needs critical attention for an organization to exceed its competitors. Banks in Ethiopia are in tough competition more than ever before. In winning this competition, those banks have to increase the number of services given and undertake projects to implement those services. Services given by those sectors should be increased not only by their numbers but also their quality as well. “Higher product quality is required for a company to become more competitive, both locally and in international trade improved quality at the enterprise level lowers its cost of operations and increases its productivity. The firm’s ability to produce better products at a reduced (or even the same) price boosts its market share” (Daniel & Fasika, 2003). Daniel & Fasika (2003) also state that quality is the extent to which the customer or users believe the product or service surpasses their needs and expectations.

Increasing the number and quality of service they are giving let banks not only to retain their existing customers but also lets them attract new ones. Montes, *el al.* (2003) state that customers now look for financial institutions that best meet their expectations. Few barriers prevent mobility between financial institutions, so customers may easily change from one to

another, should these institutions not provide competitive services. Financial institutions offer new products in order to satisfy these expectations in a different way from their competitors, with greater service quality and attempts to increase loyalty amongst their customers. Customer satisfaction depends on the product or service supplied by an organization which meets customer expectation. By measuring service quality and customer satisfaction organizations can determine how successful they are in terms of the services to their customers (Netsanet, 2017).

Service quality is particularly essential in the banking services context because it provides a high level of customer satisfaction, and hence it becomes a key to competitive advantage (Almossawi, 2001). Unsatisfactory customer service leads to a drop in customer satisfaction and willingness to recommend the service to a friend (Levesque & McDougall, 1996). Therefore, banks should give special attention to increasing the quality of their services to increase their customer satisfaction and take competitive advantage on their competitors.

Quality must be recognized, from the point of importance, at the same level as the scope of the project, time and costs. If the stakeholders are not satisfied with the quality of project management or the results of the project, the project team should commit scope change, time extensions and additional cost to satisfy the stakeholders' need and expectation (Rahel, 2017). Proper project management needs to balance all the three project constraints: time, budget and quality. It is easier to measure and manage budget and time but quality. Poor quality management is the main cause of the failure of many projects. Stojcetovic, *et al.*, (2014) state that there are many examples in practice that projects were delivered on time and within budget but failed to meet the expectations of end-users.

Though service quality has a great role in winning the competition between banks, banks have seen to fail to deliver their services with the quality that satisfies their customers. For instance, Asrat (2017) checks the significant difference between customer's expectation and perception of service quality dimensions (Reliability, Responsiveness, Security, Empathy, and Tangibility) of United Bank S.C. Asrat (2017) states that the bank has failed to meet its

customer's expectation in all the service quality dimensions. In other words, the customer's expectation of Online Banking service quality has exceeded their perceived service quality (Asrat, 2017). And Girma (2015) also concludes in his research that, since the bank service quality measurement showed negative disconfirmation in all of the service quality dimensions, one can conclude that Oromia International Bank is not providing quality services to its clients.

In Ethiopia, there is poor quality management practice and it is one of the areas that need greater attention. "Through analyses of the EQA self-assessment report evaluation, generally, quality management practice in Ethiopia was found to be low in all the tenets including leadership, policy and strategy, resources management, process management, customer satisfaction, business performance and impact on society" (Birhanu & Daniel, 2013). Since service is difficult to control and measure so is its quality. Birhanu and Daniel (2013) also state that quality management practice in service industries is weaker when it is compared to manufacturing industries.

Daniel and Fasika (2003), Haben (2008), Netsanet (2008), Mesafint (2008), Birhan (2008), Tessema (2008), Dagne (2009), Yitagesu (2009), Amanuale (2009), Asrat (2011) Negalign (2011), Wondifrawu (2010) and some other researches have done researches on quality management practice in manufacturing industries, and some researches like Rahel (2017), Samson (2008), Alenewu (2010) are also have done researches on the quality management of construction projects. All those researchers are focused only on the quality of service which is after the project completion. But, it is obvious that proper quality management is necessary before the completion of the project and it is implemented to start giving service to the customer. "Quality on projects should start at the establishment phase, by establishing the correct project brief and scope and it flows through all phases of the project up to project approval and project closeout. Quality management is not an event it is a process, a consistently high quality product or service cannot be produced by a detective process. Quality management is a repetitive cycle of measuring quality, updating quality until the desired quality is achieved. Investing and adapting to new technologies is the major concern

for the banks, due to this fact, there is no much strict rule and regulation regarding project quality. As long as the project output is what the banks demands the projects are tolerated in some level of quality. As per the preliminary assessment, there is a gap in project quality management in private banks of Ethiopia. So, this research will fill the gap by studying the project quality management culture in selected private banks of Ethiopia. It also will try to find problems related to that area and put possible recommendations for those problems.

## **1.4 Research Questions**

The study was conducted with the main aim of assessing the Project Quality Management Culture in selected private banks of Ethiopia. The study has attempted to answer the following questions:

- How do project quality management practices look like in these three selected private banks?
- To what extent do those private bank project management offices practices project quality management principles?
- What documented quality standards, control and assurance system involved in their quality management system?
- What were the sources of quality problem?

## **1.5 Research Objectives**

### **1.5.1 General Objective**

The general objective of the study is to assess the quality management practice in selected private banks of Ethiopia by exploring the practices and processes which is performed and to provide direction and action items as a recommendation for the gaps which is found in those practices.

### **1.5.2 Specific Objectives**

To meet the general objective, the following specific objectives are set:

- ✓ To assess the general practices of project quality management in those selected private banks.
- ✓ To investigate project quality management principles are applied in their quality management system.
- ✓ To assess policy and procedure to govern the project quality management system.
- ✓ To identify sources of quality problems in those private banks.

### **1.6 Significance of the study**

This research plays a great role by filling the knowledge gap around the Project Quality management culture of private banks. It is believed to provide insight and knowledge about Project Management Culture, especially Project Quality Management. In general, this study has the following significance:

- ✓ Assess the project quality management practice in private banks of Ethiopia.
- ✓ Indicate higher officials about gaps in their project quality management practice to take corrective action.
- ✓ Create awareness on project quality management practice in private banks and make them give appropriate attention to it.

### **1.7 Scope of the study**

Due to time and budget constraints the study was limited to the extent of assessing project quality management cultures in only three bank out of sixteen private banks in Ethiopia. This study clearly explained the project quality management culture in those private banks and list out possible problems around their project quality management culture with their possible recommendations.



## **1.8 Limitations of the study**

The main limitations or challenge of this research is on availability of adequate past project documents, project manager decision and meeting minutes that are related to project quality. In addition analyzing the project quality performance of projects in high employee turnover environment creates unavailability of project team members for interviews and discussion.

## **1.9 Organization of the study**

The thesis is organized with five chapters. Chapter one introduces the background of the study which describes what Project Quality Management is from general and banking industry. This chapter also presents the statement of the problem, and the objective and questions of the study. Chapter two introduces the part where literature related to the topic are reviewed and presented for further description of the research area to understand the study clearly. Chapter three presents research design and methodology which includes general insight on the existing research methods, what research method was employed in this thesis and why? Data collection techniques and data analysis methods are stated clearly in this chapter. Chapter four of the study is a part where data (collected through questionnaire, interview, and document analysis) are analyzed and presented. And the findings from the analysis are discussed and interpreted then summarization is made as related to the research problems statement. The fifth and the final chapter summarize the study and makes conclusion based on the findings. The recommendation of the study and areas for further research are also presented. At the end of the research report, references used are listed and appendices are also attached.

