



**ST. MARY'S UNIVERSITY**  
**SCHOOL OF GRADUATE STUDIES**

**QUALITY MANAGEMENT PRACTICES AND CHALLENGES  
IN ADDIS ABABA PRIVATE PRIMARY SCHOOLS: THE CASE  
OF EL-BETHEL AND OLIVE ACADEMY**

**BY**  
**HAIMANOT TEFERA**

**JUNE 2014**

**ADDIS ABABA, ETHIOPIA**

---

**QUALITY MANAGEMENT PRACTICES AND CHALLENGES  
IN ADDIS ABABA PRIVATE PRIMARY SCHOOLS: THE CASE  
OF EL-BETHELAND OLIVE ACADEMY**

**BY  
HAIMANOT TEFERA**

**A THESIS SUBMITTED TO ST.MARY'S UNIVERSITY COLLEGE,  
SCHOOL OF GRADUATE STUDIES IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT  
OF THE REQUIREMENTS FOR THE DEGREE OF MASTER OF  
BUSINESS ADMINISTRATION**

**JUNE 2014  
ADDIS ABABA, ETHIOPIA  
ST.MARY'S UNIVERSITY**

**SCHOOL OF GRADUATE STUDIES  
FACULTY OF BUSINESS**

**QUALITY MANAGEMENT PRACTICES AND CHALLENGES  
IN ADDIS ABABA PRIVATE PRIMARY SCHOOLS: THE CASE  
OF EL-BETHEL AND OLIVE ACADEMY**

**BY  
HAIMANOT TEFERA**

**APPROVED BY BOARD OF EXAMINERS**

\_\_\_\_\_  
**Dean, Graduate Studies**

\_\_\_\_\_  
**Signature & Date**

\_\_\_\_\_  
**Advisor Signature & Date**

\_\_\_\_\_  
**External Examiner**

\_\_\_\_\_  
**Signature & Date**

\_\_\_\_\_  
**Internal Examiner**

\_\_\_\_\_  
**Signature & Date**

## **DECLARATION**

I, the undersigned, declare that this thesis is my original work, prepared under the guidance of Dr. Elias Nour. All sources of materials used for the thesis have been duly acknowledged. I further confirm that the thesis has not been submitted either in part or in full to any other higher learning institution for the purpose of earning any degree.

---

Name

---

Signature & Date

## **ENDORSEMENT**

This thesis has been submitted to St. Mary's University College, School of Graduate Studies for examination with my approval as a university advisor.

---

Advisor

---

Signature & Date

# TABLE OF CONTENT

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS.....	I
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS USED .....	II
LIST OF TABLES .....	III
ABSTRACT .....	IV
<b>CHAPTER ONE .....</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>INTRODUCTION .....</b>	<b>1</b>
1.1. BACKGROUND OF THE STUDY .....	1
1.2. STATEMENT OF THE PROBLEM.....	3
1.3. RESEARCH QUESTIONS .....	4
1.4. OBJECTIVES OF THE STUDY .....	4
1.5. DEFINITION OF TERMS.....	4
1.6. SIGNIFICANCE OF THE STUDY .....	5
1.7. DELIMITATION/SCOPE OF THE STUDY.....	6
1.8. ORGANIZATION OF THE THESIS.....	6
<b>CHAPTER TWO.....</b>	<b>7</b>
<b>REVIEW OF RELATED LITERATURE .....</b>	<b>7</b>
2.1 INTRODUCTION .....	7
2.2 QUALITY IN TERMS OF PRIVATE PRIMARY SCHOOLS.....	7
2.3 QUALITY MANAGEMENT OF PRIVATE PRIMARY SCHOOLS .....	11
2.4 TOTAL QUALITY MANAGEMENT.....	13
2.4.1 TQM in Education.....	15
2.4.2 TQM in Private Primary Schools.....	16
2.5 PRIVATE PRIMARY SCHOOLS IN ADDIS ABABA .....	19
<b>CHAPTER THREE.....</b>	<b>21</b>
<b>RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY .....</b>	<b>21</b>
3.1 RESEARCH DESIGN .....	21
3.2 POPULATION AND SAMPLING TECHNIQUES.....	22
3.3 TYPES OF DATA AND TOOLS .....	23
3.4 PROCEDURES OF DATA COLLECTION.....	26
3.5 METHODS OF DATA ANALYSIS .....	27
<b>CHAPTER FOUR .....</b>	<b>28</b>
<b>RESULTS AND DISCUSSION.....</b>	<b>28</b>
4.1 RESULTS/FINDINGS OF THE STUDY .....	28
4.1.1 Profile of the Respondent's Demographic Characteristics .....	28
4.1.2 How Quality is Managed in the Two Private Primary Schools .....	32

4.1.3	<i>The Challenges of the Quality Management Practices of the Schools</i> .....	34
4.1.4	<i>The Quality Output</i> .....	50
<b>CHAPTER FIVE</b>	.....	<b>63</b>
<b>CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS</b>	.....	<b>63</b>
5.1	CONCLUSIONS.....	63
5.1.1	<i>The Practice of QM in the Schools</i> .....	63
5.2	LIMITATIONS OF THE STUDY.....	65
5.3	RECOMMENDATIONS.....	65
5.3.1	<i>Parents Involvement and Evaluation</i> .....	65
5.3.2	<i>Materials</i> .....	66
5.3.3	<i>Teachers</i> .....	66
5.3.4	<i>The Quality of the Education</i> .....	67
	<i>References</i> .....	69
APPENDIX A	.....	72
	<i>Guiding questions for the interview of the owners on the quality management of the schools</i> .....	72
APPENDIX B	.....	74
	<i>Guiding questions for the interview of the principals on the quality management of the schools</i> .....	74
	<i>Introduction:</i> .....	74
APPENDIX C	.....	79
	<i>Questionnaire on the quality management of the schools for teachers</i> .....	79
APPENDIX D	.....	82
	<i>Questionnaire on the quality management of the schools for parents</i> .....	82
APPENDIX E	.....	85
	<i>Questionnaire for Students</i> .....	85

## **ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS**

First and foremost, my hearty thanks go to Almighty God for providing me with His divine support to come up to the successful completion of this paper.

I am deeply grateful to my advisor Dr. Elias Nour for his, professional assistance and consultation, kind encouragement and understanding. I couldn't have been able to come out with this Study if he had not patiently and seriously read the thesis, and provided me with the valuable comments to meaningfully improve it.

I would like to express my heartfelt appreciation for the owners, principals, teachers, students and parents of El-bethel and Olive Academy for their relentless involvement in responding the questionnaire and devoting their time for the interview while the data were gathered for the Study.

I also thank and express my deepest gratitude to my family and friends for their all rounded support and encouragements.



## **LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS USED**

EFQM	European Foundation for Quality Management
EIE	Excellence In Experience
El-bethel	El-bethel Academy private primary school
ESDP	Ethiopian Educational Sector Development Program
FFP	Fitness For Purpose
BPEP	Baldrige Performance Excellence Program
MOE	Ethiopian Ministry of Education
Olive	Olive Academy private primary school
PTA	Parent Teacher Association
QM	Quality Management
SPSS	Statistical Product for Service Support
TQM	Total Quality Management
UNESCO	United Nations Educational Scientific and Cultural Organization

## **List of Tables**

Table 1	Profile of Respondent Teachers' Demographic Characteristics.....	28
Table 2	Profile of Respondent Students' Demographic Characteristics.....	30
Table 3	Profile of Respondent Parents' Demographic Characteristics.....	31
Table 4.	The Satisfaction of Teachers on the Infrastructure of the Schools.....	35
Table 5.	The Parents' Outlook of the Material Resources of the School .....	36
Table 6	The Satisfaction of Teachers at the Teaching Materials .....	37
Table 7	The Relationship Between the Lessons and Teaching Materials.....	38
Table 8	The Reasons of the Respondents for Joining Teaching Profession.....	39
Table 9	The Respondents Stay in the Current Schools .....	40
Table 10	The Respondent's Level of Enjoying their Stay in the Schools .....	40
Table 11	The Respondents' Experience of Teaching in Government Schools.....	41
Table 12	The Parents' Outlook about the Human Resources of the Schools.....	43
Table 13	Last Year's Teachers' Workshop Participation .....	47
Table 14	Responses about the Presence of Motivating Materials and Processes.....	47
Table 15	The Satisfaction Level of the Teachers' with their Salary.....	48
Table 16	The Teachers' Perception about their own activities in class .....	51
Table 17	The Teachers' Response about the Schools' Support in Disciplining .....	52
Table 18	The Commitment of Parents to Discuss With the Principals .....	55
Table 19	The Student's Response about Their Learning Process.....	56
Table 20	Number of Students in a Class .....	57
Table 21	The School Encouragement for the Participation of Parents.....	59
Table 22	The respondent students' choice of interesting subjects .....	61
Table 23	The respondent students' choice of disliked subjects .....	62

## **Abstract**

*This paper examines the quality management practices of two private primary schools in Addis Ababa from the perspective of regional educational bureau's standard and the stakeholders' point of view through a case study of El-bethel and Olive Academy. The research focused on the stakeholder's current awareness of quality, how quality management is practiced on educational input and processes, the existing contributions of the partakers in the schools. The study further examines the quality of the output of the schools or the acquired behavioral changes of students. Findings from the study indicate that effective quality management practice of private primary schools should mobilize all the stakeholders and it must involve all the processes in the schools which mainly include the teaching learning process. For this reason, total quality management, which is effective for people based organizations with a demand for the participation of all involved on all the processes, should be applied. The role of the administration in executing this practice is also underlined in the study. The challenges of the practice are identified to be less attention to motivating teachers, lack of creativity, and fear in facilitating parents' participation on the side of the management as well as lack of qualified and committed teachers which is manifested in high turnover rate. The results of the research in the case of the two private primary schools: El-bethel Academy and Olive Academy indicate the presence of the quality awareness and the craving of the administrations for its achievement, but shortcomings in acquiring qualified and committed teachers, providing sufficient and relevant teaching materials, mobilizing all the stakeholders toward the achievement of the quality objectives.*

# INTRODUCTION

## 1.1. Background of the Study

Private schools are legally established in Ethiopia following the enactment of the regulations of Council of Ministers in the licensing and supervision of private educational institution in March, 1995. According to the Regulations, Regional Educational Bureaus are the ones responsible for issuing, renewing every two years and revoking license based on the condition stated on the regulations (Ethiopia, 1995).

The regulation directs the curriculum to be followed by the schools, the qualifications of the teachers, the type of certificates given to the students, the process of increasing school fee, participation of parents and community. The regulation also authorizes the regional education bureaus to supervise the activities of the schools and to issue directions essential for the proper realization of the regulations.

According to the data of Addis Ababa Administration Educational Bureau Statistics, out of the 742 primary schools functioning in the region, 452 are private, 218 government and public, 46 under religious organizations, 26 under community and other (Statistics, 2013). Thus 61% of the primary schools in Addis Ababa are privately managed schools even though the number of students accommodated in each school is comparatively low.

Ethiopian Ministry of Education has set a definite standard for the purpose of aligning the educational system with the educational policy formulated, to assess the achievement of students, to ensure the uniformity of the educational system, to measure the level and quality of its educational system against the international primary schools' standard. The standard has been passed through different improvements for the last twenty years. (MOE, 1997)

In Ethiopian context, private school is an educational institution managed by private owner and established for the intention of conducting formal or non formal education at any level (Ethiopia, 1995). Schools established by foreign communities and organizations as well as by religious and charity organizations are treated differently using different regulations. The establishment of the two private primary schools covered in this study: El-bethel and Olive Academy is based on the standard of Ethiopian Ministry of Education.

Quality as a representation of service evaluation by its customers, quality outcome of education must be the main focus of the schools (Nutley, S. & Osborne, S.P., 1994). Education as other important processes, on top of having good quality content, has to be managed well in order to realize its hidden potential of assisting a student to consider himself and other people as important; acquiring skills in words and numbers as well as habits and perspective of dependable citizen; sustaining physical and emotional wellbeing; offering possibilities and support to be creative; training for challenges of the fast changing world of science and technology (Turnbill cited by Bereday (ed) 1969).

School administration should accomplish all its duty with consciousness of quality in mind in order to produce quality output. Quality management (QM) as the effective method of achieving quality goals through planning, monitoring, guaranteeing and enhancing quality; it should be the focus of school management in order to come up with quality output.

Total quality management (TQM) in schools comprises quality of return to satisfy the needs of the shareholders, quality of products and services to satisfy some specific needs of the consumer, and quality of life to satisfy the needs of the people in the organization. Applying this definition of Total Quality Management enables schools to achieve excellence (Satpathy, T., 2008). According to the theories of TQM, the goals of quality should be governed by participation of all concerned, empowerment of teachers, tackling the root causes of the existing problems, improving input and processes, performance management, effective communication, considering organization as a system, high involvement of top management.

## **1.2. Statement of the Problem**

Private primary schools in Addis Ababa have a better chance of getting best input (learners) for they attract children with all rounded family support. Therefore, they are expected by the families supporting the children to maximize this opportunity for the purpose of producing high quality output. Besides parents, the government educational bureaus also expect private primary schools to come out with better quality for benchmarking purposes.

The evaluation of quality in private primary schools should be done from two angles: regional educational bureau's standard and stakeholders' especially parent's expectation. Regional educational bureau's standard is set standards for all primary schools in Addis Ababa for the purpose of uniformity, guidance and evaluation. These dual aspects are essential for the existence and success of the school in all aspects.

As the establishment of private primary schools in Addis Ababa can be done by qualified and unqualified persons without discrimination, the evaluation of the management's awareness of quality is essential in order to comprehend the QM practices of the schools. The practice of QM should also be evaluated on different aspects of the schools since QM demands quality in all resources and processes. The assessment should also be done from different angles as seen from different point of view since the results expected from the practice should satisfy all the stakeholders. Results expected from the QM practices of private primary schools are not people, customer and business results only, but society results are also expected due to the delicate nature of education.

The current condition of various private primary schools in Addis Ababa does not fully satisfy the expectation of families and society as a whole with regard to the continuously growing school fees. Since QM considers problems of an organization as originated from the management due to its responsibility of solving problems using different mechanisms, this research focuses on the activities of the management.

The findings of this case study made on El-bethel Academy & Olive Academy private primary schools are relevant to many private primary schools in Addis Ababa.

### **1.3. Research Questions**

- i. How the management of the two chosen schools define quality?
- ii. What is the current practice of QM in the chosen two private primary schools?
- iii. How effective are the quality management practices employed?
- iv. What are the difficulties that the administrations face in exercising QM?
- v. How to improve the QM practice of the two chosen private primary schools?

### **1.4. Objectives of the Study**

The objectives of this study are the following:

- To determine the extent of quality management in two private primary schools found in Addis Ababa;
- To identify factors that contribute to the improvement or hindrance of quality outcome of education in the schools selected for the case study;
- To recommend on what has to be done to improve the existing conditions;
- To contribute material and encourage others for further research on the quality management practice of private primary schools.

### **1.5. Definition of Terms**

*Primary Schools* in Addis Ababa are schools which comprises from grade 1 – 8 (MOE, 2004).

*Private Schools* or “*Private Educational Institution* means an educational institution run by a private investor and established for the purpose of conducting formal or non-formal education or training at any level, it includes Kindergarten;” (Ethiopia, 1995).

*Formal Education* means “education based on a predetermined educational curriculum ranging from elementary school to higher education and offered according to a classified age group for a certain number of years, and it includes technical and other training programmes” (Ethiopia, 1995).

*Non-Formal Education* means “education which is not limited to a particular age group and offered to those who have no access to formal education or who are drop-outs, and it includes adult education and various training and vocational upgrading programmes” (Ethiopia, 1995).

## **1.6. Significance of the Study**

Education quality is crucial for improving the quality of business activities and it is decisive in increasing productivity of a society. Primary education is the base for all education; its quality is a foundation for the entire educational system of a nation. Students with the chance of acquiring quality education at primary level are most likely to be engaged in subsequent level of education to be exceedingly productive citizens.

This study looks into the current activities of quality management in two private primary schools of Addis Ababa and its significance relates to the findings regarding the improvements that should be made from the existing practice, what has to be introduced with a view to enhancing quality education in the schools covered in this study and the lessons that other schools can draw to the extent of their similarities with the schools that are studied.

Effective management minimizes costs without compromising in quality (Gardener in Bude ed., 1989). So the current expansion of private primary schools in Addis Ababa has to be backed up by efficient management in order not to compromise on the educational quality expected from them and to improve the quality as the society demands.

Therefore, this study is meant to help:

- private School owners, board members, principals, parents and teachers to clear up their perception of quality education and to play their role efficiently in the quality management of the schools;
- other concerned researchers to get some information to their review of literature and to encourage them to study further; and
- foreign and local agencies to revisit their investments expended on private primary schools quality improvements.



## **1.7. Delimitation/Scope of the Study**

The scope of this research is limited due to the following factors:

- The instruments intended to be used did not include observation due to time constraint which otherwise contributes a lot to the assurance of the data collected.
- The research was heavily focused on the role of the administration staff without considering the teachers' portion of classroom quality management and detailed quality teaching-learning process. If the study were inclusive of these issues, the presentation of the whole picture of the existing practice could have been clearer.
- The scarcity of research findings connected to quality management of private primary schools from developing countries may limit the chance of considering applicable experiences.

## **1.8. Organization of the thesis**

*Chapter One* deals with the Introduction of the thesis which includes the background of the study, statement of the problem, the objectives, research questions, definitions of terms, significance of the study and scope of the study. In *Chapter Two*, there is a review of literature relating to educational quality, total quality management in education and schools. In *Chapter Three*, the methodology of this study is discussed. It explains the approach of the study and the underlying rationale for the choice of the approach. The data collection method and the techniques deployed are presented. The data analysis methods are also discussed. *Chapter Four* presents the research findings and the discussion of the results. The results from the respondents are analyzed to explore the effectiveness of quality management practices and challenges of the two private primary schools. *Chapter Five* concludes the study by making some recommendations and discussing the limitations of the study.

---

## CHAPTER TWO

# REVIEW OF RELATED LITERATURE

## 2.1 Introduction

The primary purpose of this chapter is to get the theoretical understanding of how quality management of private primary schools can be undertaken. More specifically, it focuses on four areas based on different explanations of scholars and the existing practice. First, the term educational quality, quality management and total quality management are described as they are related to the Ethiopian educational policy. Second, the review briefly assesses the current general condition of private primary schools in Addis Ababa and the benefits they can reap from the practice of quality management. Third, review has identified areas on which the management should focus at the practice of quality management process. Fourth, the review of the literature has assessed the role of the principal in the quality management process. Finally the researcher has tried to summarize the outcome of the review as it is related to the subject of the study.

## 2.2 Quality in terms of Private Primary Schools

Quality is significantly essential idea for any organization since it represents an evaluation of a service by its customers. Even though there is a belief of considering market as a final judge in evaluating quality, such fatal evaluation is futile for private primary schools. The production of education and the presentation of the lessons to the students happen together while the students are active participants of the process. Allowing the market to decide on the survival of private primary schools, result in social cost besides the cost of the organization. The students suffer as they obliged to shift from school to school with personal and financial cost. Therefore, the management of private primary schools must be ahead of the market by developing quality evaluating systems in order to respond to the changing needs of society instead of closing the schools as a consequence (Nutley, S. and Osborne, S.P., 1994).

Quality is a phenomenon appreciated and looked for in every aspect of life. But, Quality cannot be defined with one meaningful idea for there are different subjective looks into it based on the conditions and individuals expressing it. According to Dale, Wiele and Iwaarden (2007: 138) quality can be defined for any business organization as ‘performance to standards’ or ‘satisfying the customer’. These expressions further clarified as ‘conformance to specifications, fitness for use, value for price paid, support provided after the product or service is purchased’. Dale, et al (2007) also mentioned the application of quality as going beyond product or service itself, to the staff members, procedures, and related organizational setting. Organizations are also cautioned to prioritize quality in order not to jeopardize their survival.

Similarly, Nutley & Osborne (1994) explained quality as dually featured and elaborated it objectively as ‘fitness for purpose (FFP)’, with the focus on characteristics of a product; and subjectively as the quality of the delivery process based on its ‘excellence in experience (EIE)’. With regard to services like private primary schools, these dual characteristics of quality are essential. The teaching learning process must fit for its purpose as the formulated objective and should render an excellent experience

Quality in terms of Private primary schools, as other service giving business organizations, should go beyond the ‘products’ which are graduated students, it has to focus on the staff members, teaching learning and administration processes, and the school setting. Quality matters for the schools to survive in the school market through attracting students as well as to accomplish their duty of sharing the government’s burden of producing well equipped future generation. Moreover, the products of primary schools are candidates for the secondary so the task of primary schools should go beyond giving the necessary information, it must comprise creating teachable generation edified with the habit of reading, comprehending and analyzing facts; equipped with good moral and ethical values; trained in basic life skills etc. Such huge task is impossible without keeping quality issues at the core.

Education is explained by G.O.M. Adem (1995:708) as “a process through which individuals gain positive behaviors, acquire necessary basic knowledge, skills and techniques of occupation and become more productive”. The realization of the potential of education can only be possible through maintaining its quality. Unless the quality of the content and the rendering process of

education kept in place, education is not education except by name for it is powerless at the face of poverty.

Even if the definition of quality education varies from society to society and from time to time based on the prevalent demand, the common understanding of quality education can be what every society accepts as offering the accepted values and virtues in changing the behavior of the learner to be worthy in character and learning at the end of the period (Ugwulashi, 2012). Hence the planning and management of education in private primary schools should be done by keeping quality issues at the core.

The explanation of basic element of quality education today by Colby & Witt (2000:3) as comprising quality of “learners, environments, content, process and outcomes” is similar to the justification of Bhumirat, *et al.* (1987:4) about the need for the assessment of primary schools quality on teaching-learning process, school management process and the evaluation of student outcomes with the further classification of “the input, the process and the output” as components.

Bhumirat,C., kidchanapanish,S., Arunrungrueng,P., Shinartakool,R.,Sirigirakal V., (1987) generalized Colby’s &Witt’s (2000:3) “ learners, environments and content” into “the input” for the other elements remained the same. Therefore we can conclude school quality can be considered as educational quality for the purpose of schools is the provision of education.

Researchers define the ‘input’ component as the requirements for the establishment of private primary schools as stated in the official documents. The input indicators reveal the adequacy and equity of educational provision among the schools. The ‘process’ component engrosses the relationships among people to utilize the inputs and manufacture outcomes and the ‘output’ component consists of qualitative and quantitative outcomes Bhumirat,et al. (1987). Therefore, the objective to improving quality of schools should focus on educational resources and processes. The focus on either one cannot result in the expected quality.

According to Bhumirat,et al.(1987: 20) ‘Educational policy directly influencesinputs and may stimulate changes in processes’. As we look closely at the current Ethiopian educational policy, it recognizes the role of education on transmitting societies ‘knowledge, experiences, new findings and values’ from one generation to another by ‘strengthening the problem solving

capacity'. It also acknowledges the impact of education in the endorsement of reverence for 'human rights' and 'democratic values' by facilitating the conditions for equality, mutual understanding and cooperation among people (MOE, 1994: 1- 2). The detailed input and process items formulated on the official documents as the standard for the establishment of private primary schools are the projections of the educational policy directly or indirectly. Therefore, fulfilling the required standard through equipping the schools with the stated inputs and shaping the processes accordingly leads to the actualization of the policy which can be considered as the attainment of the quality objectives intended by the country.

Quality indicators of primary schools as per Ethiopian Educational Sector Development Program (ESDP) are the qualification of teachers, student-text book ratio, student-teacher ratio, student-section ratio, completion rate at grade five and eight. (MOE, 1996)

Many measure the quality of schools in terms of the performance of students in public examinations and the quality of the achievement of the graduates at their jobs (NJEAP, 2006). But some doubt the consideration of public examination result as the measure of the educational quality of any school due to the differences between the learners who join the school. As Carlston B.A. (2000) explained classrooms are places where educational practice and community reality come together. Factors affecting the quality of learners range from their brain growth resulted from early upbringing care to constructive home environments and social relations. So what private primary school students can achieve in purely numerical terms is limited by other factors too besides educational quality of the schools.

Therefore, Carlston B.A (2000) suggested quality education in private primary schools better be evaluated from individual advancement in student performance as the child progresses in different stages. The other reservation about students' result raised by Carlston B.A. (2000) is even its proper utilization in specifying the end result does not show the reason behind the result which is more important in evaluating the practice of the schools.

As Dale, et. al., (2007: 140) explained business organizations that consider quality as essential invest heavily on quality to be protected from quality failure. They also stated types of quality costs as 'prevention, appraisal, internal and external quality failure costs' with the explanation of

Prevention and appraisal costs as essential for the survival of business organizations. Unless investments are done on the first two costs business sectors will be forced to face the last two quality costs. Although internal quality costs like material costs and rework etc. are damaging to the company to some level, external quality costs which occurred at customer site are deadly up to losing customers or bankruptcy of the organization.

Private primary schools as business organizations and agents who shoulder huge generational responsibility should heavily invest on 'prevention' and 'appraisal' costs of quality. Prevention costs in schools include expenses for the preparation and execution of quality plans. Appraisal costs include expenses for monitoring and checking quality. Though such activities seem wastages and time consuming when seen with regard to the core activity of teaching learning process, they have a long run effect in respect to acquiring and maintaining quality and preserving the schools from bankruptcy. Internal and external costs, which mostly emanated from failure in investing on prevention and appraisal costs, are disastrous for school and the society due to the delicate nature of education.

## **2.3 Quality Management of Private Primary Schools**

Management as the discipline that demands the accomplishment of intended objectives through people, human and conceptual skills are essential besides technical expertise knowledge (Vinal, 1967). Quality, as a burning issue for all business organizations including private primary schools, it must also be the focus of all school managers. Therefore, the management body of the organizations should involve quality in all its activities which are described by Fayol (1917) as planning, organizing, leading, and controlling. The effectiveness of school managers is so dependent on how well they accomplished these functions of the discipline.

Private primary school managers accept responsibilities to run schools meaning plan, organize direct and control all the essential activities of Schools. They do not teach students in classes, but motivate others to do the work and coordinate all the work for achieving the school objectives. They bring together material and human resources, methods and markets for achieving the objectives of the schools. They also monitor everything for the purpose of making the required adjustments. Drucker (1954) elaborated the planning task as deciding what work has to be done

to meet the goals, the organizing task as dividing the work into manageable activities with the selection and motivation of workers, and the controlling task as measuring the accomplishment of the tasks with developing people for the work.

The growing competitive economy of late 1980's and early 1990's demand business organizations a better management style in order to survive in the market. The competition forced business organizations to transform their mindset from doing 'the best possible' to 'how to satisfy the customer' mentality in order to make products and services appealing to the customer. This was a challenge for the traditional management approach which was established on having a department of quality control, practicing centralized decision making (from top management down to employees), considers quality problems as employees' fault and internally focused for its accomplishment. This resulted in the evolution of the concept of quality from quality control towards quality assurance which changed the focus of the organizations to the client and the product. (Creech, 1994)

The concept of educational quality is also evolving through time depending on the growing need of society as the growth of nations boost in all rounded way. The graduates of schools were also required to fit in the growing nations. Schools are expected to produce quality output more than ever. The competitive economies and markets did not leave schools alone for they are production centers of the needed agents of the economy.

Quality management as explained by Kenneth (2005) ensures private primary schools to have quality output in consistent basis. The four main components: quality planning, quality control, quality assurance and quality improvement can be implemented in the schools once the awareness is in place. The application of QM in the schools help to achieve more consistent quality with maximum customer satisfaction at the lowest overall cost to the school while continuing to improve the processes. The focus of QM on the means of achieving quality products enable schools to carry out appealing quality teaching learning process.

Deming (1986) brought in to the picture the refined QM though there were many transformational procedures of the traditional management for decades. The main concepts included in 14 Deming points are the breakdown of barriers between different departments of

the work, the need of the management to learn their responsibilities, aiming supervision to help people and machines to do better job, improving constantly the system of production and service and the need for education and self improvement. The Deming concepts are adaptable to private primary schools through the participation of all the stakeholders of the schools to the possible level.

According to different scholars many of the methods of QM are not only to provide techniques, but also quality cultures in all involved: suppliers, customers and the organization community. The practice also set a standard for quality as ISO 9000. QM includes quality culture, importance of knowledge management, the role of leadership in promoting and achieving high quality, systems thinking bring more holistic approaches to quality so that people, process and products are considered together rather than independent factors in QM. (Dale, et.al., 2007)

Private primary schools besides their being educational sectors they are also business organizations due to their feature of profit orientation. The main problem in implementing QM was the question of the customer. As this was resolved through discussion and research of many scholars by considering students and parents as customers (Eagle & Brennan, 2007), the focus become insuring the formation of a learning community within schools through teachers' participation in the process.

According to Deming (1986), the management is responsible for almost all the problems because of their responsibility on the assignment of resources, establishment and implementation of the methods, development of the organization culture etc. The improvement of the system in general is the responsibility of the management. The international quality standards of the ISO 9000 have supported many organizations apply quality systems since they describe the necessary basics.

## **2.4 Total Quality Management**

Total Quality Management was productive beginning from late 1980's to early 1990's until it was overshadowed by ISO 9000, Lean manufacturing, and Six Sigma. It is the last phase of the evolution of the concept of quality. Many authors indicate the enablement of TQM idea to improve the management of any area inside an organization. (Creech,1994)



The evolution of management style occurs as quality control of organizations evolve to quality assurance and then to total control and then to TQM. Though different researcher differ in some points, the principles of quality approved by all are organizational dedication and culture, the formation of TQM, the continuous improvement, the satisfaction of the client, the use of measuring and communication systems. (Deming, 1986; Juran, 1951; and Crosby, 1979)

According to Saunders (1995) TQM deepens the satisfaction of customers through facilitating the increment of knowledge of the processes as well as the reduction of errors and variations. The problems caused at such atmosphere are more of the system rather than individuals. Therefore, unlike traditional management TQM integrate quality issues into the entire firm and all associates become their own quality department. The lower levels have a hand in making decisions and problems occurred are considered as the managements' fault. The focus is on the customer who may demand more than what the organization expects, the customer is the final quality controller.

TQM enables employees to focus on quality than quantity and strive hard to excel in whatever they do. According to TQM, customer feedback and expectation are most essential when it comes to formulating and implementing new strategies to deliver superior products than competitors and eventually yield higher revenues and profits for the organization. (Ken, 1992)

There are many TQM models which make the application easy for the users. But all need thorough research on the specific organization and are founded on understanding customers (their needs and what they expect), designing perfect processes to collect customer data, collecting information to study further, analyzing and acting accordingly. This enables to understand target customer and predict customer behavior. Employees need to know how their products or services can fulfill customer needs and demands (Watson, 2000).

As Hillman (1994) elaborated every model of TQM integrates customer feedback with relevant information to plan accordingly, to design effective strategies to achieve high quality products and services. Strategies need to be evaluated from time to time. Customers are satisfied only when products and services meet their expectation, fulfill their needs and are value for money. Their overall experience with the organization must be pleasant for them to be happy and to

return to the organization. Successful implementation of TQM model needs extensive planning and most importantly the participation of every single member who is benefited out of the organization.