## **CHAPTER TWO**

### **LITERATURE REVIEW**

This chapter is to create a concrete knowledge in the research area. It has two sections theoretical and Empirical. Theoretical review tries to explain those theoretical knowledge's and the empirical literature review explains the area from actual research papers.

#### **2.1 Theoretical Literature Review**

The aim of the literature review is to demonstrate primary and secondary research skills; to show that the researcher understands the research subject; has studied existing works in relation to the research objectives, design and methodology (Hart, 1998).

##### **2.1.1 Project and project management**

###### **2.1.1.1 Project**

A project is a temporary endeavor undertaken to create a unique product, service, or result. According to PMI Guide (2017), the fulfillment of project objectives may produce a unique product that can be either a component of another item, an enhancement or correction to an item, or a new end item in itself, unique service or a capability to perform a service, a unique result, such as an outcome or document, a unique combination of one or more products, services, or results.

A project is a one-time task constrained by time, cost, and quality, and its success depends on how well these constraints are balanced Stojčetočić, et al. (2014).

### **2.1.1.2 Project management**

Project management is defined by different authors through time. Breyfogle, (2003) stated that Project management is the management, allocation and timely use of resources for the purpose of achieving a specific goal. PMI (2017) Project management is a discipline which is concerned on maximizing project quality within its defined budget and schedule. Project management is the application of knowledge, skills, tools, and techniques to project activities to meet the project requirements. PMI (2017) also states that project management enables organizations to execute projects effectively and efficiently. Poorly managed projects or the absence of project management may result in missed deadlines, cost overruns, poor quality, rework, uncontrolled expansion of the project, loss of reputation for the organization, unsatisfied stakeholders, and failure in achieving the objectives for which the project was undertaken. A Project Management Process Group is a logical grouping of project management processes to achieve specific project objectives. Process Groups are independent of project phases. Project management processes are grouped into five Project Management Process Groups: Initiating Process Group, Planning Process Group, Executing Process Group, Monitoring and Controlling Process Group, Closing Process Group.

**Initiating Process Group:** Those processes performed to define a new project or a new phase of an existing project by obtaining authorization to start the project or phase.

**Planning Process Group:** Those processes required to establish the scope of the project, refine the objectives, and define the course of action required to attain the objectives that the project was undertaken to achieve.

**Executing Process Group:** Those processes performed to complete the work defined in the project management plan to satisfy the project requirements.

**Monitoring and Controlling Process Group:** Those processes required to track, review, and regulate the progress and performance of the project; identify any areas in which changes to the plan are required, and initiate the corresponding changes.

**Closing Process Group:** Those processes performed to formally complete or close the project, phase, or contract.

## 2.1.2 Project management body of knowledge

Project management is regulated by professional bodies. One such body is the PMI. The PMI has published a knowledge guide known as the PMBOK Guide. PMI (2017) defines a knowledge area as an identified area of project management defined by its knowledge requirements and described in terms of its component processes, practices, inputs, outputs, tools, and techniques. Although the Knowledge Areas are interrelated, they are defined separately from the project management perspective. The ten Knowledge Areas identified in PMI (2017) and described as below:

**Project Integration Management:** Includes the processes and activities to identify, define, combine, unify, and coordinate the various processes and project management activities within the Project Management Process Groups.

**Project Scope Management:** Includes the processes required to ensure the project includes all the work required, and only the work required, to complete the project successfully.

**Project Schedule Management:** Includes the processes required to manage the timely completion of the project.

**Project Cost Management:** Includes the processes involved in planning, estimating, budgeting, financing, funding, managing, and controlling costs so the project can be completed within the approved budget.

**Project Quality Management:** Includes the processes for incorporating the organization's quality policy regarding planning, managing, and controlling project and product quality requirements, in order to meet stakeholders' expectations.

**Project Resource Management:** Includes the processes to identify, acquire, and manage the resources needed for the successful completion of the project.

**Project Communications Management:** Includes the processes required to ensure timely and appropriate planning, collection, creation, distribution, storage, retrieval, management, control, monitoring, and ultimate disposition of project information.

**Project Risk Management:** Includes the processes of conducting risk management planning, identification, analysis, response planning, response implementation, and monitoring risk on a project.

**Project Procurement Management:** Includes the processes necessary to purchase or acquire products, services, or results needed from outside the project team.

**Project Stakeholder Management:** Includes the processes required to identify the people, groups, or organizations that could impact or be impacted by the project, to analyze stakeholder expectations and their impact on the project, and to develop appropriate management strategies for effectively engaging stakeholders in project decisions and execution.

### **2.1.3 Quality**

The ISO 9000 definition for quality is “the totality of feature and characteristics of a product or service that bears on its ability to satisfy stated or implied needs.” Kerzner (2009) states that terms such as fitness for use, customer satisfaction, and zero defects are goals rather than definitions. Most organizations view quality more as a process than a product. To be more specific, it is a continuously improving process where lessons learned are used to enhance future products and services in order to: retain existing customers, win back lost customers, win new customers.

Meri (2008) states that quality is not only the quality of the finished product but also the approach. This means proper quality control should be applied in the production phase before the products/services are finished and join the market.

### **2.1.4 Project Quality**

Turner (2009) states that it is popular to say a project is successful if it is finished on time, to cost, and to quality. We all understand how we measure cost and time, but very few people understand what they mean by the good quality in the context of a project. According to Turner (2009), the project is said to be good quality if the project’s output, the new asset

- Meets the specification
- Is fit for purpose
- Meets the customer’s requirements
- Satisfies the customer

**Meets the Specification:** The facility is produced in accordance with the written requirements laid down for it. The requirements can be specified on several levels, mapping onto levels of product breakdown structure (PBS): customer, functional, system, and detail requirements.

**Is Fit for Purpose:** The facility, when commissioned, produces a product which solves the problem, or exploits the opportunity intended, or better. It works for the purpose for which it was intended and produces the desired outcome.

**Meets the Customer's Requirements:** The facility meets the requirements the customer had of it. Here we mean what the customer thinks they require, the thoughts they had, not the way they vocalized their thoughts as words, and not the way those words got written down as a customer requirements specification.

**Satisfies the Customer:** Customer satisfaction is a measure of how products and services supplied by a company meet or surpass customer expectation. The facility and the product it produces to make the customer feel satisfied. Now there is also a difference between satisfying the customer, "that's alright then," and delighting the customer, "that's wonderful." Satisfaction is the consumer's fulfilment response. It is a judgment that a product or service feature, or the product or service itself, provided (or is providing) a pleasurable level of consumption-related fulfilment, including levels of under or over-fulfilment (Oliver 2010). Zeithaml and Bitner (2000) defined customer satisfaction as the customers' evaluation of a product or service in terms of whether that product or service has met their needs and expectations.

## **2.1.5 PROJECT QUALITY MANAGEMENT**

Quality is one of the constraints that define project success. The project manager has the ultimate responsibility for quality management on the project. Quality management has equal priority with cost and schedule management Kerzner (2009). Very often project managers try to maximize project quality within a given deadline and budget (*Stojčeto*vić, *et al.* 2014). Rose (2014) explains that the quality of the project itself highly affects the quality of the product/process from that project. He also mentions that project managers routinely make

trade-offs among other constraints: time, cost and scope to meet project objective, but a project manager should never, never, ever trade-off quality during project implementation.