### **2.4.1 TQM in Education**

According to UNESCO (2004), in the past two and a half decades, education systems all over the world have expanded rapidly, as reflected in large increase in enrollments and public educational expenditures. But these quantitative developments of education systems give rise to low educational quality. As a result, many countries are facing high drop-out and repetition rates in education, especially at the primary level. Ethiopia as a developing country also faces the same challenge as the goals of enrollment and equity issues are fulfilled. Private elementary schools in Addis Ababa as parts of the Ethiopian educational system they are no exceptional in quality issues though the degree differs.

As the explanation of Ugwulashi (2012), school management encompasses all the procedures through which resources are utilized in schools to carry out the educational objectives. It is a process of organizing and utilizing school resources towards the accomplishment of educational goals. This discipline requires training in educational principles and practices in order to manage schools effectively. Comprehending the basic methods of classroom teaching and management is also essential. The importance of knowledge of administrative skills that model behaviors and motivation is inevitable for the purpose of effective school management.

Researchers believe indicators of educational quality help the management of private primary schools to point out important areas of their own activities. The management of schools should carefully represent and develop each indicator of quality and search for methods to upgrade and improve indicator representation in their own specific school circumstances. Most of the time the indicators are focused in seven areas stated as “curriculum, achievements, learning and teaching, students’ support, school ethos, resources, management and quality assurance”. (Vlašić, Vale & Puhar (n.d): 569). Bhumirat, et al. (1987) also emphasizes the need to focus on students’ personality, morality, ethics, and ability to live in agreement, ability to work as a crowd, understanding of freedom values in addition to their cognitive development during the evaluation of student quality.

Generally in education, quality deals with monitoring and identifying the areas that affect the levels of teaching. So the administrative unit of private primary schools should concern itself with teaching learning process directly or indirectly.

### **2.4.2 TQM in Private Primary Schools**

As TQM is based on the participation of all concerned, the practice in schools must focus in the involvement of teachers in the process. In such a condition it is possible to find more characteristics that indicate a learning organization since the central issue of quality management in schools is the formation of a learning community. The principles of TQM can be well utilized through different models of TQM to minimize the stress created on teachers. (Morgan and Murgatroyd, 1997)

Many countries have recently turned to the use of TQM principles and excellence models to better meet the current needs of society for school management. Much data concerning the use of various excellence models (ME) at different levels of schools has recently been reported. The application of the model demand modification and school self-evaluation as the local conditions. Many of European educational systems have used EFQM as the basis for their own schools' self-evaluation system (Watson, 2000).

According to Watson (2000) The main thing for the application of TQM models in educational institution is the soundness of the processes and ethics used in using the system in schools. Successful implementation depends on comprehending the need for a change in the organization, the participation of all the stakeholders and the devotion of the management.

European Foundation for Quality Management ( EFQM) Excellence Model which was designed in 1991 enables to have a holistic view to an organizations, to fit different functions together and enable them to complement each other. It also helps to recognize and promote success by providing guidance. The model helps to balance the short term demands of owners for dividend against long term success. Watson (2000:18) stated the enablement of the EFQM model to provide a 'truly service focused quality system' with the integral means of achieving continuous improvement. Weile et al. (1997) suggested the importance of the criteria of the model as means of understanding TQM with respect to managing their organization.

The eight main principles of EFQM are customer focus, result orientation, leadership and constancy of purpose, people development and involvement, excellence in managing the organization, partnership development, shared social responsibility, continuous learning, innovation and improvement. The model is established on nine criteria: Five 'Enablers' and four 'Results'. The 'Enablers' shows activities and the methods of an organization. The 'Results' show the achievement of organizations. (EFQM, 2012). The obtainment of the results is only possible through proper care on the 'Enablers'. If efforts are exerted systematically, results come as consequence.

The Enablers of EFQM model, as Hillman (1994: 29) expressed are 'processes and systems that need to be in place and managed to deliver total quality'. Hillman (1994) also added result offer genuine attainment of the progress. The stated enablers of EFQM are 'Leadership; People; Strategy; Partnerships & Resources; Processes, Products and Services.'

In order to apply EFQM model for schools the 'Enablers are School leadership, School strategic planning (developmental plan, curriculum, other long term plans), School pedagogical staff, support systems, School stakeholders (parents, students, local community, etc.) resources and educational processes. The stated 'Results' of EFQM model are People Results, Customer Results, Society Results and Business Results (EFQM, 2012) .

Baldrige Performance Excellence Model is also another TQM model developed in 1987. The model empowers organizations to achieve objectives, improve results, and become more competitive by aligning plans, processes, decisions, people, actions, and results. The framework starts with an organizational profile, as in the form of self-assessment and then focuses on seven key areas of management (criteria). The model gives an overall assessment of where organizations are and where they need to be. The Criteria provide the needed tools to examine all parts of management system and improve processes and results while keeping the whole organization in mind. (BPE, 2013). This model is applicable in the management of private primary schools as well as in classroom activities where students actively engaged in the teaching learning process.

The Criteria are a set of questions about seven critical aspects of managing and performing as an organization which are stated as ‘leadership; strategic planning; customer focus; measurement, analysis, and knowledge management; workforce focus; operations focus; results. The questions function as exceptional and integrated framework for performance management. The answers facilitate the alignment of resources, identification of strengths and opportunities of development, progress communication, efficiency and success and achieve strategic goals. As a consequence organizations provide ever-improving products and services to their customers and stakeholders which assures organizational stability. (BPE, 2013)

*i. The Role of the Principal*

In order to utilize the dynamic potential of education in schools, the focus on the principal is a must as mentioned on the sayings of Ukeje (1986: 20) as cited by NJEAP, 2006

“The education manager has the key to these doors.... Any one working with education is working with probably the most powerful instrument man has ever devised for his own implementation. The success of education depends on the educational managers because they are the hub on which the wheel of the educational system revolves. The quality of educational service depends essentially on the quality and ability of the managers.”

The principal of private primary schools is the one who can inspire the teachers by interacting with them, providing the needed services, regulating their activity and determining the extent of accomplishment which determines the standard to be attained by the students. Generally speaking, the principal should be an expert in executing TQM systematically.

In one way or another the management body of private primary schools should create awareness of the educational policy of the country on the teachers in some sensible way for the purpose of enabling them to interpret and translate the policy in to their daily classroom activities using their own individual creativity instead of dictating all the procedures which makes teaching boring by sucking the life out of it.

The school principals since they are the leaders who endeavor to accomplish the school aims and maintain the total school atmosphere, they have ‘ to act as social engineers in order to balance

individual and institutional dimensions of the schools' social system' (Bursalioglu, 2002: 708 cited by Kartal, 2009). As Nutley, S. and Osborne, S.P. (1994) emphasized, by citing Arkoff, R. (1976), indicators of quality must comprise the definitions of 'experts' and the service users equally. Therefore, the role of principals should not be solely individual decision making based on his/her expertise knowledge, but also the management of the system as a whole by gathering feedbacks from different angles.

The external efficiency of private primary school can also be affected by the principal. The interaction between a school and its community is very much influenced by the degree of the principal's determination to secure community participation in school activities. This is a sensible way to acquire more resources for school improvement. When parents understand school policies, they may be more willing to cooperate, thus facilitating continuation of academic learning at home to supplement learning at school. (Bhumirat, *et. al*, 1987). Private school administrators must engage themselves in planning ahead, good discipline, maintenance and cleaning culture, thorough supervision, staff recruitment and funding in excellent way.

#### *ii. Supporters of the Principal*

Board members, owners and Parent-Teacher Association (P.T.A) in private schools can be good supporters of the principals if the relationship is strengthened and systematically utilized. According to some researchers the achievement of quality can be made smooth through small group of representatives of the stakeholders that meet regularly to discuss problems, to look for solutions, and to cooperate with the management in the implementation of solutions specifically related to quality issues. (Juran and Gryna, 1980 cited by Pour & Yeshodhara, nd). Such quality circles utilize organized approaches to problem solving and operate on the principle that employee participation in decision-making and problem solving improves the quality of work, which is the principle of TQM.

## **2.5 Private Primary Schools in Addis Ababa**

The establishment of private schools in Addis Ababa creates easy access to even small communities to quality education which the public and government schools cannot undertake in the area. It has paved a way for the inferior rank to compete with the average rank and average

with higher rankon choice of schools for their children. In spite of the size of private schools, they have lessened the gap and enhanced the system to a high degree in standardizing educational outcome which the public and government schools failed to provide. Parents do their best to afford private education despite the continuously increasing cost because of the better outcome of the private school system.

The population increase and the declining of quality in various government schools are main issues for propelling most parents to send their children to private schools in Addis Ababa. Most of the parents of private school children are more sensitive to the overall quality of the school, as reflected in students' test scores. Their sensitivity in school quality pushes them up to selection of their residences accordingly.

According to Charles (2011), understanding of parents' perspectives might help private primary schools administrators to determine ways of addressing parents' concerns by giving them correct information concerning the school quality.

## **Summary**

Although education is a powerful means for the development of nations, it can only function well through appropriate quality management practice. Private primary schools in Addis Ababa should pursue such commitment effectively in order to fulfill what is expected from them as part of the public thereby sharing the government's efforts to enhance education service and to be competitive in the existing school market. The management of private primary schools can only practice the discipline effectively through awareness of: the meaning and purpose of quality education, who should take part in the process and in what way, how the mobilization of the concerned ones can be undertaken. The literature reviewed in this chapter indeed shows the need for effective total quality management in private primary schools.

---

## RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY

### 3.1 Research Design

The research is carried out by applying inductive and deductive approaches in order to come up with satisfactory conclusions. The deductive approach of the research is revealed in the usage of the theoretical framework as a springboard for the administered questionnaires and interviews of the survey. The inductive approach is seen at the focus of the research on the context of quality management practices of the schools.

The research followed mixed styles of study: exploratory and explanatory. Explanatory route which is practical for the purpose of “clarifying the understanding of a problem” (Robson, 2002 cited by Saunders, M., Lewis, P. and Thornhill, A.,: 139, 2009) is applied to clarify the quality problems of the two chosen private primary schools as well as to explore the practice and the challenges of the quality management practices of the schools. The explanatory feature applied to study the causal relationship of the schools’ quality with the resources and the processes of the schools (Saunders, M., et al, 2009: 140). Therefore, the variables are the school’s quality output (well equipped graduates), resources (human and material), and the processes (the teaching-learning and the administration).

The responses of the interviews conducted with the management also contributed to the understanding of the current quality achieved, the factors that contributed to the current quality and the problems the schools encountered. The search of literature has been done extensively to investigate the essence of private primary schools’ quality, and ways of quality improvement.

The strategies applied in this study are survey and case study. The survey method was chosen by the researcher because of its popularity as a means of gathering much data in cost-effective way (Saunders et al., 2009). Therefore, semi structured interviews and questionnaires were administered as survey instruments to the schools’ community: owners; principals; the selected students, teachers and parents.



Good and poor achiever students, different subject teachers and parents of students at different grades are included. Therefore, the researcher believes the sampling is done well for it is representative of the whole population of the schools. The response rate was also high since 4 questionnaires out of 92 were missing during the collection i.e. 95.7% of the questionnaires returned with the responses though one or two answers are missing in some. The data collected through the questionnaires was analyzed quantitatively using the SPSS statistical method.

The semi structured interviews conducted to the owners and the principals of the schools and came up with the current practices and challenges of the managerial activities of the schools. The interviews also revealed the motives of the owners behind the establishment of the schools, the visions of the school managers and their outlook of their respective schools.

The reason for the choice of applying case study strategy is due to its nature of involving a practical study of a phenomenon within its actual circumstance (Robson, 2002 cited by Saunders et al, 2009). Case study also answers the ‘why’ questions about the phenomena more steadily (Saunders et al, 2009). Therefore, it is the best option through materializing the problem of quality management of private primary schools in any perceivable manner.

The explanation behind the choice of considering multiple cases is to assure whether the results of one case occur in the other case in order to generalize from the findings (Saunders, et al., 2009). Therefore, the case of the two private primary schools can indicate more or less the existing practices and challenges of most private primary schools in Addis Ababa.

### **3.2 Population and Sampling Techniques**

The populations of El-bethel and Olive private primary schools who are considered in the study are the owners, main principals, teachers, students and parents. Sampling techniques are applied to select teachers, students and parents from the whole population for the administration of questionnaires.

Probabilistic sampling has been used to select teachers in El-bethel since 11 teachers are included from 24 teachers currently working at primary level. But in the case of Olive 11 teachers participated in the study out of the current 16 teachers. Purposive sampling has been applied to select students from each class.

Students with high and low academical achievements from each class are nominated for the administration of the questionnaires. So 16 out of 300 students at Olive, and 21 out of 540 students at El-bethel participated in the study. Though the number of students included in the study is low compared to the total number of students, an effort is applied to make the selection representative by choosing the students purposefully.

Most of the parents participated in the questionnaires are the parents of the selected students. 11 parents in Olive and 18 parents in El-bethel participated in the questionnaire.

Though both schools have more than one owner, the researcher interviewed one from each school who are the general managers of the schools. The manager of Olive is male and trained in teaching methodology and educational administration whereas the manager of El-bethel is female and neither trained in educational administration nor teaching methodology. These differences between the two owners can also be considered as essential in acquiring a variety of outlooks from the owners' point of view.

### **3.3 Types of Data and Tools**

The study used primary and secondary sources of data. Review of documents of the Ethiopian Ministry of Education like Education Sector Development Program, Education Statistics Annual Abstract, Education and Training Policy, Primary schools standard have been exploited thoroughly for the purpose preparing the data collection instruments. Semi structured interviews and questionnaires were the data collection instruments.

The nature of the information collected through the interviews and questionnaires are more about qualitative and quantitative respectively though blend exists among them. Based on the notion obtained from the literatures that quality in the schools has to be dissected and understood well in order to manage the schools accordingly. And a school with excellent quality management practice produces all rounded qualified students. Quality management was the core idea included

in the questionnaires and interviews. How it is defined? How the decline is perceived?, 'Who' decline, 'who' and 'how' was its improvement; and the level of the customer satisfaction associated with it etc.

The first part of the interview questions for the principals and owners requires the respondents to reflect on their motives behind their own activities in the schools and their comprehension of quality primary schools. Activities are mostly based on motives and understanding unless they are superficial. So the responses given to the motive and understanding questions can easily lead us to the estimation of the responses of interviewee to the remaining questions focused on the activities of the management in planning, executing and monitoring of the whole educational processes.

There may be activities exercised in the schools without proper understanding of their true nature. Such activities are either primary school traditions or direct imitations of other successful private primary schools. Though the importance of benchmarking is inevitable for improvement, direct copy without analyzing the specific conditions of that school has harmful impacts. Every good activity cannot be exercised everywhere. In the case of schools there must be a good understanding of the specific condition of the schools in terms of resources and the socioeconomic factors affecting all the stakeholders in order to decide on what should be implemented or not. Therefore, the interview questions focused on the motives and understanding enables us to evaluate the relevance of the activities on top of the results achieved through those activities.

The questions in the interview, which focus on the human resource management aspect enables us to observe how well the quality is managed in the schools since the largest share of quality educational processes in primary schools goes to the quality of teaching learning process which is closely managed by the teachers. The qualification, personality, experience, attitudes, diligence and other important aspects of teachers play an enormous role in assuring quality in the schools.

Therefore, how the management bodies of the schools execute their human resource assignment of recruiting, training, evaluating and treating teachers predict the quality achievement of the schools. The interview questions with the owners of the schools include the recruiting process

and evaluation of the principals from the owners' point of view. Though the interview questions were open-ended, they were specific in intent, allowing personal responses.

Private primary schools as educational institutions catering young children they are highly dependent on the support of parents at home for the assurance of their educational quality; and as business organizations they have to focus on their customers which comprises parents as its dominating portion. Therefore, the importance of healthy, strong, and smooth relationship with the parents of their students is inevitable for their existence and quality. Taking into consideration this aspect the researcher devotes some questions of the interviews with owners and principals about parents to highlight the existing understanding, practices and challenges of the schools in this aspect.

The questionnaires were administered to teachers, students and parents to collect data in both schools. As teaching- learning is the core activity in schools and the immediate actors of the process are teachers and students, they are included representatively in the study. Besides, students are the "end products" of the school activities due to their behavioral change expected at the end of the activity so the quality of the schools is measured mostly with respect to them.

The first part of questionnaire for the teachers requires personal information of the respondent to evaluate the age, sex, educational background, and teaching experience, attitudes toward the school, subjects he/she teaches and grades in which he/she is teaching in order to glance at 'who is speaking'. The remaining parts of the questionnaire demand the understanding of the respondent teachers on the roles and attitudes of the management body toward schools' quality and their individual feelings about communicating with the management.

The questions presented to the teachers also tried to measure the satisfaction level of the respondents on the infrastructure, available teaching materials and the compensation he/she earns. Self evaluative questions about their own classroom activities are also projected with respect to the Ethiopian educational policy and commitment to the school quality. The respondents are also requested to compare the schools with other government or public schools if they had the chance of exposure. Most of the questions presented to the teachers are close ended with comparative options.

Similarly, the questionnaires administered to the selected students require personal information, which includes age, grade, time of joining the school, last year's rank in class. The remaining part evaluates the level of the supportive role of one's own parents.

The parents as the customers of the schools and partakers in the educational processes (by supporting and encouraging their children in all possible ways at home) are included in the study through administering questionnaires. The purpose of the study and the relevance of their response in improving the school quality were also explained to them at the beginning of the questions. So the responses of parents will be presented to the management body of the schools for the purpose of quality improvement and fulfillment of the promise.

The first part of the questionnaire administered to parents requires personal information as the other questionnaires for having an impression on the context of what is said. The time duration spends with the child, the family condition and number of children in the school, the reason for choosing the school are requested. Comments on the material and human resources of the school are collected through the questions in a comparative way. The frequency of discussing with principals and teachers, the role the schools in encouraging parents to participate in the learning of their children, and suggestions about parent teacher association were also addressed.

### **3.4 Procedures of Data Collection**

The first phase of data collection was the establishment of the study framework which includes the survey and case study strategy. The survey framework includes the identification of all relevant documentation and the formulation of evaluative questions for the interviews and questionnaires. The remaining steps of this framework are the setting up of the type of analysis and indicators, identifying the sources of information, identifying the types of results.

The participants in the study consisted of 2 owners, 2 practicing principals, 22 teachers, 37 students and 29 parents. Semi structured face to face interviews were conducted with the principals and owners of the Olive and El-bethel private primary schools. Each interview session lasted approximately 40 minutes.

The establishment of the criteria, the selection of the respondents and the distribution of the questionnaires was done with the cooperation of the principals of the schools. Specific time was

facilitated for the selected teachers and students to answer the questions while they are available at the school compound. Since the selected parents were not available in the school compound, the questionnaires were sent to them via their children with paste able envelop by requesting to paste after responding to the questions. This is done to assure them the confidentiality of their responses on the way back to the researcher and to encourage them to take the questions seriously and respond heartily. It is also used to pay respect as the customers of the schools.

### **3.5 Methods of Data Analysis**

The quantitative and qualitative data collected through the interview and questionnaires was analyzed using either qualitative or quantitative analysis procedures without discrimination for the purpose of coming up with a better finding.

The collected data through the interviews was dissected to understand the existing conditions of the schools and the understanding of the managing body of the school which is inclusive of their personal visions for the schools they lead. The researcher tried to make sense of the owners' and principals' personal stories pertaining to school establishment and development and the ways in which these stories intersect between the two schools (Glensne and Peshkin, 1992). The researcher also tried to understand the respondents own frame of reference accepting the existence of more than one way of interpreting experiences (Bogdan and Bilken, 1992).

The data collected through the questionnaires were analyzed through SPSS software package to surface the implied results. The SPSS generated data was tabulated and interpreted based on the literatures and the data collected from the interviews, and the multiple cases were cross checked for the purpose of coming up with more refined results.

**CHAPTER FOUR**

**RESULTS AND DISCUSSION**

**4.1 Results/Findings of the Study**

**4.1.1 Profile of the Respondent’s Demographic Characteristics**

**Table 1: Profile of Respondent Teachers’ Demographic Characteristics**

Sex		El-bethel		Olive		Total	
		No.	percent	No.	Percent	No.	Percent
Sex	Male	6	54.5	9	81.8	15	68.2
	Female	5	45.5	2	18.2	7	31.8
	Total	11	100	11	100	22	100
Age (yrs)		El-bethel		Olive		Total	
		No.	percent	No.	Percent	No.	Percent
Age (yrs)	20 - 30	9	81.8	8	72.7	17	77.3
	31–45	2	18.2	2	18.2	4	18.2
	Above 46	-	-	1	9.1	1	4.5
	Total	11	100	11	100	22	100
Educational background		El-bethel		Olive		Total	
		No.	percent	No.	Percent	No.	Percent
Educational background	Certificate	-	-	2	18.2	2	9.5
	Diploma	1	10	3	27.3	4	19.0
	Degree	9	90	6	54.5	15	71.4
	Total	10*	100	11	100	21*	100
Teaching Methodology		El-bethel		Olive		Total	
		No.	percent	No.	Percent	No.	Percent
Teaching Methodology	Trained	9	81.8	8	72.7	17	77.3
	Un trained	2	18.2	3	27.3	5	22.7
	Total	11	100	11	100	22	100
Years in teaching		El-bethel		Olive		Total	
		No.	percent	No.	Percent	No.	Percent
Years in teaching	Below 2 yrs	4	36.4	2	18.2	6	27.3
	2-5 yrs	3	27.3	7	63.6	10	45.5
	6-10 yrs	4	36.4	1	9.1	5	22.7
	Above 10 yrs	-	-	1	9.1	1	4.5
	Total	11	100	11	100	22	100

10\* and 21\* because one respondent didn’t answer the question

The Teacher's Demographic Characteristics in Table 1 include sex, age, educational background, training in teaching methodology and teaching experience. The respondent teachers in El-bethel are 54.5% male 45.5% female. In Olive they are 81.8% male and 18.2% female. The reason for small number of female teachers in Olive is because they are the only female teachers in the school. In El-bethel while the age of 81.8% of the respondent teachers is between 20 and 30 years, the remaining 18.2% is between 31 and 45 years. In the case of Olive 72.7% are between 20 and 30, 18.2% between 31 and 45 and 9.1% above 46. Considering educational background, 90% of the teachers in El-bethel are degree holders while 10% are diploma holders. In the case of Olive 54.5% are degree holders, 27.3% diploma graduates and the remaining 18.2% are certificate graduates. Respondent teachers who had training in teaching methodology are 81.8% in El-bethel and 72.7% in Olive. In El-bethel 36.4% have less than 2 years experience, 27.3% between 2 and 5 years and 36.4% between 6 and 10 years.

The Student's Demographic Characteristics include sex, age, grade and school entrance year as shown in Table 2. Out of the respondent students 57.1% in El-bethel are male and 42.9% are female. In Olive 56.3% male and 43.8% are female. Therefore, the sex distribution is well in both schools. In El-bethel 4.8% are 7 years old, 9.5% are 8 years old, 19% are 9 years old, 4.8% are 10 years old, 14.3% are 12 years old 38.1% are 13 years old, 9.5% are 14 years old. In the case of Olive 12.5% are 10 years old, 18.8% 11 years old, 31.3% 12 years old, 25% are 13 years old, 6.3% are 14 years old, 6.3% are 15 years old. The grade level of students participated in El-bethel are 19.4% from grade 3, 19% from grade 4, 38.1% from grade 7, 23.8% from grade 8. The participation of students in Olive is 25% from grade 5, 25% from grade 6, 31.3% from grade 7, 18.8% from grade 8. The selection of students is well inclusive of students in all grade levels who are matured enough to answer the questions.

The entrance year of the students also vary from 2001 to 2012. In El-bethel 9.5% enter at 2001, 23.8% at 2003, 9.5% at 2005, 9.5% at 2006, 4.8% at 2007, 19.0% at 2008, 4.8% at 2009, 4.8% at 2010, 4.8% at 2011, 9.5% at 2012. In Olive 13.3% in 2003, 6.7% in 2005, 13.3% in 2008, 6.7% in 2010, 6.7% in 2011, 40% in 2012. The participation of students with different stay in the schools facilitate more comprehensive data.



**Table 2: Profile of Respondent Students' Demographic Characteristics**

Sex		El-bethel		Olive		Total	
		No.	percent	No.	Percent	No.	Percent
	Male	12	57.1	9	56.3	21	56.8
	Female	9	42.9	7	43.8	16	43.2
	Total	21	100.0	16	100.0	37	100.0
Age (yrs)		El-bethel		Olive		Total	
		No.	percent	No.	percent	No.	percent
	7	1	4.8	-	-	1	4.8
	8	2	9.5	-	-	2	9.5
	9	4	19.0	-	-	4	19.0
	10	1	4.8	2	12.5	1	4.8
	11	-	-	3	18.8	-	-
	12	3	14.3	5	31.3	3	14.3
	13	8	38.1	4	25.0	8	38.1
	14	2	9.5	1	6.3	2	9.5
	15	-	-	1	6.3	-	-
	Total	21	100.0	16	100.0	21	100.0
Grade		El-bethel		Olive		Total	
		No.	percent	No.	percent	No.	percent
	3	4	19.0	-	-	4	10.8
	4	4	19.0	-	-	4	10.8
	5	-	-	4	25.0	4	10.8
	6	-	-	4	25.0	4	10.8
	7	8	38.1	5	31.3	13	35.1
	8	5	23.8	3	18.8	8	21.6
	Total	21	100.0	16	100.0	37	100.0
School entrance		El-bethel		Olive		Total	
		No.	percent	No.	Percent	No.	Percent
	2001	2	9.5	-	-	2	5.6
	2003	5	23.8	2	13.3	7	19.4
	2005	2	9.5	1	6.7	3	8.3
	2006	2	9.5	-	-	2	5.6
	2,007	1	4.8	-	-	1	2.8
	2,008	4	19.0	2	13.3	6	16.7
	2,009	1	4.8	2	13.3	3	8.3
	2,010	1	4.8	1	6.7	2	5.6
	2,011	1	4.8	1	6.7	2	5.6
	2,012	2	9.5	6	40.0	8	22.2
	Total	21	100.0	15	100	36	100.0

Out of the parents participated in the study 81.8% are male and 18.2% are female in El-bethel. In Olive the male and female participants are equal. The age distribution of parents in El-bethel is 23.5% from 26 to 35 years old, 47.1% from 36 to 45 years old, 29.4% above 46 years old. In Olive 27.3% are from 26 to 35 years old, 45.5% from 36 to 45 years old and 27.3% above 46 years old. The educational background of the participated parents in El-bethel is 29.4% are below grade 12, 58.8% diploma and degree holders, 11.8% above first degree. In the case of Olive, 54.5% are below grade 12, 36.4%, are diploma and degree holders and 9.1% have above first degree. The job type of the participated parents in El-bethel is 18.8% government employee, 6.2% other employee, and 75% self employed. In Olive, 22.2% are government employee, 11.1% are other employee and 66.7% are self employed. Therefore, we can say that parents distribution is well inclusive in terms of all demographic characteristics applied in the study.

**Table 3: Profile of Respondent Parents' Demographic Characteristics**

Sex		El-bethel		Olive		Total	
		No.	percent	No.	Percent	No.	Percent
	Male	10	81.8	5	50	15	57.7
	Female	6	18.2	5	50	11	42.3
	Total	16*	100	10*	100	26*	100
Age (yrs)		El-bethel		Olive		Total	
		No.	percent	No.	Percent	No.	Percent
	18-25	-	-	-	-	-	-
	26-35	4	23.5	3	27.3	7	25.0
	36-45	8	47.1	5	45.5	13	46.4
	Above 46	5	29.4	3	27.3	8	28.6
	Total	17	100	11	100.0	28	100.0
Educational Background		El-bethel		Olive		Total	
		No.	percent	No.	Percent	No.	Percent
	Below Grade 12	5	29.4	6	54.5	11	39.3
	Diploma/Degree	10	58.8	4	36.4	14	50.0
	Above first degree	2	11.8	1	9.1	3	10.7
	Total	17	100	11	100.0	28	100.0
Job's type		El-bethel		Olive		Total	
		No.	percent	No.	Percent	No.	Percent
	Govern. employee	3	18.8	2	22.2	5	20.0
	Other employee	1	6.2	1	11.1	2	8.0
	Self employed	12	75.0	6	66.7	18	72.0
	Total	16*	100	9*	100.0	25*	100.0

25\* and 26\* because one of unanswered questions

### **4.1.2 How Quality is Managed in the Two Private Primary Schools**

Most of private primary schools in Addis Ababa are making efforts to do their best to attract students. As emphasized on the principles of TQM the extent of their quality, as their customers (parents and students) perceive, is decisive for their existence in order to win the competition with other private primary schools. On the other hand the fulfillment of the demand of the Ethiopian educational system by fulfilling the requirements of the established standard is a burning issue since failure to do so results in losing accreditation and ceasing functioning. Though most of the requirements of parents and educational officials are similar, the existence of some opposing requirements stretches the schools in between in order to keep their balance. Losing this balance can be suicidal for the schools.

The Ethiopian Educational System considers quality indicators as one of its six suggested indicators of its development program. 'Teachers' qualification (diploma), student/text book ratio, student/teacher ratio, student/section ratio and completion rate at specific grades (grade 5 and 8) are considered as quality indicators' (MOE, 2004: 7). The case of the quality management of the two private primary schools: El-bethel Academy and Olive Academy, is analyzed in this research from established standard and parents' point of view.

As the interviews conducted with the principals revealed, in the two schools there is much awareness concerning quality. The principal of El-bethel define primary school quality as the development of reading and communication skill, student's interest for exploring new things; and developing working habits with the emphasis on good character. The principal of Olive explained quality as the achievement of the set curriculum as comprised knowing oneself and environment for the first four grades, and acquirement of knowledge while identifying one's inclinations in languages, mathematics and science lessons for the remaining four grades of primary schools. Both principals are convinced in the importance of TQM practices that is continuous focus on educational resources and educational processes for the improvement of quality.

According to the explanation of the principals, all the yearly objectives of the schools except the expansion plans are related to quality. What they set as the main quality plan is students' examination result every year, but the examinations have to be evaluated beforehand about their validity by group of teachers in El-bethel. Those students who got below what is set are supported with different methods to reach at the objective before the end of the year. If they fail to meet the goals at the end, they will be forced to repeat the class or leave the school. The setting of the examination result as the objective is done by taking into consideration the contexts of each school and the previous achievements in the classes.

The principals also revealed their effort of improving students' quality begin from the admittance of students. The students are expected to attain a certain result in the entrance examinations for the levels they applied and produce a proper report card of their result from the previous schools they attended. The underlying concept for such an act in the part of the principals is the belief that students admitted with insufficient knowledge of the level are hindrances to the teaching learning process and they also suffer the whole year because of struggle for the achievement and dissatisfaction with the result. El-bethel school checks for the conduct grade given on the previous school's report card to admit a new applicant.