Project Quality Management addresses the management of the project and the deliverables of the project. It applies to all projects, regardless of the nature of their deliverables. Quality measures and techniques are specific to the type of deliverables being produced by the project PMBOK Guide (PMI, 2017).

According to “five-element model for managing quality on projects” of Turner (2009), there are two elements represent what we must manage the quality of (the product and the management processes), Two represent how we manage their quality (through quality assurance and quality control), and the fifth represents the attitudes of the people involved.

**Quality of the product:** is the ultimate goal. It is the product which satisfies all the criteria and which influences attitudes years after the project is finished.

**Quality of the management processes:** is also a significant contributor to the quality of the project’s product. Following well-defined, previously proven successful ways of doing things increase the chance of success. Designing new project management processes at the start of every project increases the chance of failure. We shall see below, that this means developing procedures for the organization to be used as flexible guidelines, not rigid rules.

**Quality assurance:** is preventative medicine, steps taken to increase the likelihood of obtaining a good-quality product and management processes. It is about trying to get it “*right first time*”.

**Quality control:** is curative medicine, which recognizes human fallibility and takes steps to ensure that any (hopefully small) variations from the standard which do occur are eliminated. This is about trying to get it *right every time*, with *zero defects*.

**Good attitude:** is essential to successful project management. The commitment to quality must be at all levels of the organization; it cannot be delegated downwards or pushed upwards.

Project Quality Management includes the processes for incorporating the organization's quality policy regarding planning, managing, and controlling project and product quality requirements in order to meet stakeholders' objectives. Project Quality Management also supports continuous process improvement activities as undertaken on behalf of the performing organization (PMI, 2017). PMI (2017) also explains the Project Quality Management processes as below:

- **Plan Quality Management:** The process of identifying quality requirements and/or standards for the project and its deliverables, and documenting how the project will demonstrate compliance with quality requirements and/ or standards.
- **Manage Quality:** The process of translating the quality management plan into executable quality activities that incorporate the organization's quality policies into the project.
- **Control Quality:** The process of monitoring and recording the results of executing the quality management activities to assess performance and ensure the project outputs are complete, correct, and meet customer expectations.

### **2.1.5.1 Plan Quality Management**

Plan Quality Management is the process of identifying quality requirements and/or standards for the project and its deliverables, and documenting how the project will demonstrate compliance with quality requirements and/or standards. The key benefit of this process is that it provides guidance and direction on how quality will be managed and verified throughout the project. This process is performed once or at predefined points in the project (PMI, 2017).

PMI (2017) also states that Quality planning should be performed in parallel with the other planning processes. For example, changes proposed in the deliverables in order to meet



identified quality standards may require cost or schedule adjustments and detailed risk analysis of the impact of plans.

Project quality planning begins with a determination of customer satisfaction standards and tradeoff values. If the project sponsor, manager, and core team fully understand these two customer desires, the chances of completing a high-quality project are much greater (Kloppenborg & Petrick, 2002).

Project quality planning is a structured process for developing products that ensure customer needs are met with the final result. The tools and methods of quality planning are incorporated along with the technological tools for the particular product being developed and delivered (Juran, 1999)

### **2.1.5.2 Managing Quality**

Manage Quality is the process of translating the quality management plan into executable quality activities that incorporate the organization's quality policies into the project. The key benefits of this process are that it increases the probability of meeting the quality objectives as well as identifying ineffective processes and causes of poor quality. Manage Quality uses the data and results from the control quality process to reflect the overall quality status of the project to the stakeholders. This process is performed throughout the project (PMI, 2017).

Manage Quality is sometimes called quality assurance, although Manage Quality has a broader definition than quality assurance as it is used in non-project work. In project management, the focus of quality assurance is on the processes used in the project. Quality assurance is about using project processes effectively. It involves following and meeting standards to assure stakeholders that the final product will meet their needs, expectations, and requirements. Manage Quality includes all the quality assurance activities and is also concerned with the product design aspects and process improvements (PMI, 2017).

Project quality assurance includes improving the management of external and internal customer satisfaction expectations. These are ongoing activities that occur throughout the entire project quality assurance stage of the project. Improving the satisfaction of external customers contributes to bottom-line profitability by generating repeat business and positive referrals. Improving the satisfaction of internal customers increases operational efficiency, accelerates the pace of organizational learning, and supports meaningful teamwork (Kloppenborg & Petrick, 2002).

### **2.1.5.3 Controlling Quality**

Control Quality is the process of monitoring and recording results of executing the quality management activities in order to assess performance and ensure the project outputs are complete, correct, and meet customer expectations. The key benefit of this process is verifying those project deliverables and work meet the requirements specified by key stakeholders for final acceptance. The Control Quality process determines if the project outputs do what they were intended to do. Those outputs need to comply with all applicable standards, requirements, regulations, and specifications. This process is performed throughout the project (PMI, 2017).

The Control Quality process is performed to measure the completeness, compliance, and fitness for use of a product or service prior to user acceptance and final delivery. This is done by measuring all steps, attributes, and variables used to verify conformance or compliance to the specifications stated during the planning stage. Quality control should be performed throughout the project to formally demonstrate, with reliable data, that the sponsor's and/or customer's acceptance criteria have been met (PMI, 2017).

The range of quality control includes both product results, such as deliverables, and project management results, such as budgeted cost and schedule deadlines. To ensure customer satisfaction, the project quality control stage entails prevention, inspection, and testing at three points: at the receipt of incoming project resources, during the project creating/delivery process, upon completion of project production (Kloppenborg & Petrick, 2002).

Quality control as defined by Juran (1999) is a universal managerial process for conducting operations to provide stability – to prevent adverse change and to “maintain the status quo.” To maintain stability, the quality control process evaluates actual performance, compares actual performance to goals, and act on the difference. Quality control is one of the three basic managerial processes through which quality can be managed (Juran, 1999).

### **2.1.6 Benefits of quality**

As Rose (2014) explains, the benefits of quality in project performance are many. First, a quality project and product will yield customer satisfaction. This will benefit both the contractor and the client. The client will be benefited from the quality service he gets. And the contractor itself will be benefited by building his reputation which lets him get another project form the client and also attract other clients. Reduced cost is the other benefit. The quality process can eliminate rework, reduce waste, improve efficiency, and improve supplies; all those might make the project cost less than planned. Finally, better products, better project performance, and lower costs translate directly into increased competitiveness in an ever-more-global marketplace.

### **2.1.7 Roles of top management in Project quality management**

Juran(1999) states that it is difficult to attain quality leadership without the top manager carrying out the following non-delegable roles.

- ✓ Serve on the quality council: this will help to get more attention and priorities to the rest of the organization.
- ✓ Acquire training in managing for quality: Top managers risk losing credibility if they try to lead while lacking training in managing for quality.
- ✓ Approve the quality vision and policies
- ✓ Approve the major quality goals: The quality goals that enter the business plan must be deployed to lower levels to identify the deeds to be done and the resources needed. The upper managers become essential parties to the deployment process.