The explanation of the principals professes the effort of the schools in creating safe and pleasant environment through taking care of the sanity of the classrooms and the compounds, and by letting teachers or unit leaders to be around the students all the time in order to avoid harmful incidents beforehand. The consciousness of cleanliness of classes and the compound is very apparent in El-bethel Academy.

The focus of the schools in producing quality, well equipped citizens was also revealed in the interviews conducted with the principals. Olive academy encourages students to focus on civics lessons and engage them in group activities to acquire basic life skills besides the intellectual skills. El-bethel academy focuses on moral lessons and engages students in different extra-curricular activities in order to help students with basic skills. The behavioral changes expected from the students of El-bethel are inclusive of their hairstyle and clothing.

The data obtained through the interviews disclose both schools try to recruit and preserve qualified teachers to attain quality output. El-bethel tried to pay better salary with less working

hours in class, but Olive tried to acquire qualified teachers with possible less payment and normal working hours. The recruitment process of both schools is done through interview, analyzing personal documents like CV and educational documents. The teachers are also examined in class while teaching students. The teachers working in the schools are also evaluated from time to time according to the evaluation criteria of the schools and the result has consequences like promotion, warning, consultation and cancellation of contract. The evaluation system includes feedback from students and parents too. Though the payments and working hours differ in the schools, both schools suffer the high turnover of teachers.

As TQM models show, strategic planning of schools which is inclusive of curriculum is essential for the achievement of quality objectives. As the principals' responses reveal, the schools use the curriculum designed by the Ministry of Education and some additional publications. Olive academy uses additional materials by adapting the materials of other private primary schools according to the taste of the principal, the owner and the subject teachers. The adaptation of the materials in El-bethel is accomplished by the counsel of curriculum expert in addition to the evaluation of the administration staff and subject teachers.

### **4.1.3 The Challenges of the Quality Management Practices of the Schools**

As TQM of private primary schools is a management of educational resources and processes in holistic manner, the practice has many challenges from different angles.

#### **4.1.3.1 The Challenges of Managing the Educational Resources**

The educational resources to be managed in private primary schools comprise all the material resources and human resources available for the overall activity of the teaching learning process.

##### ***a)Material Resources of the Schools***

The educational material resources comprise all the available materials in the school including the infrastructure which are useful in the teaching learning process.

**Table 4: The Satisfaction of Teachers on the Infrastructure of the Schools**

The satisfaction level on the infrastructure of the school	El-bethel		Olive		Total	
	No. of teachers	Percent	No. of teachers	Percent	No. of teachers	Percent
Very good	10	90.9	8	72.7	18	81.8
Medium	1	9.1	3	27.3	4	18.2
Poor	-	-	-	-	-	-
Total	11	100	11	100	22	100

As Olive Academy’s owner explained fulfilling the standard set by the Ministry of Education about the material resources was the biggest challenge they faced at the establishment stage. Since the school functions in rented building which was constructed for general purpose, fulfilling the standard by having the prescribed rooms was a problem. Furnishing the rooms was also a related challenge, due to not only the money needed, but also the limited space of the rooms. The school was many times on the verge of ceasing its function due to loss of accreditation as it struggled to fulfill this aspect of the standard. Though the full fulfillment of the standard of the school through possessing all the required material resources is still in process, the school got its accreditation from the regional educational office which can be considered as the attainment of the standard at satisfactory level.

The biggest challenge at the establishment of the El-bethel Academy, as explained by the owner, was the acquirement of plot of land for the school and the fight they had with the villagers in the process of possessing it. Subsequent to the acquirement of the land, the construction of the school building and furnishing the school with good quality materials was not also an easy task.

Looking at the responses of the selected teachers for the study in Table 4, the infrastructure of El-bethel is believed to be very good by 90.1% of them and as medium by 9.1%. The infrastructure of Olive considered as very good by 72.7% and as medium by 27.3%. On the other hand the parents’ response on Table 5 shows 53% in El-bethel and 30% in Olive agree with the sufficient space of the classrooms. In addition the parents’ response confirms the safety and goodness of the compound of El-bethel school while indicating the compound of Olive as average in this aspect. El-bethel’s well furnished and Olive’s poorly furnished classes are also evident in the responses of the parents.

**Table 5: The Parents' Outlook of the Material Resources of the School**

	Levels	El-bethel		Olive		Total	
		No. of parents	Percent	No. of parents	Percent	No. of parents	Percent
Spacious classrooms	Strongly disagree	1	5.9	2	20.0	3	11.1
	disagree	5	29.4	3	30.0	8	29.6
	agree	7	41.2	3	30.0	10	37.0
	Strongly agree	2	11.8	-	-	2	7.4
	don't know	2	11.8	2	20.0	4	14.8
	Total	17	100.0	10	100.0	27	100.0
	Good and Safe compound	Levels	El-bethel		Olive		Total
		No. of parents	Percent	No. of parents	Percent	No. of parents	Percent
Strongly disagree		-	-	1	11.1	1	3.8
disagree		2	11.8	3	33.3	5	19.2
agree		9	52.9	4	44.4	13	50.0
Strongly agree		6	35.3	1	11.1	7	26.9
don't know		-	-	-	-	-	-
Total	17	100.0	9	100.0	26	100.0	
Well furnished classes	Levels	El-bethel		Olive		Total	
		No. of parents	Percent	No. of parents	Percent	No. of parents	Percent
	Strongly disagree	-	-	1	11.1	1	3.8
	disagree	4	23.5	4	44.4	8	30.8
	agree	10	58.8	2	22.2	12	46.2
	Strongly agree	3	17.6	1	11.1	4	15.4
	don't know	-	-	1	11.1	1	3.8
Total	17	100.0	9	100.0	26	100.0	
Sufficient books provision	Levels	El-bethel		Olive		Total	
		No. of parents	Percent	No. of parents	Percent	No. of parents	Percent
	Strongly disagree	1	5.9	2	20.0	3	11.1
	disagree	3	17.6	5	50.0	8	29.6
	agree	8	47.1	3	30.0	11	40.7
	Strongly agree	5	29.4	-	-	5	18.5
	don't know	-	-	-	-	-	-
Total	17	100.0	10	100.0	27	100.0	

Concerning the sufficiency of the books provided, the responses indicate low level in Olive and good level in El-bethel. The difference between the teachers' and the parents' view about the infrastructure, may originate from the parents' higher expectation. The teachers evaluate from the angle of suitability for their own activity of teaching, but the parents evaluate from the angle of their children's comfort.

The responses of some parents about the material resources is opposite from the majority. This may be due to individual differences. In the case of the classrooms, the difference can arise from the condition of that specific classroom in which one's child goes into for learning.

TQM emphasizes the importance of resources and customers' satisfaction associated with it for the achievement of quality results. Parents' as customers of schools their view is essential about the infrastructure of the schools. Though the teachers' fascination by the infrastructures, as workforce of organization has a positive impact in the fulfillment of quality objectives, parents' outlook as customers is also crucial.

**Table 6: The Satisfaction of Teachers at the Teaching Materials**

The satisfaction level on the Teaching material provision of the school	El-bethel		Olive		Total	
	No. of teachers	Percent	No. of teachers	Percent	No. of teachers	Percent
Very good	6	60	1	9.1	7	33.3
Medium	4	40	6	54.5	10	47.6
Poor	-	-	4	36.4	4	19.0
Total	10*	100	11	100	21*	100

10\* and 21\* because 1 respondent did not answer this question

Though the good provision of teaching materials is witnessed in El-bethel, the relevance of the materials for class lessons is not satisfactory for all subject teachers. In Olive, not only the provision of additional teaching materials is low, but also those provided are not mostly related to the class lessons as indicated on Table 6 and Table 7. Therefore it is easy to estimate the usage level of the teaching materials as low due to insufficiency and irrelevance.



**Table 7: The Relationship between the Lessons and Teaching Materials**

The relationship b/n lessons and teaching materials	El-bethel		Olive		Total	
	No. of teachers	Percent	No. of teachers	Percent	No. of teachers	Percent
Yes, absolutely	5	55.6	2	20	7	36.8
Not at all	4	44.4	7	70	11	57.9
Medium	-	-	1	10	1	5.3
Total	9*	100	10*	100	19*	100

19\* because 3 respondents did not answer to this question

**b) Human Resources of the Schools: Teachers**

TQM models emphasize the importance of focusing on pedagogical staff in order to be engaged in a continuous quality improvement process. EFQM (2012) stated this aspect as one of its ‘Enablers’ for the achievement of its ‘Results’.

Problems related to human resource is the continuous challenge of both schools beginning from their establishment. Acquiring and keeping up qualified and experienced teachers are their common burden. The owners and the principals of the schools discussed this issue with frustration. They explained the phenomenon as loss professionalism of teachers.

As the profile of respondent teachers indicates, all are educated beyond high school from certificate to degree level with most of them obtaining teaching methodology training and having more than two years teaching experience. 82% of the respondent teachers in Olive are degree and diploma holders but, 72.7% are trained in teaching methodology. The work experience of 82% of the respondents is more than 2 years. The closer look at the questionnaires of the two certificate graduates in Olive show they are females trained in the methodology. One taught for more than two years while the other below two years. These teachers teach in grade 1 and grade 2 almost all subjects. Though their stay in Olive is below 2 years and the reason they joined the profession is far from interest, they have average satisfaction due to their stay and very happy about their salary. Nevertheless, the improved standard of primary schools does not allow certificate graduates to teach in primary schools though they are trained in teaching methodology. The

Ethiopian Educational System considers teachers qualification with diploma as one of the five quality indicators and it is stated in the standard as one of the requirement.

**Table 8: The Reasons of the Respondents for Joining Teaching Profession**

Reasons for Joining	El-bethel		Olive		Total	
	No.	percent	No.	Percent	No.	Percent
Interest	6	54.5	3	27.3	9	40.9
accidentally	5	45.5	8	72.7	13	59.1
Total	11	100	11	100	22	100

The teachers' profile also reveals the existence of three methodologically untrained teachers in Olive. As it is seen on the questionnaires of the two of methodologically untrained teachers, they are diploma holders with the teaching experience of two to five years: one of them is teaching computer in all classes and the other teaching English and Social Science in grades 4,5 and 6. The remaining methodologically untrained teacher is a degree holder with teaching experience of more than 5 years. The reason for all these three teachers for joining teaching is accidental (not interest). All the three taught in Olive below two years and have the medium satisfaction with their stay. The diploma holders are very unsatisfied with their salary while the degree holder is at the medium satisfaction level about his salary.

The established standard of primary schools does not agree with such employment of teachers since teaching methodology is a great support in dealing with students of different age group and in the preparation and presentation of lessons to the younger generation. Though experience has also a great contribution to teaching skill, the springboard is knowledge of the methodology. Teaching methodology matters more than the knowledge of the subject matter at primary level because for an educated adult the content of the lessons at primary level, especially from grade 1 to 4, is comparatively simple to understand. But the way the teacher presents those facts and motivates children matters most. Such exercise of hiring teachers without methodology training is hindrance to the practice of TQM.

**Table 9: The Respondents Stay in the Current Schools**

Stay in years	El-bethel		Olive		Total	
	No.	percent	No.	Percent	No.	Percent
Below 2 yrs	11	100	9	81.8	20	90.9
2-5 yrs	-	-	2	18.2	2	9.1
Total	11	-	11	100	22	100

In the case of El-bethel, as their profile reveals all the respondent teachers are degree holders except one which has a diploma. As informed by the principal, all the teachers are degree holders and those with diploma are on the verge of their degree graduation. Two of the respondent teachers are not trained in teaching methodology. The closer look at these teachers' questionnaires reveals both are male and degree holders. One of them is teaching mathematics in grade 5, English reading in grade 7 and Physics at grade 7 and 8; he has less than 2 years experience. The other methodologically untrained teacher teaches almost all subjects in grade 1 and has a more than 2 years of experience in teaching. Both of them love their stay at the school and very happy about the salary they earn at the school.

**Table 10: The Respondent's Level of Enjoying Their Stay in the School**

Enjoyment level	El-bethel		Olive		Total	
	No.	percent	No.	Percent	No.	Percent
I love it	5	50	4	36.4	9	42.9
I'm average	5	50	7	63.6	12	57.1
I hate it	-	-	-	-	-	-
Total	10*	100	11	100	21*	100

10\* and 21\* because one respondent didn't respond to this enquiry

El-bethel tried to acquire teachers more qualified for the purpose of meeting its quality objectives. But the employment of teachers who has no training in teaching methodology (even though they are over qualified for the position) is a setback according to the standard of primary school due to the strong need of the training.

When we see Table 9 most of the respondent teachers in both schools stayed for less than two years. Even though Olive is established before five years, 82% of the teachers stayed in the school less than two years. In the case of El-bethel all the respondents stayed less than two years

in the school though the school is established before two decades. This implies the high turnover rate of teachers in both schools. This fact is also confirmed in the conducted interviews with the principals and owners of both schools.

The management of both schools professes as accomplishing their human resource management duties effectively. In spite of what the schools profess, they suffer the high turnover of teachers. The managements' proclamation of 'treating teachers well' was not confirmed by the teachers. Especially in El-bethel the management considers as doing excellent by compensating better and providing best treatment than others but the teachers' response is leaving the school any time of the year with or without giving precaution. This shows the difference between the understanding of the management and the teachers. The managements seem unaware of the teachers' view of 'treating well'. Though the teachers are satisfied with the infrastructures of the schools, their satisfaction on the teaching material is lower because of scarcity and irrelevancy issues especially in Olive. Such dissatisfactions can have a repelling effect up to disliking the work atmosphere and leaving the schools.

As we can see in Table 11 below most of the teachers have no experience in government schools though they have earlier teaching experiences. This implies the essence of the teachers' migration is among private primary schools rather than to and fro of government schools. The situations in private primary schools seem conducive for the teachers to act unprofessionally by leaving the schools any time of the year.

**Table 11: The Respondents' Experience of Teaching in Government Schools**

Experience in public or government schools	El-bethel		Olive		Total	
	No. of teachers	Percent	No. of teachers	Percent	No. of teachers	Percent
Yes	1	11.1	4	36.4	5	95.5
No	8	88.9	7	63.6	15	4.5
Total	9*	100	11	100	20*	100

9\* and 20\* because two of the respondents did not answer this question

### **c) *Human Resources of the Schools: Principals Teachers***

The internal evaluation of the principals of the two schools indicates that both of them are educated to the degree level. But, both of them didn't have the formal training in educational administration except exposures to short administration courses. The principal of Olive Academy has many years of teaching experience at different grades and seven years' experience in administering schools in government and other private primary schools. He has been the principal of Olive beginning from its establishment. The principal of El-bethel joined the current school with previous experience of two years in other private primary school. He has been working in El-bethel for ten years. All the teachers who participated in the study testify the diligence and devotion of the principals to the quality improvement of the schools. None of the teachers perceives them as weak concerning their effort.

### **d) *The Parents Evaluation of the Human Resources of the Schools***

Private primary schools are institutional and business organizations with the goals of sharing the government's burden of training and shaping the future generation on their way of winning the competition and surviving in the school market. Therefore, private schools should encourage the participation of parents of their students in their main activities to produce quality outcomes. Parents are not only co-workers but also customers. So as business organizations private primary schools have to take care of parents by valuing their comments and needs. The view of the participant parents about the two private primary schools' human resource is as follows.

The respondent parents who agree on the high level performance of El-bethel's principal are 47%, 29.4% of them believe in his average level performance and 5.9% think his performance level as low. Out of the respondent parents in Olive 50% considered the principal's performance as high, 40% considered as average. Nobody in Olive considered the principal as low level performer even though 10% of them say 'I don't know' as shown in Table 12. The performance of the principals is very good as evaluated by the parents, especially the performance of Olive's principal. This is the strength of the schools since principals as leaders they are representative of the schools and their performance as perceived by their customers (parents) is essential. The satisfaction of customers associated with the performance of principals in such manner imply quality service of the principals since customer satisfaction without quality is impossible as explained in TQM.

As the second part of Table 12 reveals 53% of the parents consider the teachers as high performers, 29.4% as satisfactory, and 11.8% as poor achievers in El-bethel. The impression the teachers created on most of the participant parents is very good. But this impression is not shared by all parents. Some (11.8%) even think the teachers as weak performers. In the case of Olive 30% of the respondent parents classify the teachers as high performers, 50% as satisfactory, and the remaining 20% proclaim their lack of knowledge about the condition.

**Table 12: The Parents’ outlook about the Human Resources of the School**

	Levels	El-bethel		Olive		Total	
		No. of parents	Percent	No. of parents	Percent	No. of parents	Percent
Principal	poor	1	5.9	-	-	1	3.7
	satisfactory	5	29.4	4	40.0	9	33.3
	Very good	4	23.5	3	30.0	7	25.9
	excellent	4	23.5	2	20.0	6	22.2
	I don't know	3	17.6	1	10.0	4	14.8
	Total	17	100.0	10	100.0	27	100.0
	Teachers	Levels	El-bethel		Olive		Total
		No. of parents	Percent	No. of parents	Percent	No. of parents	Percent
poor		2	11.8	-	-	2	7.4
satisfactory		5	29.4	5	50.0	10	37.0
Very good		7	41.2	2	20.0	9	33.3
excellent		2	11.8	1	10.0	3	11.1
I don't know		1	5.9	2	20.0	3	11.1
Total		17	100.0	10	100.0	27	100.0
Other support staff	Levels	El-bethel		Olive		Total	
		No. of parents	Percent	No. of parents	Percent	No. of parents	Percent
	poor	1	5.9	1	10.0	2	7.4
	satisfactory	6	35.3	4	40.0	10	37.0
	Very good	4	23.5	1	10.0	5	18.5
	excellent	4	23.5	1	10.0	5	18.5
	I don't know	2	11.8	3	30.0	5	18.5
	Total	17	100.0	10	100.0	27	100.0

The perception of the selected parents about the performance of the teachers in Olive is lower than in El-bethel. Even in the case of El-bethel, all the teachers are not stated as high performers. Mostly the evaluation of the parents is dependent on what they perceive as their children's behavioral change and on what they look on the exercise books. The source of parents' dissatisfaction may arise from teachers' qualification issue or something else. Teachers as the workforce of the main process of schools, their performance as evaluated from the satisfaction level of the customers is important in the practice of TQM.

Parents' lacking knowledge about the teachers of their children is unacceptable behavior at primary level since it can be considered as a symptom of negligence. Primary school parents should be attentive of their children since it is the precious time for their children to acquire good seeds which will be reaped as good fruits at the later time. If what they got is rubbish at this stage of their life, what they will be is also rubbish in the future. Ones they grow, it is difficult to change that. The parents should protect them at the early stage by involving in everything that concerns them until they are matured enough to identify good from bad.

Though this study did not focus on the support staff of the schools, they contribute to the quality of the school in different ways as TQM models express. Children learn from everybody they meet especially from those who spend longer time with them. Parents' suggestion on the activities of the support staff whom they meet and whom they have the chance of evaluating their activity is shown in the third part of Table 12. In El-bethel 47% of the respondent parents consider the support staff as high performers, 35.3% as medium and 5.9% as low achievers. In Olive 20% of the parents consider these staff as high performers, 40% as medium and 10% as low achievers. 11.8% of the respondents in El-bethel and 30% in Olive express their lack of knowledge about these staff which is more likely to happen. Generally, 82.3% of the support staff in El-bethel and 60% in Olive are considered as good by most of the respondent parents. Such response may arise from how they interact with them or looking at what they do (like the cleanliness of the school etc) or both. Therefore, the schools acquire good support staff which can contribute to the quality output.

### **4.1.3.2 The Challenges of the QM Practices of the Educational Processes**

As TQM models emphasize, excellent resources in private primary schools alone are to no avail for the achievement of quality unless they are supported with quality processes. In our case the teachers' profile indicates 64% of the respondent teachers in El-bethel and 73% of the respondent teachers in Olive have an experience of teaching for more than two years. In addition Table 11 shows 11.1% of El-bethel respondents and 36.4% of Olive respondent teachers have experience in public and government primary schools. Comparing the two, Olive comprises a larger portion of experienced teachers than El-bethel which is an advantage to it if the teachers are well motivated instead of being bored with teaching. So this strength (educational resource) of the schools should be supported by the educational process of motivating the teachers through different techniques.

#### ***a) Motivational aspect***

Though the motivation of teachers is highly dependent on themselves and their interest, there is also so much room for the management to motivate the teachers using different methods as mentioned earlier.

The closer look at the personal motivational level of the respondent teachers revealed (as shown in Table 8) that 54.5% of the respondent teachers in El-bethel joined the teaching profession out of interest whereas the rest 45.4% became teachers by accident. In the case of Olive 27.3% of the respondent teachers had been interested in teaching before they joined the profession while the remaining 72.7% joined accidentally. Those interested from the beginning are more likely to be enthusiastic about their job and slight effort of the management motivates them exponentially to achieve higher quality goals. The less interested ones demand much more systematic effort from the administration in order to be motivated and accomplish the established quality goals full heartedly.

Though the possible sources of teachers' excitement are enormous, the school environment which is organized and managed by the administration consciously or unconsciously can be considered as one to affect the contentment level of the teachers, which is essential to initiate passion for the work. As Table 10 shows, the general enjoyment level of all the respondent teachers in both schools is average and above though in El-bethel the number of very excited



teachers is equal to the average excited ones. As the interview with the owner of El-bethel revealed, the management of the school furnished the teachers' rooms with quality furniture deliberately as one means of creating excitement in the teachers. In the case of Olive those with average excitement are greater in number than those highly excited. Teachers who enjoy the school atmosphere are more prone to be motivated for the work than those bored by it.

Besides evaluating the inner passion of teachers during recruitment and organizing attractive physical school environment, the motivation of teachers can be done using additional ways: the principal's communication skill and his ability of creating team spirit as perceived by the teachers, motivational workshops, teaching material provision, the presence of encouraging materials and processes in the schools. These aspects of the two private primary schools are considered and analyzed in this study to measure the motivational aspect of the schools' administration.

As the data collected through the questionnaires of the teachers indicate, all the respondent teachers in both schools professed their principals as having a good communication skill and observe themselves as having good relationship with them. Most of them expressed the level of their freedom, in forwarding their feelings and ideas about their work to the principals while respecting them, as excellent. Such smooth relationship in the schools is a very motivating factor and enables the principals to inspire and to share their goals to their staff easily and mobilize them toward the achievement of the goals. In the case of the teachers' perception of the owners' attitude, most of the respondents believe it as motivational. So the respondents' perception of the administration in general can be taken as motivational. Three respondents in El-bethel did not answer the question about the owner. This may be due to their less exposure to the owner which can be considered as a common possibility.

As we can see in Table 13, the respondents' exposure to workshops is very low in both schools. This can be considered as a hindrance to quality unless it was substituted with something equivalent like consistent on the job training. Workshops enable participants to acquire new knowledge, to update what they already know and to be motivated to focus on common goal for a definite period of time. Though the schools use their weekly teachers' meeting for this purpose as explained by the principals, such short durations are not sufficient in motivating teachers

**Table 13: Last Year's Teachers' Workshop Participation**

The frequency of participating in workshops	El-bethel		Olive		Total	
	No. of teachers	Percent	No. of teachers	Percent	No. of teachers	Percent
Not at all	3	60	1	11.1	4	28.6
Once	2	40	4	44.4	6	42.9
Twice	-	-	3	33.3	3	21.4
3 times and more	-	-	1	11.1	1	7.1
Total	5*	100	9*		14*	100

14\* because 8 respondents did not answer this question

Table 14 shows the existence of job motivation as a result of motivational materials and processes in the schools. Such job motivation in Olive is lower than in El-bethel since 40% of the teachers are motivated in Olive while 71.4% are motivated in El-bethel. Referring back to Table 6 also confirms this fact as it explains the satisfaction level of the respondent teachers on the additional teaching material provision of the schools. In the case of El-bethel such satisfaction level is average and above, but in Olive 90.9% of the respondents are so unsatisfied with the provision.

**Table 14: Responses about Motivating Materials and Processes**

The presence of encouraging materials and processes	El-bethel		Olive		Total	
	No. of teachers	Percent	No. of teachers	Percent	No. of teachers	Percent
Yes	5	71.4	4	40	9	52.9
No	2	28.6	6	60	8	47.1
Total	7*	100	10*	100	17*	100

17\* because 5 of the respondents did not answer this question

The provision of relevant teaching materials motivates teachers to work since such practice simplifies concepts and enables the students to grasp the presented facts steadily. Teaching materials stimulate students to give attention to the teacher and the lesson since they are eager to know what the material is or how it functions. The teacher's becoming the center of attention in the middle of the class as well as the eager and interrogative look of his students awakens intense interest in the teacher to do his/her job.

**Table 15: The Satisfaction Level of the Teachers' with their Salary**

Satisfaction level with their salary	El-bethel		Olive		Total	
	No. of teachers	Percent	No. of teachers	Percent	No. of teachers	Percent
Yes, absolutely	2	18.2	1	9.1	3	13.6
Medium	7	63.6	4	36.4	11	50.0
Not at all	2	18.2	6	54.5	8	36.4
Total	11	100	11	100	22	100

The other factor that motivates teachers is the salary they earn as they accomplish their duties. The satisfaction level is low in Olive when we compare it with El-bethel. Even though the management of El-bethel professes about its excellent payment to the teachers, the responses of the teachers indicate the partiality of the fact. 18.2% of the respondent teachers are dismayed with the payment they earn meaning 18.2% of the teachers are looking for another job while staying in the school half heartedly. In the case of Olive 54.5%, which means more than half, are very unsatisfied while the fully satisfied are only 9.1%. Olive has more unsatisfied teachers with their salary as it was also confirmed by the interview with the principal. In Olive the trend of compensation to the teachers is 'the minimum possible' payment. Though Olive's teachers accept the small payment and work in the school, they are not free from the dismay resulted from the insufficient compensation. In the case of El-bethel comparatively few number of teachers are dissatisfied with their salary, but the effect on quality is not negligible since one teacher faces many students at one time or different times. Sufficient satisfactory compensation is essential for the satisfaction of workforce of any organization since unsatisfied workforce in such issues mean complaining and unmotivated manpower to accomplish the task at hand.

***b) The recruitment aspect***

The Efforts exerted on quality improvement of private primary schools should be inclusive of the recruitment process. The principals employed must be qualified influential leaders and the teachers qualified for the level they teach, motivated, equipped with the methodology. Unless and otherwise qualified and motivated teachers are acquired from the beginning, the later aspect of TQM practice of the schools will be so tiresome, demanding a lot of labor and usually to no avail. Teaching everything to teachers and motivating them all the time is impossible while they are staying in the school as teachers since the management has many things to do during the

limited time of the day. Therefore, the management's effort of acquiring qualified teachers is instrumental. Recruitment must be done cautiously without favoring anyone in the name of relative or friend. Private primary schools should also focus and work to attract qualified, motivated and experienced teachers as their daily routines in an ethical manner though it mean competing with other schools in providing for the teachers better benefits and work environment.

The recruitment process of Olive and El-bethel is accomplished by the administration staff and the owners as the interviews conducted in the presence of the principals and the owners. Recruitment is not left to one person to do whatever he/she wants in both schools which implies careful procedures of recruitment.

### ***c) The monitoring aspect***

The monitoring process must be a continuous activity in private primary schools. Monitoring should be done by teachers to evaluate the level of their students and themselves; by principals to evaluate the activities of their staff, themselves and the school as a whole. Monitoring is essential to measure the achievement level against the objective set.

As the interviews conducted with the principals of both schools reveal the monitoring process of students and teachers is done on a continuous basis.

Students are evaluated starting from the first month of the academic year. Different attempts are used to improve the condition of the student by involving his/her parents. Students who cannot achieve the intended objective are known before the end of the academic year though different techniques are applied throughout the year to change the condition. The result of the child and the decision of the school about the child's future educational life are not something sudden to all involved.

The administration announces the evaluation checkpoints at the time of the teachers' employment. The annual and weekly lesson plans, examinations and all the activities of teachers are evaluated from time to time using different techniques. The cumulative result of the evaluation matters to the teachers and the school since it is used as a springboard for promotion, consulting, training, discontinuing contract of teachers. The feedback collected through the evaluation is also informative to the planning process of the administrations.

#### **4.1.4 The Quality Output**

As TQM models in schools indicate the good performance of leadership, strategic planning, pedagogical staff and support systems, school stakeholders, resources and educational processes enable to achieve good people, customer, society, and business results (EFQM). Therefore this practice requires the possible provision of quality resources, upgrading the quality of processes in every possible way to improve the quality of output. The quality output of a private primary school is its graduated students at the end of the primary cycle education, which can be explained by the behavioral change they acquired because of their stay in that school. The ingredients of the behavioral change they acquired are those things they got during their stay in that specific school. Therefore, the main ingredient is the quality of education they obtained from the school. Therefore, the quality education is something that produces the expected behavioral changes in the students.

##### **4.1.4.1 The Quality of the Education Provided in the Two Schools**

Considering the case of the two private primary schools, the teachers participated in the study were requested to evaluate their own classroom activities with respect to the Ethiopian educational policy and their responses are tabulated in Table 16. All the respondent teachers in both schools believe the impact of their classroom activity on the students is wholesome as established by the educational policy of the country. The Ethiopian curriculum is designed for the achievement of these objectives and one of the prominent actors of the educational system which are teachers confirms the achievement by evaluating their own individual performances and the lessons. This can be considered as the evidence of the actualization of the designed objectives in the schools.

**Table 16: The Teachers' Perception about their Own Activities in Class**

	Levels	El-bethel		Olive		Total	
Contribution to cognitive development		No. of teachers	Percent	No. of teachers	Percent	No. of teachers	Percent
	Very much	11	100	7	63.6	18	81.8
	To some extent	-	-	4	36.4	4	18.2
	Not at all	-	-	-	-	-	-
	Total	11	100	11	100	22	100
Contribution to personality development	Levels	El-bethel		Olive		Total	
		No. of teachers	Percent	No. of teachers	Percent	No. of teachers	Percent
	Very much	11	100	9	81.8	20	90.9
	To some extent	-	-	2	18.2	2	9.1
	Not at all	-	-	-	-	-	-
	Total	11	100	11	100	22	100
Contribution to morality and ethics	Levels	El-bethel		Olive		Total	
		No. of teachers	Percent	No. of teachers	Percent	No. of teachers	Percent
	Very much	11	100	10	90.9	21	91.5
	To some extent	-	-	1	9.1	1	4.5
	Not at all	-	-	-	-	-	-
	Total	11	100	11	100	22	100
Contribution to the ability to live and work in agreement	Levels	El-bethel		Olive		Total	
		No. of teachers	Percent	No. of teachers	Percent	No. of teachers	Percent
	Very much	9	81.8	6	54.5	15	68.2
	To some extent	2	18.2	5	45.5	7	31.8
	Not at all	-	-	-	-	-	-
	Total	11	100	11	100	22	100
Contribution to understanding freedom values	Levels	El-bethel		Olive		Total	
		No. of teachers	Percent	No. of teachers	Percent	No. of teachers	Percent
	Very much	10	90.9	8	72.7	18	81.8
	To some extent	1	9.1	3	27.3	4	18.2
	Not at all	-	-	-	-	-	-
	Total	11	100	11	100	22	100

#### 4.1.4.2 The Contribution of Discipline for the Quality Output

The importance of discipline of all the stakeholders of the school community is inevitable in the effectiveness of educational processes for the achievement of quality goals. Teachers and students as they are different from each other in many aspects like age, role in class etc, their interactions and activities in class must be governed by definite rules for the purpose of effective time management in the process of giving quality education. Lack of discipline distracts students from concentrating on their lessons and it is a source of time wastage in class. Students' attendance in class without doing their assignment at home can be considered as half absence from class. So the administration of the school should guide and encourage teachers to exercise their authority properly in order to facilitate the educational process. The teachers must be sure about the support of the management to guide, encourage and punish students when necessary. The purpose of all disciplining activity is for the benefit of students even if the measures didn't seem pleasant at the time. The management should side the teachers in doing so up to the point of convincing parents when a misunderstanding arises.