- ✓ Establish the infrastructure.
- ✓ Provide resources: Availing necessary recourses with proper time and quality have a great impact on project quality. The top management has a greater role in this process.
- ✓ Review progress: A major shortcoming in personal participation by upper managers has been the failure to maintain a regular review of progress in making quality improvements. Without regular and proper progress review form top management project quality management will be very difficult.
- ✓ Give recognition: Recognition usually involves ceremonial events that offer highly visible opportunities for upper managers to show their support for quality improvement. This recognition giving process will make all the project teams to motivate and increase motivation in their work.
- ✓ Revise the reward system.
- ✓ Serve on project teams: when top managements serve on the project team they will give more attention to the project and their understanding of the project will be increased.
- ✓ Face up to employee apprehensions.

## **2.2 Empirical Literature Review**

Here in this part, related original research papers, articles and journals which are based on experience and observation, rather than on systematic logic will be discussed.

### **2.2.1 Quality**

According to Juran (1999), qualities are those features of products which meet customer needs and thereby provide customer satisfaction. The purpose of such higher quality is to provide greater customer satisfaction. However, providing more or better quality features usually depends on the quality management process of projects which are performed to deploy those services. Product manufacturers can adjust their machinery and inputs until everything is perfect, but it is a different story when it is for service. Service quality will always vary depending on the interaction between employees and customers (Kotler & Armstrong, 2012).

The word quality is not used in absolute terms. It is a relative term which differs from person to person, country to country, and time to time. With such variations, it is difficult to provide good or excellent quality at all times, and for everyone. The life span of an organization in the open market is usually proportional to the time in which it can maintain the quality of its products and as services a good or excellent (Asim & Zaki, 2012). Asim and Zaki also state that Quality is of a product or service free of deficiencies or the characteristics of a product or service that satisfies customer needs. Quality products usually possess three characteristics: reliability, serviceability and durability. Quality service means reliability, tangibles, responsiveness, assurance, and empathy.

### **2.2.2 Quality in Financial Institution**

Customers now look for the financial institutions that best meet their expectations. Few barriers prevent mobility between financial institutions, so customers may easily change from one to another, should these institutions not provide competitive services. Financial institutions offer new products in order to satisfy these expectations in a different way from their competitors, with greater service quality and attempt to increase loyalty amongst their customers (Montes *et al.* 2003). Financial institutions are highly dependent on their customer. Therefore, they should give great attention to manage them. In doing so, those institutions categorize in many parameters and work on different attributes of their customers. One of those attributes is the loyalty of those customers. Customer loyalty needs hard work and serious management since it needs a long term experience of satisfaction and confidence of the customer. Service quality is an important antecedent of customer satisfaction, (Zeithaml & Bitner, 2003; Andaleeb & Conway, 2006). Hackl and Westlund (2000) stated that customer satisfaction is a key element for customer retention and loyalty and assist and accelerates the organization performance. Service quality, therefore, has a great impact on customer loyalty since it highly affects customer satisfaction. The quality of services offered by a company determines customer satisfaction and long term loyalty (Naik, *et al.* 2010).

Financial Institutions should manage their service quality properly. Service quality is critical particularly for the growth and development of service sector business enterprises (Juran, 1999). Service delivering institutions deliver almost the same kind of services. For instance, most of the services in all the banks are all the same. Parameters of those services will play the winning role for those banks. One of those parameters is quality. The deliverance of quality services to customers is the competitive advantages of any service giving companies, Parasuraman, et al. (1985). Zerihun (2017) states that project quality management enhances competitiveness with other parameters by showing that there is a significant positive correlation between competitive advantage and project quality management with 0.391.

### **2.2.3 Project quality management**

Lack of project management and lack of quality management are major causes of software projects fail, states Mullualem (2014). Projects can be successfully completed only with focused attention on goals by the project team members, projects act as a means for consolidating the experience and expertise of the organizational members effectively, create a learning environment, encourage-team spirit and help to achieve organizational objectives. Based on these characteristics, it would seem that project management, if introduced properly, would fill a natural need in the developing countries for a better and more economical way of managing their ever-growing number of projects (Asare & Adams, 2017).

According to Stuckenbruck (1981), Project management has the following advantages: It is a way of effectively identifying the most critical and urgent needs and for applying the best priorities. It is also a way of getting people to work effectively together. Efficiently using scarce resources, and for effectively allocating them where they are most urgently needed. Effective utilization of scarce skilled personnel, as well as raw materials and expensive equipment, is extremely important in all developing countries. It is results-oriented and discourages the possibility of projects becoming a part of their bureaucratic institution. Project management lets you to obtain results faster and more efficiently (usually cheaper). It increases the probability of completing the project on time and within budget. It is a way of increasing the efficiency and effectiveness of government bureaucracies. It can cause some

agencies to learn some lessons from the implementation of the projects, and possibly incorporate some of the techniques into their system. Completing the projects on time and within budget (fulfilling the promises) will give people more trust and confidence in their government, and will encourage the system to be more responsive to public needs and expectations.

According to Kousouris (2009) quality management, quality concepts and maturity models are keys to understanding and managing quality projects and producing quality projects outcomes. The financial services industry ought to follow quality processes in order to satisfy customers.

## **CHAPTER THREE**

### **RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY**

This part discusses the research design, sampling technique, sources, tools and procedures of data collection and method of data analysis for the study.

#### **3.1 Research Design**

According to Saunders, Lewis and Thornhill (2009) research design is the general plan of how the researcher will go about answering the research questions. It contains clear objectives, derived from the research question(s), specifies the sources from which the researcher intends to collect data, and consider the constraints that will inevitably have as well as discussing ethical issues.

In light of the objectives, this study preferred and employed the research design which is exploratory. This is because it is flexible enough to provide an opportunity for considering all aspects of the problem in their project management culture and defines the problem correctly. Qualitative research approach, which can be set aside with exploratory research design, is used. Data collection methods and instruments are selected that are appropriate for exploratory research design. Population and sampling are performed in accordance with the data collection instruments. Data from those data collection instruments analyzed with the methods appropriate for those instruments. After analysis, the result is summarized; concluded and possible recommendations are made qualitatively.

#### **3.2 Research Approach**

The study has used qualitative research approach which is suitable for its exploratory nature. This enables the researcher to provide rich description and depth understanding about gaps in their quality management system and build larger knowledge claims about the culture.



## **3.3 Total Population and the Sampling Technique**

### **3.3.1 Population**

Castillo (2009) defines target population as, referring to the entire group of individuals or objects to which researchers are interested in generalizing the conclusions. For this research, the target populations are projects that are implemented under project management office in those selected private banks. To get information regarding their project quality management practices, project management office staffs that were participated in two or more completed projects are considered as population. According to their offices, the number of staffs who were working in these three banks project management Offices in the past five years reached around six hundred fort-nine. Many of these staffs transferred to the functional unit with the project they were working. Some of them are assigned to other projects and continue working in the offices. Currently the numbers of staffs who are working under these offices are fifty two.

### **3.3.2 Sampling Technique**

From all those private banks only three are selected by convenience or opportunistic sampling. In convenience or opportunistic sampling, samples are selected because they are convenient, easy, and relatively inexpensive to access. These three banks have a well-organized dedicated project management office with readily available participants and the researcher believe that the data gathered from those banks fit the parameters of the project's research questions, goals, and purpose.