**Table 17: The Teachers' Response about the Schools' Support in Disciplining**

Supportive school system in disciplining students	El-bethel		Olive		Total	
	No. of teachers	Percent	No. of teachers	Percent	No. of teachers	Percent
Yes	7	70	7	63.6	14	66.7
No	-	-	1	9.1	1	4.8
Average	3	30	3	27.3	6	28.6
Total	10*	100	11	100	21*	100

The condition of disciplining in El-bethel and Olive Academy from the respondents' teachers' point of view is tabulated in Table 17. The management of the schools is supportive of teachers in disciplining students according to the code of conduct of each school though the focus is stronger in El-bethel. The understanding of the 9.1% of the respondents, which is an unsupportive management in disciplining students, is a huge hindrance to quality educational process in Olive. Teachers who believe the management is against disciplining students do not manage their classes properly and this resulted in poor quality output. Though the number 9.1%

seems small, the effect of one teacher is not limited only to one student. One teacher interacts with many students at one time in class or at different times in different classes. The quality failure of the lesson one teacher gives also matter to the whole quality output of the school as discussed on processes of total quality management.

Though many school rules are obvious from experience, expressing them is important to bind the teachers and students. The management should monitor whether the rules govern or not for the purpose of efficient educational processes and the welfare of the children. Since students of primary level are very young, they cannot notice the problems created by their teachers and defend themselves when abused. Abusive behaviors of teachers at primary level may leave harmful lifelong prints on students' personality and wellbeing, which means quality failure. Therefore, the management must be watchful about the character and manner of teachers, how they interact with children besides their daily routine of teaching. Parents as the partakers of the educational process and responsible for the welfare of their children, they have to be aware of all the rules binding all the stakeholders and consciously attend their practicality as much as possible. They should also be cooperative by being submissive to the rules in what concerns them for the benefit of their children.

#### **4.1.4.3 The Stakeholders' Commitment to the Quality Output**

The production of quality output through continuous quality improvement is possible only through the participation of all the stakeholders of private primary schools.

##### ***a)The commitment of the teachers***

Teachers, especially at primary level of education, can be considered as main actors since the largest portion of the educational process lies on them. They are the ones students have direct contact with at different stages of the educational process. Not only the teachers' conscious effort but also their unconscious movement and personality influence students highly. Therefore, the commitment of the teachers matters much for the quality output of private primary schools.

As we study the conditions of the two private primary schools, all the respondent teachers in El-bethel profess about their full hearted effort to improve the quality of the schools. Two respondents in El-bethel did not respond to this inquiry for reasons undefined, but it can be



considered as their unsure position about their own commitment level. But 81.8% of the teachers are sure of their commitment and this can be considered as the potential for the achievement of quality if other factors are kept in place. In the case of Olive all the respondents are sure of their commitment to the improvement of quality and this should also be considered by the management as the potential of the school and do the provision and motivational aspects in order to come to its realization.

### ***b)The commitment of the principals***

The respondent teachers in both schools level the commitment of the principals to the quality of the schools as excellent. The principals' projection of their image as "highly committed to quality" can be considered as the strength of principals' performance since it is exemplary and motivational for the teachers. The instructions and directions of the principals can be considered as leading instead of ordering for teachers with such perception of their principals. Such perceptions are grounds for the consideration of principals' instructions as a request for cooperation instead of considering them as selfish and pointless orders from careless boss even though the purpose of the directions is sometimes unclear. Therefore, the commitment of the principal should be clear to the teachers in order to motivate them to cooperate in the process. The principal should not be far from the teachers in all he does to inspire them with his commitment. Though monitoring is essential in educational processes, in the case of teachers the motivational aspect is more of value since not every activity of the teacher can be monitored fully.

### ***c)The commitment of the parents***

Parents as a part of primary school education system should participate in the learning of their children. Students of primary schools as they are very young, they do not analyze the value of learning and do not know what to do to be successful.. Therefore, this research tried to see the commitment of the parents in both schools to evaluate the quality of the schools.

As indicated on Table 18, the analysis of the data collected from the parents through the questionnaires shows the opportunities nearly all parents got to discuss with the homeroom teachers of their children in a year (from one to five times). 70.5% of the parents in El-bethel and 72.7% of the parents in Olive also discussed with the subject teachers from one to five incidents

in the just completed academic year. The proportion of parents who discussed with the principal about their children in the completed year in El-bethel is 52.9% and in Olive is 90.9%. This difference between the two schools may arise from the difference in the number of students since El-bethel accommodates 540 students and Olive accommodates 300 students.

**Table 18: The Commitment of Parents to Discuss With the Principals**

	No of times	El-bethel		Olive		Total	
		No.	percent	No.	Percent	No	Percent
Number of times in a year the parents discussed with the director about their child	One	2	14.3	4	36.4	6	24.0
	Two	3	21.4	1	9.1	4	16.0
	Three	3	21.4	-	9.1	3	12.0
	Four	-	-	1	-	1	4.0
	5 and more	1	7.1	4	36.4	5	20.0
	Not at all	5	35.7	1	9.1	6	24.0
	Total	14*	100	11	100.0	25	100.0
	Number of times in a year the parents discussed with the homeroom teachers about their child	One	3	17.6	3	30.0	6
Two		7	41.2	2	20.0	9	33.3
Three		3	17.6	2	20.0	5	18.5
Four		2	11.8	1	10.0	3	11.1
5 and more		2	11.8	2	20.0	4	14.8
Not at all		-	-	-	-	-	-
Total		17	100.0	10*	100	27	100
Number of times in a year parents discussed with subject teachers about their child		One	5	38.5	4	50.0	9
	Two	3	23.1	2	25.0	5	23.8
	Three	3	23.1	1	12.5	4	19.0
	Four	-	-	-	-	1	4.8
	5 and more	1	7.7	1	12.5	2	9.5
	Not at all	1	7.7	-	-	-	-
	Total	13*	100.0	8*	100	21	100

The researcher tried to cross check the results obtained through the responses of the parents using the responses of the selected students for the study as indicated on Table 19. The selected students' responses indicate 81.3% in El-bethel and 90.9% in Olive confirmed their parents as using the communication book to interact with the teachers. 85.7% in El-bethel and all in Olive also testified about their parents checking their exercise books. 81% of El-bethel and 87% of Olive bear witness of the educational support they obtained at home. Therefore, the data collected from the students confirm the previous concept we got from the parents' questionnaires. The participation of parents in the learning process is high in both schools though the rate is so higher in Olive than in El-bethel. The parents in Olive are more concerned about the education of their children

**Table 19: The Student's Response about their Learning Process**

The Students' response about the usage of communication book by his/her parents	Yes/No	El-bethel		Olive		Total	
		No.	percent	No.	Percent	No.	Percent
	Yes	13	81.3	10	90.9	23	85.2
	No	3	18.8	1	9.1	4	14.8
	Total	16*	100	11	100.0	27	100.0
The Students' response about the checkup of Ex. Books by his/her parents	Yes/No	El-bethel		Olive		Total	
		No.	percent	No.	Percent	No.	Percent
	Yes	18	85.7	16	100.0	34	91.9
	No	3	14.3	-	-	3	8.1
	Total	21	100.0	16	100.0	37	100.0
The Students' response about the his/her getting support at home with class lessons	Yes/No	El-bethel		Olive		Total	
		No.	percent	No.	Percent	No.	Percent
	Yes	17	81.0	14	87.5	31	83.8
	No	4	19.0	2	12.5	6	16.2
	Total	21	100.0	16	100.0	37	100.0
The Students' response about telling their parents about their school day	Yes/No	El-bethel		Olive		Total	
		No.	percent	No.	Percent	No.	Percent
	Yes	19	90.5	12	75.0	31	83.8
	No	2	9.5	4	25.0	6	16.2
	Total	21	100.0	16	100.0	37	100.0
The Students' response about their parents asking about their school day	Yes/No	El-bethel		Olive		Total	
		No.	percent	No.	Percent	No.	Percent
	Yes	20	95.2	12	75.0	32	86.5
	No	1	4.8	4	25.0	5	13.5
	Total	21	100.0	16	100.0	37	100.0

The selected students also reveal their parents' concern about their school days or how they spent the day in school. 90.5% in El-bethel and 75% in Olive tell to their parents about their day in school always. The numbers of students whose parents inquire about their day are 95.2% in El-bethel and 75% in Olive. Large numbers of parents in both schools have information about the school activities by listening to their children even without coming to school. Although El-bethel parents seem interested about the school and their children's day in school, Olive's parents have also concern. Such participation is the demonstration of the fact how private primary school parents are concerned about their children learning and situations around their children.

#### 4.1.4.4 The Contribution of the Schools' Structure to the Quality

The structure of the school, the way it is organized, facilitates or hinders the quality to be attained. Number of students in each class or number of students each teacher teaches at a time contributes to the quality of education.

##### a) *Number of students in one class*

Large number of students in one class is a burden to the teacher and the allotted time would not be sufficient to attend each student, to know individual student and to treat accordingly. The established standard of primary schools states the possibility of teaching 50 students in one class from grade 1 to 4 and 40 students from grade 5 to 8. As we can see below in Table 20, the number of students in El-bethel's most classes is between 30 and 40, in Olive's classes is between 20 and 30 as well as between 30 and 40. All the way if we consider with respect to the established standard, both schools are organized well for the enhancement of quality. But when we compare each other Olive is more advantageous in rendering effective quality lesson to its students though quality is not only the function of the number of students in one class.

**Table 20: Number of Students in a Class**

Average no. of students in each class the teachers face	El-bethel		Olive		Total	
	No. of teachers	Percent	No. of teachers	Percent	No. of teachers	Percent
20-30	-	-	6	54.5	6	27.3
31-40	8	72.7	5	45.5	13	59.1
41-50	3	27.3	-	-	3	13.6
Total	11	100	11	100	22	100

***b)The platform the school facilitates to the participation of parents***

Although mentioned enormous times above about the contribution of parents in the acquirement of quality education, it can never be considered sufficient unless all the methods are investigated as much as possible. The owners, principals and teachers as individuals should not be the only encouragers of parents, but also the school system, the way the school is organized, the structure the school has also must prompt the parents to get involved. Parents as having many other responsibilities apart from their children's education are prone to be distracted from participating in their children's learning easily. Therefore, the school as a system and a group of people running the system should continuously require the attention of parents and call for it using different techniques. Such actions can be useful to the private primary schools up to the development of the whole school since they can encounter a chance of acquiring talented, resourceful, visionary and helpful parents besides their contributions to their own child's learning.

The parents in El-bethel and Olive were requested to reveal the practices of the schools through the questionnaires and the result is tabulated in Table 21. In El-bethel the encouragement of the school administration is perceived by 43.8% of the parents as consistent, by 37.5% of them as occasional, and 18.8% as nonexistent. In Olive the encouragement of the school administration is perceived by the 27.3% of the parents as consistent, by 27.3 as an occasional and by 45.5% as nonexistent. The implication of these figures is cautious in terms of parents' participation. Though the participation of Olive parents was so high in the former analyses, as it is evident now, the reason for their participation is not the encouragement from the school administration. They are motivated to follow up their children's education by something different, which may be their own inner initiation, or something else. Since not all parents can be self initiated due to lack of awareness or other commitments, the administration of Olive should be creative in motivating parents to participate and enhance its quality. Although El-bethel's administration is better than Olive in encouraging parents, the 18.8% of parents who did not perceive the encouragement at all is not a small number in comparison to the importance of the issue. So El-bethel's administration should work up to minimize this number to nil.

The inquiries of the questionnaire about the encouragement of the general condition of the school apart from the administration to participate in the learning process received an affirmation of

62.5% in El-bethel and 50% in Olive. But the school general conditions are expressed as discouraging by 37.5% of the parents in El-bethel and by 50% of the parents in Olive. The general conditions of the schools which comprises many things and activities need to be investigated closely to identify why such negative perceptions on parents was formed. The case of Olive is more questionable since half of the parents have such understanding of the school condition even if the case of El-bethel is not far from being questionable either.

**Table 21: The School Encouragement for the Participation of Parents**

Parents' response about the encouragement of the school administration to suggest and comment on the school activities	Encouragement	El-bethel		Olive		Total	
		No.	percent	No.	Percent	No.	Percent
Yes all the time		7	43.8	3	27.3	10	37.0
Not at all		3	18.8	5	45.5	8	29.6
Some times		6	37.5	3	27.3	9	33.3
Total		16*	100.0	11	100.0	27	100.0
Parents' response about the encouragement of the school condition to participate in the learning process	Encouragement	El-bethel		Olive		Total	
		No.	percent	No.	Percent	No.	Percent
Yes		10	62.5	5	50	15	57.7
No		6	37.5	5	50	11	42.3
Total		16*	100.0	10*	100	26	100.0

**c) Parent Teacher Association**

Literatures consider Parent Teacher Associations (PTA) as pivotal in the achievement process of quality goals of private primary schools since they are established purposely with definite goals and have the power to convince and mobilize the parent population of the school community. Therefore, the study of QM of private primary schools should focus on such relevant factor for the purpose of investigating the existing practice and recommending what has to be done. As the information obtained from the management of both schools implies there is no functioning PTA. But they have a Quality Audit Committee which comprises representatives of parents, teachers, students and the principal. The establishment of this committee is carried out according to the direction of the sub-regional (woreda) educational offices and the unit report monthly to the

office about the quality progresses of the schools. The parents involved are not elected by the assembly and most of the parents in the schools have no information about the cell or the people involved. Some of the parents participated in this study ask for some parents' association in order to present their ideas to the management of the schools and work with them, but the management of the schools are not open to such requests due to harmful past experiences with some parents. The managements prefer to deal with parents individually instead of in-group for some parents act irresponsibly and create a riot up to damaging the future and good will of the schools with their negative attitude and selfish agendas.

Both schools had not benefited from the Parent Teacher Association, as they should, because of their experience and fear of the worst. The importance of the Association is because of its ability to convince the parent population and mobilize them to the development of the schools. Parents can be used as resources by private schools when they are wanted for something wider than their child's education. But the administration of the schools should know how to communicate and how to "take the milk from the cow without aggravating her".

#### **4.1.4.5. The Current Development of Student's Interest**

The objective of the primary education besides developing students' knowledge about themselves and their environment, focuses on the development of interest and identification of natural inclinations of each student. The awakening of interest in primary students to know and search things as well as phenomena is highly dependent on the educational system of schools. Some systems may have a discouraging effect up to developing hatred toward learning or some subjects.

Excellent provision of educational resources and processes enable students to develop interest in learning. Outstanding processes and resources have the probability of attracting students' attention. Excellent teachers have great impact on developing interest of the subjects they teach in the students. Unless students understand what they learn and be good at their result in that subject, they cannot be interested in it and work for better achievement in the future. Since primary education is basic to all subsequent level education, interest development is a big issue. The interesting subjects of the responding students in El-bethel and Olive private primary schools and the number of students developed their interest in those subjects are tabulated below.