Purposive sampling technique is employed to select staffs for an interview since the interviewees were selected based on their specialized insight or special perspective, experience, characteristic, or condition when there is something the researcher wishes to get and understand. And participants were project managers, team leaders and project team members who have more than three years of experience in the project management office and who have completed more than two projects and they are seven in numbers. Four of the

selected interviewees are project managers of dedicated project management office, the other two are team leaders and the remaining interviewee is RMO manager.

### **3.4 Data Collection Methods and Instruments**

Generally, two types of instruments namely: Interview and Document Analysis were used for the data collection. The primary data was collected through interview and document analysis was used as secondary data collection instrument. In addition to those instruments, the researcher has used his observation to fill the gap and strengthen the assessment.

#### **3.4.1 Interview**

It is important to interview right people who have rich knowledge about the studied phenomenon; otherwise, there is a risk that the interviews not fulfill the purpose of the thesis. In-depth interviews with project managers, team leaders and person related to project management are made. The interview was aimed to get the interviews perception and deep understanding about practices on their quality management system and it was made using Semi-structured open ended questions.

#### **3.4.2 Document Analysis**

Document analyses are made to get secondary data. Both company documents and external documents are analyzed. Company documents such as project charter, quality reports and inspection certificates and other related documents gave empirical data about the facts in their quality system and the external document which is written in the area helps to get subject matter knowledge.

#### **3.4.3 Observation**

Observation helps to learn about behaviors in the natural setting and also to learn about cultural aspects of settings or contexts. The researcher also observes related issued in the company such as the companies project quality management culture, the quality of service given by the company, customer satisfaction and the like.

### **3.5 Methods of Data Analysis**

The analysis anchored to the statement of the problem, research objective and research questions. In order to analyze and interpret the collected data, the qualitative analysis method is employed. Data gather using the above instruments are coded after that analytic and axial or hierarchical coding performed to the coded data. Synthesizing and making meaning from codes was done in the last step. MS EXCEL software has been used to facilitate the data analysis process and generate meaning. Finally, analyzed data has been summarized qualitatively using sentences, phrases and words.

### **3.6 Reliability and validity**

In qualitative study frequently the researcher himself is the data-gathering instrument. Thus questions of researcher bias and researcher competency, if unchecked, may influence the trustworthiness of data considerably. Even the validity of the data provided by the subject can be affected by the very presence of the researcher. Due to the presence of the researcher participants may distort certain information. In order to minimize this problem, the researcher has to create social behavior in others that would normally not have occurred. After her extensive fieldwork, Leininger holds that researchers need to be trusted before they will be able to obtain any accurate reliable or credible data (Leininger 1991:92). Since it is difficult to take training as a researcher or interviewer, the researcher will go through extensive readings to prepare the interview questions for qualitative studies which help to decrease the possibilities of introducing bias at various points of the research process.

In order to increase reliability and validity by decreasing biases from a different point in the research process, the researcher has used the following approaches or techniques: Triangulation, taking of repetitive data, checking for representativeness.

### **3.7 Ethical Considerations**

The purpose of the study is to assess project quality management practice and agreement was secured before data collection is launched. All the required confidentiality was maintained. Participants have been also cleared about the intention of the data collected and the information obtained from them would not be disclosed to any party without their willingness. Participants have been also informed that the data collected is used only for academic purpose. To ensure that privacy of the respondent, all identifying information like their name was not used in the study. Participants were asked to take part willingly and responded on their own accord.

## **CHAPTER FOUR**

### **RESULTS AND DISCUSSION**

Chapter three was described and discussed the research design and methodology for which is used for this study. Interview and observation were used as a qualitative data collection method. The researcher reviewed different templates and validated the process of project quality management practice in the company in order to crosscheck and validate the findings by using multiple sources and from the literature review. The interview conducted was in-depth and could enable the researcher to raise different issues for triangulating and crosschecking the validity of the collected data.

The objective of this chapter is to provide the findings and results from the interview and observation conducted by analyzing and interpreting the collected data, which achieved the research objective which is to understand and present the project quality management practice of selected private banks of Ethiopia.

#### **4.1 General information about the participants**

As mentioned in chapter three, in order to keep confidentiality, all the identifying information of the participants is not mentioned. The researcher has used anonymous identifiers P1, P2, P3, P4, P5, P6 and P7 for the interviews selected from Awash, Dashen and United Banks. Since the sampling was purposive sampling all the project managers and persons related to project management in the selected banks are interviewed. Three persons were interviewed from one bank and two persons were interviewed from each of the remaining two banks. Four of the selected interviewees are project managers of dedicated project management office, the other two are team leaders acts as project manager of currently executing project and they have more than 5 years of experience in the company and in those years each of them leads more than 2 projects, and the remaining interviewee is RMO manager, which controls the project management office in one bank.

All the interviews had been recorded and the answers from those interviews were carefully grouped into the questions and summarized and presented separately for each question. The main points related to each question are highlighted and special attention has been given to ideas that were repeated by different respondents. First, the analysis has begun with grouping related questions as one and then the analysis concentrates on the seven main questions that were asked for all the project participants. Grouping related questions facilitate comparisons between the contrasting points of views.

## **4.2 The project management process practiced by the study Banks**

All of the respondents from the three banks have mentioned that they don't have a formal project management process. Projects are managed in a traditional way by using their managerial skill which is developed from their experience. Since the financial industry is highly dependent on Information Technology, all the respondents mention that more than 80% of the projects in their company are IT projects.

P1 from United Bank explains that projects are managed by RMO which is the direct owner of the projects. First, a business case will be crafted which explains why the project is necessary. Strategy office will validate its alignment with the company grand strategy after it is approved by the top management. Now RMO will take the responsibility to perform all the pre-project activities. The team will be selected by RMO to perform RFP preparation by requirement gathering and requirement definition. Once the RFP document is approved by the top management the next step is to perform a bid as per the RFP. The team will be formed by purchasing committee number one to evaluate the bid and select the winner by performing a technical and financial evaluation. RMO then make the project on-board with the bid winner. Now RFP is prepared, the vendor is selected and a proposal is submitted therefore it is time to RMO to establish the project team. After project team formation RMO assigns the respective functional unit to manage the project by providing project charter and project plan. Those functional units will continue to control the project team and monitor

activities as per the agreed plan. They also report their status in scheduled time. There are two committees named as a steering committee and portfolio committee which evaluate the project team performance in terms of time, budget and scope.

P2 Dashen Bank explains that project management starts after once it is selected as a project comes to Enterprise Project office. A task can be done by the respective business unit or by Project office. The criteria to decide that and recognize a task as a project are a budget and variety in the area of expertise it requires. Projects are handled by the dedicated and separate office which is called Enterprise Program Management Office. The office has two wings named project management and change management. The change management wing is responsible to assess and monitor if the project is going in accordance with its plan. The main focus of this wing is the changes in the project. The project management aspect is handled by project management wing. As mentioned before, once the task fulfills the criteria and identified as a project it will be done through an enterprise program office. Vendor selection is the same as P1 and performed by an ad-hoc team which is formed temporarily. PMO will participate as part of that team. Once the vendor is selected the project office will take the response project charter will be prepared. The team will be selected and established by PMO which includes the necessary specialists. Next requirement definition will be performed by the team. Business owners (i.e. client of the project) will approve the requirement document in order to confirm if it includes all the requirements and fulfills their need completely. The vendor now will be provided with the requirement document and start to execute the project as per the requirement document. Training will be provided to the team during the project execution period. When the vendor performs project execution, PMO will provide any necessary resource and facilitate the process. They also evaluate deliverables if they meet the requirement which has been set in the beginning. If the deliverables do not meet the requirement the vendor will be requested to modify them as per the requirement document, but if the deliverables meet the required project will be finalized and closure will take place. Respondent also states that high-level project schedule is included in the charter, and scope is prepared according to the requirement document.

P3 from Awash Bank has got a chances working with two private banks and he states that, as far as my knowledge, project management practice in private banks is poor and it is difficult to say that they follow the appropriate formal procedures to manage their project. Though the banks form some ad-hoc project teams which are accounted for CEO when there are bigger projects in the bank which needs special attention. Those project dedicated teams are under the respective business units or departments. The lifetime of those teams will be until the task is completed. Moreover the key informant states that even though there is a continuous flow of projects in the bank, due to a shortage in the human resource we perform projects in parallel with no dedicated team or project office. Project team members participate in the project while they are in their daily operational task (job). Recently, as the bank is getting bigger, the trend is also getting changed. By leaving the old trend, projects are managed by a separate project office with the dedicated project team. But still the project office is formed temporarily for one specific project and the lifetime of the office will be until the completion of that project.

P3 from Awash Bank confirmed that the current trend of Project management in the bank starts with the preparation of TOR. This TOR will include what the implementation of the project looks like? What is the role of the project office, executive management, Board of directors and different stakeholders of the project? It also includes a high-level schedule and budget for the project. Then the TOR will be sent to the CEO for approval. CEO will discuss it in executive management level and there will also be discussions with managers and directors for confirmation. Once the discussion is done the TOR will be approved by CEO and the project will be started. There is continuous evaluation of the project by the project manager and status reports will be sent to top management including the CEO and board of directors in scheduled time.



### **4.3 The process of selection of project managers and availability of dedicated project management offices.**

During the key informant interview it was learned that In Awash Bank there is dedicated PMO for IT and construction projects. In Dashen Bank there is a dedicated Enterprise Program management office, which acts as Project management office. In United Bank there is RMO which is responsible to manage projects. Moreover they state that even though the trend is changed by leaving the old and managed projects by a separate project office with dedicated project teams still projects are managed by creating ad-hoc teams which are active only until the completion of that specific project. Members for those ad-hoc teams are selected from concerned functional units which have expertise in the business area. Once that specific project is completed the team will be disseminated and join their previous functional unit. In all three banks, project managers are selected regardless of their Project Knowledge formal certification just based on their area expertise and management experience, especially in the project area.

### **4.4 Project quality management plan, standards and quality management process communication in the three Banks**

All respondents say that there is no separate and formal quality management plan, procedure or standard. They manage their quality as per the required criteria in the project plan or project charter. Even for those projects that are implemented by dedicated Project Management Office.

In United and Dashen banks more or less have well-structured and more formalized communication mechanism between the project team and project manager and the project manager and the top management as well. But in Awash Bank there is a weak and less formal communication culture.

During the key informant interview it was learned that in United bank organize regular meetings with the top management, steering committee to discuss about the implementation of

projects. A progress report is presented to the top management there and if there are any questions from the top management will be asked. A progress report is also sent to the top management via E-mail before the meeting. This progress report also includes quality management status report. If there is any quality deviation it will be presented to the top management and justify the reason for the deviation. All the resources which are required to solve the problem are presented to the top management and the top management avails those needed resources. There is also similar approach in Dashen bank except the project manager has a weekly meeting with his project team. Status report from each of the team members presented to him on that meeting, and the team members also raised if they have faced any difficulties.

Key informants were also asked to describe if there are policies and procedures that govern the quality management process. Accordingly, the result confirmed that there is no separate and specific policy and procedure for quality management in all the three banks. As mentioned above in question number three projects quality is managed based on the project charter and the agreement which is made at the beginning of the project.

#### **4.5 Turn a key project management and the role of the top management**

With regard to managing customer expectation, all the three banks perform field assessment via interview and questionnaires and they also have continuous communication with their clients to assess and understand their customers.

Regarding the role of top management in project quality management process, all the three banks mention that even though top management plays a great role in the project quality management as well as the general project management processes, they don't give the appropriate attention and commitment to projects. They don't review status reports on time and they also not give feedbacks for those reports on time. They also miss meetings and that affect the project quality management process and even the overall project management process, which affects the final output of the project.

With respect to quality of turn a key project management, all three banks do not participate in the quality management process of the project until the project is finished. All the project quality management process is handled by the external contractor. They assure the quality of the project when the contractor finishes the project and hands over it to them.

In the three banks the process is the same a counter team from a respective department is established to validate the delivery of the project. Most of the time the projects are not a turn a key type if there is one, it will not be a pure turn a key project, since most of the projects are IT projects they need deep knowledge of the bank's environment. In that case, our team will participate in the project with that contractor.

Regarding the presence of quality matrix in project management, the result revealed that, there is no quality matrix in all three banks. The only criteria of their quality assurance are the functional and non-functional requirements of the projects.

Since they have not a formal and separate project quality management process, the researcher cannot find separate and independent document for the quality management plan and quality metrics, due to the limitation of time the researcher reviewed project charter and project plan of one randomly selected project from all three banks. Their project charters are formal and complete it describes the objective, goal; requirement, business objectives, stakeholders, constraints, assumption, security requirements etc. and they use as a reference throughout the project to ensure the work is meeting stated objectives and resolve project issues. Were as the project plans contains final list of tasks and define how projects activities coordinated, monitored and how the team control their activities but they are not complete it ignores determination of quality policies, setting quality objectives and specifying necessary operational processes and related resources to fulfill the quality objectives.

The researcher observes verified deliverables for the selected projects. As mentioned in the above sections, most of the projects perfumed in those banks are IT related projects and the researcher observes three IT-related projects and one project which is not related to IT. The

researcher observes one project per each bank due to time and labor constraint. And the result of this observation is discussed as follow.

#### **4.6 Discussion of Results**

The findings of the study can be categorized into five major categories, Commitment, Awareness, Skill, Communication, and Process.

As per the respondents, since they are busy with other financial related tasks, top managements don't give enough attention and they are not committed well to projects. To improve project quality management process there should be strong leadership and participation of top management in the quality management process should be increased (Keng, & Hamzah, 2011). This is called "non-delegable role of managers in quality management" by Juran (Juran, 1999). In addition to the top management, there is also a gap in the commitment of project teams because there are not dedicated staffs for the project and most of the time project teams are selected to participate in the project while they are performing their main tasks which are given by the bank.

All the respondents underlined that there is not enough awareness of project management in the bank. As mentioned in chapter two, quality is difficult to measure and it makes the project quality management process even more difficult when the awareness of stakeholders is weaker. All the respondents have mentioned that they don't have enough skill and they have not taken any formal education or training on project management. They are managing those project offices based on their management skills and personal readings. As the study of Massoud and Sayd investigated employee empowerment, training and supplier quality management critical success factors for implementing total quality management. In that case employee training and education contribute have a greater role in quality management process (Massoud & sayd, 2013). The study by Ephantus, Hellen and Joseph conclude that training an employee is a critical factor of quality management. The study further concludes that training has a positive influence on the quality management process. From the above

statement, one can understand that training can enhance the Project Quality Management Process (Ephantus, Hellen & Joseph, 2015).

The result of a study by Teena shows that communication is one of the key factors of the quality management process and the absence of appropriate communication between different stakeholders can affect the quality (Teena, 2014). Similarly, the result of the current study confirmed that adequate and timely feedback from the top management is not given for the reports from the project management.

Project Quality Management also supports continuous process improvement activities as undertaken on behalf of the performing organization (PMI, 2017). PMI also states that project quality management comprises the three project quality management processes, Plan quality management, Manage quality, Control quality. All the respondents mentioned that there is not separate and independent management process for project quality. All the three banks do not have a formal procedure, guideline or standard for their quality management process.

## **CHAPTER FIVE**

### **SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS**

#### **5.1 Introduction**

This is the last chapter of the research and in this chapter; the researcher gives summary and conclusions of the study's findings of the project quality management practice in selected private banks. In the summary and conclusions, the researcher shows gaps of the studied banks in their project quality management practice. Recommendations which improve project quality management practice are also stated.

#### **5.2 Summary and Conclusion**

As per the interview's findings, there is less top management commitment to projects and that makes difficult to accomplish projects with the intended quality. Those top managements in the three selected banks give more attention to the other business-related tasks. They will participate more on the quality control, which is assuring/approving whether the intended project quality is achieved or not. Communication between different stakeholders of the project is good especially between the top management and project manager and the project manager and project team. Having a dedicated Project management Office has a greater effect on project quality management process. There is not a well-established dedicated Project Management Office, especially for those non-IT projects. Formal project management qualification is not considered during project manager selection. Project managers are just selected based on their management skill and area of expertise in the respective area of the project. There is not enough training in on project management; even it becomes none when it is specifically on project quality management. The last but not least there is not a separate Project Quality Management process. It is performed implicitly by embedding it in different tasks of the project which makes the project quality management process difficult to perform and cannot get separate attention.

### **5.3 Recommendation**

The researcher recommends the following points for better and improved project quality management practice in private banks of Ethiopia, which also leads those banks to success and make them a better competitor in the local and international market with quality products and services which are produced from those projects which are passed through the better quality management process.

Enough training about project management and specifically on project quality management should be given to all project stakeholders, especially to the top management and the project manager. In that way, it will be possible to create better awareness about project management around them and make them give attention to project quality management.

Top management should give special attention and have a greater commitment to project management process since it has a greater role in it. As mentioned in chapter two top management commitments plays a great role in project quality management process. Hence, there should be a great commitment and participation of top management in project quality management process.

From chapter two's discussion, quality is one of the major constraints in the iron triangle and it is also difficult to manage, because of that, there should be a separate and independent process of project quality management which comprises the three project quality management processes mentioned in PMBOK, Plan quality management, Manage quality, Control quality. This will make the banks to give it appropriate attention and manage it well. Having a dedicated PMO with its own Separate and permanent project team enables the bank to give appropriate attention to projects. It also helps the banks to have a better lesson learnt mechanism from previous projects. The team members will be only engaged in the project tasks and they will give their best since they don't have any additional tasks in their working office.

Communication is one of the key factors to have a good project quality management process. Banks should have a well-established communication system between different project stakeholders. This will allow the top management and the project manager to know the current status of the project and make any corrective actions when it is necessary. Regarding this especially, awash bank advise to establish well communication system between different project stakeholders. All the project activities should be documented and kept for future reference.

#### **5.4 Future Area of Research**

Future research can be carried out in two areas. The first is determine the possible caused for the mentioned gaps in Project quality management practice of private banks of Ethiopia and the second one is to assess the project quality management practice of governmental banks of Ethiopian.



## References

- Alemnew, A. (2010). Assuring Construction Industries' Development of Ethiopia Through Quality Management: The Case of Expansion of Rural Road Access in Ethiopia. Addis Ababa University. Addis Ababa Ethiopia.
- Almossawi, M., 2001, Bank selection criteria employed by college students in Bahrain: An empirical analysis. *International Journal of Bank Marketing* 19 (3), 115-125.
- Amanuale, T. (2009). Cost of Quality Case Study in Zuqualla Steel Rolling Enterprise. Addis Ababa University. Addis Ababa Ethiopia.
- Andaleeb, S. S., and Conway, C. (2006). Customer satisfaction in the restaurant industry: An examination of the transaction-specific model, *Journal of Services Marketing*, 20(1), 3-11
- Asare, Adams Bediako (2017). Project Management for Developing Countries: Back to Basics. *Dama International Journal of Researchers (DIJR)* 2 (4):05-09.
- Asrat Arega. (2017). Assessing Online Banking Service Quality on Customers Satisfaction: The case of United Bank S.C.
- Asrat, M. (2011). Uses and Applications of Quality Engineering: The Case of Ethiopian Plastic Share Company. Addis Ababa University. Addis Ababa, Ethiopia.
- Birhan, G. (2008). Opportunity and challenges on implementing ISO 9001:2000 Quality Management System in Ethiopian Enterprise. Addis Ababa University. Addis Ababa, Ethiopia.
- Birhanu Beshah and Daniel Kitawu. (2013). Quality Management Practice in Ethiopia. *African Journal of Business Management* 8 (17): 689-699.
- Chris Hart. (1998). *Doiong a Literature Review*. First Edition. New Delhi, India

Chin Keng, Tan & Abdul-Rahman, Hamzah. (2011). Study of Quality Management in Construction Projects. Chinese Business Review. 10. 542-552.

Dagne, B. (2008). Quality Engineering in Ethiopian Pulp and Paper S.C. Addis Ababa University. Addis Ababa Ethiopia.

Daniel Kitawu and Fasika Bete, (2003). Quality Management: Efforts and Problems in Ethiopian Manufacturing Industries, department of Engineering, Addis Ababa University, Journal of EEA.

Dr. Muhammad Asim, Dr. A. R. Zaki, (2012). Assessing the Viability of Quality Management in Organizations - A Retrospective and Prospective Overview with Reference to Pakistan, IOSR Journal of Business and Management (IOSR-JBM).

Eng. Ephantus Ndirangu, Dr. Hellen Mberia & Joseph Oduor, (2015), European Journal of Business and Social Sciences, Vol. 4, No. 03, page 14-28

Eisner, E. W. (1991). The enlightened eye: Qualitative inquiry and the enhancement of educational practice. Toronto: Collier Macmillan Canada.

FASIL ALEMAYEHU AND MERHATBEB TEKLEMEDHIN. (2012) The Birth and Development of Banking Services in Ethiopia. Available at: <https://www.abysinnialaw.com> (accessed 14 April 2021).

Forrest W. Breyfogle III, John Wiley & Sons Inc. (2003) Implementing Six Sigma: Smarter Solutions Using Statistical Methods, Second Edition, Austin, Texas

Francisco Javier Llorens Montes, M.Mar Fuentes-Fuentes and Luis Miguel Molina. (2003) Quality management in banking services: an approach to employee and customer perception.

FREZEWD ALEMU. 2016 PRACTICE OF PROJECT RISK MANAGEMENT IN BATU AND DUKEM TOWN WATER SUPPLY PROJECT.

- Gartner (2017). Product life cycle management. Available at: <https://www.gartner.com> (accessed 18 April 2021).
- GIRMA BERSISA. 2015. Assessment of Service Quality and Its Influence on Customer Satisfaction: The Case of Oromia International Bank SC.
- Haben B (2008). “Quality Award and ISO Quality Management Systems to Promot quality in Ethiopia Manufacturing Industies”, Unpublished M.Sc. Project, Addis Ababa University, Addis Ababa Ethiopia.
- Hackl, P. & Westlund, A.H. (2000). “On structural equation modeling for customer satisfaction measurement, Total Quality Management, 11(4/5/6), pp. S820-S825”.
- Juran, J. M., ed. (1999), Juran’s Quality Handbook, McGraw-Hill, New York.
- Kenneth H. Rose. 2014. Project Quality Management Why, What and How, Second Edition.
- Kerzner, H. (2009). Project management: a systems approach to planning, scheduling, and controlling. 10th ed. Hoboken, N.J.: John Wiley & Sons.
- Konstantinos St.Kousouris. (2009) Project Quality Management Application in the Financial Service Industry. CityUniversity of Seattle.
- Kotler, P. and Armstrong, G. (2012) Principles of Marketing. 14th Edition, Pearson Education Limited, Essex, England.
- Leininger, M. 1991. Culture care, diversity and universality: A theory of nursing. New York: N.L.N.
- Levesque, T. and McDougall, G.H.G. (1996) Determinants of Customer Satisfaction in Retail Banking. International Journal of Bank Marketing, 14, 12-20.
- Massoud M. Arshida & Sayed Omar (2013), Critical success factors for Total Quality Management Implementation with in the Libyan Iron and Steel Co, Proceedings on International conference on Information and Social Sciences Nagoya Japan, September 24-26
- Meri Williams. 2008. The principles of project management, First Edition.

- Mesafint, A. (2008). Quality Management System in Addis Ababa Private Hospitals. Addis Ababa University, Addis Ababa Ethiopia.
- Mesay Sata Shanka Bank Service Quality, Customer Satisfaction and Loyalty in Ethiopian Banking Sector Journal of Business Administration and Management Sciences Research Vol. 1(1), pp. 001-009, December, 2012
- Mikiyas Feyissa. (2018). THE ROLE OF PROJECT LIFE CYCLE MANAGEMENT ON PROJECT SUCCESS – THE CASE OF TOTAL ETHIOPIA S.C.
- Mullualem, T. (2014). Assessment of Major factors that leads to software project failure: A case study of Addis Ababa. Thesis submitted for partial fulfillment of master's degree in information science. Addis Ababa University.
- Naik, C.N.K., Gantasala, S.B., Prabhakar, G.V. (2010) Service Quality (SERVQUAL) and its Effect on Customer Satisfaction in Retailing, European Journal of Social Sciences. 16(2). 231-243
- Negalign, A. (2011). Quality Management Practices: The Case of Harar Brewery Share Company. Addis Ababa University. Addis Ababa Ethiopia.
- NETSANET BIRHANU. 2017. AN ASSESSMENT OF SERVICE QUALITY AND CUSTOMER SATISFACTION: THE CASE OF DASHEN BANK S.C
- Parasuraman, A. Berry, L. and Zeithaml, V.A. (1985), A Conceptual Model of Service Quality and its Implication for Future Research, Journal of Marketing, 49(4), 41-50.
- Rahel Dinku. (2017). Assessment of Project Quality Management Practice: Case Study of Ethiopian Construction Design and Supervision Work Corporation (Ecdswco.)
- Saunders, M., Lewis, P. and Thornhill, A. (2009) Research Methods for Business Students Pearson, New York.
- Stafford, M.R. (1996) Demographic Discriminators of Service Quality in the Banking Industry, Journal of Services Marketing, 10, 6-22.

- Stojcetovic, B. Lazarevic, D. Prilincevic, B. (2014) 'PROJECT MANAGEMENT : COST , TIME AND QUALITY', pp. 345–350.
- Tamara Gvozdenovic, Mirjana Miljanovic, Aleksandar Jegdic, Zeljko Crnogorcic. Bodies Of Knowledge In Project Management And Project Quality Management, International Journal for Quality research
- Teena Joy (2014), A Study on Factor Influencing Quality of Constraction Projects, International Journal of Innovative Research, Vol 3, Issue 5, page 384-387
- Tessema, B. (2008). Quality Related problems in large Ethiopian manufacturing firms: Implications for Competency. South African Journal of Industrial Engineering, South Africa.
- Tracy, S. J. (2013). Qualitative research methods: Collecting evidence, crafting analysis, communicating impact. Hoboken, NJ: Wiley-Blackwell.
- Turner, J.R., 2009. The Handbook of Project-based Management, third ed. McGraw-Hill Publishing, Glasgow.
- Wondifrawu, B. (2010). Management System and Industrial Development the Case of Ethiopia. Addis Ababa University. Addis Ababa, Ethiopia.
- Yegidis, B. L., & Weinbach, R. W. (1996). Research Methods for Social Workers, 2nd Edition, Allyn and Bacon, Boston, Massachusetts.
- Yitagesu, Y. (2009). Statistical Quality Control and Its Discontents. Addis Ababa University. Addis Ababa Ethiopia.
- Zeithaml V.A. and Berry L.L. (1985). Problems and Strategies in Services Marketing, Journal of Marketing, 49, 33-46
- Zerihun Moges. (2017). Assessing the relationship between Project Management Maturity and Competitiveness: The Case of Commercial Bank of Ethiopia. Addis Ababa

# APPENDIXS

## Appendix I: Semi-structured interview Questions

### Good morning/ afternoon/ evening Sir/ Madam

My name is Michael Eshete. I am a graduating student from St.Marry's University, school of graduate studies department of project management. Currently, I am conducting research titled "Assessment of Project Quality Management Practice: In The Case of Awash, Dashen and United Bank" as a partial fulfillment senior essay required for MA degree.

Therefore, the researcher would like to express his deepest gratitude for your cooperation in answering the following interview questions. The very purpose of this research is to assess the practices of project quality management in Awash, Dashen, and United Bank. Targeting to review and evaluate planning, managing and controlling process of the project quality, assessing any gaps and put possible recommendations for them. In addition, the project successfulness will be verified and appraised. This being said, it should be noted that the research mainly depends on the accuracy of your answer. Lastly, the researcher would like to assure you that the data being collected from you will be presented anonymously and kept under strict confidentiality.

1. How the project management process practiced in your company?
2. Is there a dedicated Project Management Office?
3. How are Project Managers selected?
4. Do you have a quality management plan, procedure or standard?
5. How do you communicate your quality management process with different bodies?
6. Is there and policy and procedure to govern the project quality management process?
7. How do you manage your customer expectation?
8. What is the top management role in project quality management process?
9. How do the quality of turn a key projects managed?
10. Is there any quality matrix? What are the criteria for your quality assurance?

11. What are the internal and external stakeholders participate in the project quality management process?
12. Do you have any quality audit process or procedure?
13. Is there any training related to project management, especially on project quality management?
14. What general problems do you face related to Project Quality Management process?