**Table 22: The Students' Choice of Interesting Subjects**

Interesting Subjects	El-bethel		Olive		Total	
	No.	Percent	No.	Percent	No.	Percent
	2	9.5	1	6.3	3	8.1
All	-	-	1	6.3	1	2.7
Amharic	-	-	2	12.5	2	5.4
Amharic, Science, English	1	4.8	-	-	1	2.7
Biology	3	14.3	1	6.3	4	10.8
Biology,civic, s.study	1	4.8	-	-	1	2.7
civic	-	-	1	6.3	1	2.7
Computer	-	-	1	6.3	1	2.7
Computer and Chemistry	-	-	2	12.5	2	5.4
English	-	-	1	6.3	1	2.7
English and Maths	1	4.8	1	6.3	2	5.4
English and social	-	-	1	6.3	1	2.7
GS,Science,Amharic,Maths	-	-	1	6.3	1	2.7
maths	2	9.5	2	12.5	4	10.8
Maths,Amharic,English	1	4.8	-	-	1	2.7
Physical Education	1	4.8	-	-	1	2.7
Science and English	3	14.3	-	-	3	8.1
Social and civic	1	4.8	-	-	1	2.7
Social study	5	23.8	1	6.3	6	16.2
Total	21	100.0	16	100	37	100.0

Similarly, those subjects considered as difficult and detested by the students may have their source of the problems with the resources and the rendering processes applied by the schools though it is difficult to conclude what impacted what at this level. Any how subjects disliked by many students in one class should be investigated closely to identify the problems. Teachers who are teaching the most hated subjects are also under question for they contribute a lot for the awakening or killing of interest. Inquiries of the questionnaires administered to the students of El-bethel and Olive about these facts come out with the following result as tabulated below in Table 23.



**Table 23: Subjects Disliked by the Students**

Disliked Subjects	El-bethel		Olive		Total	
	No.	percent	No.	Percent	No.	Percent
	2	9.5	2	12.5	2	5.4
Amharic	-	-	-	-	4	10.8
Amharic,reading	-	-	-	-	1	2.7
Chemistry	1	4.8	-	-	1	2.7
English	3	14.3	-	-	1	2.7
G/Science and Amharic	1	4.8	3	18.8	4	10.8
G/Science and Maths	-	-	1	6.3	2	5.4
Maths	-	-	2	12.5	6	16.2
Maths and Amharic	-	-	3	18.8	4	10.8
Maths and Physics	-	-	3	18.8	4	10.8
Maths,physics, Chemistry	1	4.8	-	-	1	2.7
no	-	-	-	-	1	2.7
Physics	-	-	-	-	1	2.7
Physics, Chemistry	2	9.5	-	-	1	2.7
Science and English	1	4.8	-	-	1	2.7
Social	1	4.8	2	12.5	3	8.1
Total	21	100.0	16	100.0	37	100.0

## CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

### 5.1 Conclusions

The investigation of the QM practices and challenges of two private primary schools in Addis Ababa: El-bethel and Olive Academy was done by looking closely the relationship of educational resources and processes with the educational output using different approaches from the perspective of the established standard and the school community.

Even though the choice of schools was done based on the better access to the researcher, the enormous differences between the two schools enable one to stretch the obtained findings and the derived conclusions to many private primary schools of Addis Ababa with some adjustments.

The main findings of the research questions include:-

- 5.1.1. The practice of QM in the schools
- 5.1.2. The status of the stakeholders' commitment
- 5.1.3. The effectiveness of the QM practices in the schools
- 5.1.4. The challenges of the QM practices of the schools

#### 5.1.1 The Practice of QM in the Schools

##### a) The Awareness of Quality

The management of the schools has a profound knowledge about educational quality and considers the importance of improving quality for the purpose of becoming competent in the school market and out of responsibility for the future generation as a citizen. Though this study is devoted to internal quality management area, the research procedures reveal the active roles played by the regional educational offices in creating awareness of the country's educational policy and the quality output the nation expects from them.

## **b) The QM of the Schools**

The schools begin their practice of quality management from acquiring quality input, the admittance of capable students is one aspect of the focus of the administration for the purpose of acquiring quality learners.

The Schools present relevant lessons. The curriculums used in the schools are not solely the ones prepared by the ministry of education, but also additional materials from other sources. Most of these added materials are copied and adopted from other schools in the case of Olive. El-bethel tries to prepare such materials with consultation of curriculum experts. All the way the sources of these materials are mostly foreign books available in the country. The Schools stage activities and present lessons for the acquirement of basic life skills besides intellectual skills.

The QM effort of the two schools focuses on the management of human and material resources, the teaching learning process, creating safe environment. The management of material resource includes purchasing, renewing, placing all the materials needed in a way they can be functional and preserved. The human resource management of the schools includes the hiring, training, motivating, directing, evaluating and monitoring of all human resources of the schools. The teaching learning process got the main focus of the management in both schools.

### *i. The Human Resource Management of the Schools*

Although Ethiopian Ministry of Education emphasizes sufficient qualification of teachers by stating it as one indicator of quality, Olive employed few under qualified teachers and other methodologically untrained teachers as its staff. El-bethel also employed methodologically untrained teachers.

The perception of the selected parents about the performance of the teachers in Olive is lower than in El-bethel.

The recruitment process of teachers in both schools is inclusive of similar procedures screening documents, interview and examining in class while teaching etc. The process is accomplished by the administration staff as a group.

## **5.2 Limitations of the Study**

- A. The instruments intended to be used did not include observation due to time constraint which otherwise contributes a lot to the assurance of the data collected.
- B. Though students themselves have some part in the improvement of quality, considering the smallness of their age and ascribing the responsibility to their parents, the study focuses on them to reveal their parents activities only.
- C. The scarcity of research findings connected to quality management of private primary schools from developing countries may limit the chance of considering applicable experiences.

## **5.3 Recommendations**

The managements of El-bethel and Olive Academy private primary schools, as the leaders, have to set quality objectives and activate all involved toward the achievement of the intended objectives. Therefore, they shoulder the bigger accountability and they are responsible for the duty of everybody involved .

### **5.3.1 Parents Involvement and Evaluation**

The impression the principals of both schools imprint on most of the parents is excellent for one reason or another. Principals, as the representatives of the schools, the impact they create on the customers is essential for the good will of the schools. Therefore, such consciousness stamped on parents can be considered as the strength of the schools, which has to be upheld for the success of the schools.

The management of Olive should encourage all the parents to participate in the learning process of their children, which of course begins with their knowing about the conditions of their children's teachers.

The existing trend of the parents' active role of acquiring information about the schools by interacting with their children at home should be encouraged to continue since it is essential for parents to protect their children from harmful incidents in school by taking measures early.

### **5.3.2 Materials**

The infrastructures of both schools are fascinating to all the teachers. But few parents complain about the size of classrooms. Therefore the management has to check the size of all the classrooms and evaluate their suitability for the teaching learning process.

The purchasing of teaching materials must be incorporated in annual plans and the purchasing process ought to allow the participation of respective teachers with careful consideration before hand to avoid holding of irrelevant teaching materials as a stock component of material resources. Teachers should also be encouraged and supported to modify the available teaching materials and use them creatively.

### **5.3.3 Teachers**

The group recruitment process in both schools using different techniques can be considered as strength since it eliminates bias arising from individual limited perspective though the process takes much longer time.

The certificate graduate teachers in olive have to be encouraged and assisted to pursue their studies and upgrade themselves. Both schools have to avoid their trend of recruiting teachers without proper knowledge of teaching methodology. The case of dismayed teachers because of what they earn as compensation in Olive must be cautious to the management to do something about it as soon as possible.

Most of the teachers in both schools are close to be motivated. Therefore, the management bodies must devise different mechanisms to stir them to improve their accomplishment. The importance of more frequent motivational and updating workshops, motivating materials and processes, the contentment as a result of sufficient compensation should get the attention of the management to mobilize the teachers toward the achievement of educational quality goals. The management should also be careful at the recruitment process to acquire interested teachers besides their qualifications. The planning should also be carried out in a way that eliminates boredom that mostly arises from the repetition of the same thing.

Although no respondent teacher of the study hates his/her stay in their school, all are not highly satisfied for some reason. The management should devote its focus to study and improve the conditions in the respective schools to satisfy the teachers by facilitating family atmosphere through smooth communication and excellent leadership. The social atmosphere of the school must be managed well to create a healthy relationship of love, respect, cooperation etc. among all the staff members.

As the analysis of the collected data implied the main migration of teachers is among private primary schools. Therefore, private primary schools should cooperate and establish a sort of an agreement to minimize the turnover of teachers through submitting to the common agreement to besides improving their internal situations.

The administration of the schools should clear its stand to all the stakeholders on discipline matters and support the practicality of the rules at all times. The doubt observed in Olive's teachers concerning the support of the management in disciplining students is a hindrance to the quality improvement. Therefore, the administration of Olive should be apparent concerning its position in disciplining students and provide support for the teachers to exercise their authority properly in order to clarify such impediments.

The management of the schools should facilitate ways for the teachers to know their individual impression created on the parents of their students. Such awareness facilitates the personal development of teachers as they stayed in the profession. It is also important for the overall improvement of the schools. The teachers shouldn't consider their accountability as solely to the school administration, but also to the students and parents. They shouldn't think of themselves as standing in front of small children but also in front of their adult parents too at each classroom session. This enables the teachers to value their duty and to be satisfied with what they do.

#### **5.3.4 The Quality of the Education**

As noticed in the evaluation of teachers with respect to the Ethiopian educational policy the education presented at both schools can be considered as quality education due to its potential in producing quality students, equipped in all directions.

Though the importance of using additional materials (other than the set curriculum) may not be a hindrance to the educational process, the content of the materials should be analyzed well before applied in the schools. Some materials can be beyond the comprehending capacity of the children at that specific grade level and become boring to the students up to killing their interest toward that subject or learning in general.

The big focus of El-bethel on extracurricular activities which are aimed for building basic life skills should be considered as the strength of the school. The minimum effort of Olive in staging such activities should be strengthened creatively to come out with versatile graduates.

# References

- Arkoff, R.(1976). Does quality of life have to be quantified? In operational research quarterly as, V(27) pp.289-303
- BPEP (2013) Baldrige Performance Excellence Program. 2013–2014 Criteria for Performance Excellence.
- Bhumirat,C., kidchanapanish,S., Arunrungrueng,P., Shinartakool,R.,Sirigirakal V., (1987) Research and Evaluation on the Quality of Primary Education in Thailand.  
Unpublished material, Harvard University and United States Development Agency.
- Bogdan, R.C., & Bilken, S.K. (1992). *Qualitative research for education* (2nd ed). Boston: Allyn and Bacon
- Bude, U. (ED.) (1989). The Challenge of Quality in Primary Education in Africa- From reformation to crisis ZED.
- Bursalioğlu, Z. (2002). New Structure and Behavior in School Management. Ankara University No. 154.
- Carlson B. A (2000). Achieving Educational Quality: What Schools Teach Us. Learning from Chile's P900 Primary Schools. Santiago: United Nations Publication.
- Charles, G.W. (2011). Parental Perceptions of School Quality in Public and Private Schools. Colby, J., Witt, M. and Associates; (2000, June). Defining Quality in Education. A paper presented at the UNICEF meeting of The International Working Group on Education. Florence, Italy.
- Creech, B. (1994). *The Five Pillars of TQM: How to Make Total Quality Management to Work for You,* New York.
- Crosby, p. (1979). *Quality is free.* New American Library: New York.
- Dale, B.G., Wiele, V.D., Iwarden, J.V., (2007) *Managing Quality* Blackwell publishing, USA
- Deming, W.E. (1986). *Out of the Crisis.* Cambridge: MIT Press.
- Drunker, P. F, (1954) *The Practice of Management.* USA: Harper Business.
- Eagle and Brennan (2007). 'Are students customers? TQM and marketing perspectives for surveying education.
- EFQM (2012). The European Foundation for Quality Management. History of EFQM. Available at [www. Efqm.org/history htm](http://www.Efqm.org/history htm)
- Ethiopia. (1995). *Licensing and supervision of private Education Institutions* Council of



- Ministers Regulations No. 206/1995, Addis Ababa: Birhanena Selam Printing House.
- Fayol, H. (1917). *Administration industrielle et generale*. Paris: H. Dunod et E. Pinat
- G. O. M. Âdem, Democratic, secular, contemporary education policy, p.708, Ankara, 1995.
- Gardener, R. (1989). Improving the Quality Primary Education: Where Do we start?
- Glesne, C., & Peshkin, A. (1992). *Becoming qualitative researcher: An introduction*. New York: Longman
- Hillman, G. P. (1994) 'Making Self-assessment Success', *Total Quality Management*, Vol. 6 (3), pp. 29-31.
- Juran, J.M. (1951). *Juran's Quality Control Handbook*.
- Juran, J. M. & Gryna, F. M. (1980). Quality Planning and Analysis. New York: McGraw-Hill.
- Kartal, S.(2009). The Difficulties That Primary School Principles Encounter in The Application of Administration Processes In Turkey. International Journal of Humanand Social Sciences.
- Kenneth R. H., (2005) Project Quality Management: Why, What and How. Lauderdale, Florida: J. Ross Publishing. Available at [http:// en. Wikipedia.org/wiki/Quality\\_management#cite\\_ref\\_1](http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Quality_management#cite_ref_1) & note 3 [Accessed 17 April. 2002].
- MOE (1994 ),Education And Training Policy, Unpublished manuscript, Addis Ababa.
- MOE (1996),Educational Sector Development Program. Unpublished Manuscript, Addis Ababa.
- MOE (1997),Primary School Standard. Unpublished Manuscript, Addis Ababa.
- MOE (2004),Education Statistics Annual Abstract. Unpublished Manuscript, Addis Ababa.
- Morgan, C. & Murgatroyd, S.(1997). *Total Quality Management in the Public Sector*. Open University Press. Buckingham –Philadelphia.
- NJEAP (2006).The Application Of Total Quality Management In Private Secondary Schools In Lagos State. Nigerian Journal of Education Administration and Planning. Vol. 6 No. 1
- Nutley, S. and Osborne, S.P., (1994). *The Public Sector Management Hand Book*: Harlow: Longman Publishing.
- Pour, H.M and Yeshodhara, K. (nd). *Total Quality Management (TQM) in Education*. Perception of Secondary School Teachers. Unpublished manuscript, India.
- Robson, C. (2002) Real World Research(2nd ed.). Oxford: Blackwell.
- Satpathy, T., (2008) *Total Quality Management: A Promising Fixation To*

Accomplish Zero Defects submitted on Mon, 09/01/2008 – 14:00).

Saunders, I. (1995). Managing quality and risk. *Journal of Occupational Health and Safety*, 11(6),579– 586.

Saunders, M., Lewis, P. and Thornhill, A. 2009. Research Methods for Business Students. Pitman Publishing, England.

Statistics, (2013) Yearly statistical data of Addis Ababa Educational Bureau. Unpublished material. Addis Ababa

Turnbill in Bereday(ed) (1969) at proceedings of the National conference of Ministry of Education held at Adama Ras Nov 9-11, 2001.

Ugwulashi, C.S. (2012). Parent Teachers Association (PTA) Roles and Funding of Private School Administration in Nigeria. Asian Journal of Management Sciences and Education, Vol.1 No. 2. Nigeria.

UNESCO (2004). Report on the Development of Education in Ethiopia. A paper presented at the 47 session of the UNESCO international conference education, Geneva,Switzerland.

Vinal, K. A. (1967) The Extracted MBA : A topical reference for the contemporary MBA. Universal Publishers Parkland, Florida.

Vlašić, S., Vale, S., Puhar, D.,K (n.d). Quality Management In Education. Interdisciplinary Management Research V. Croatia

Watson, P., (April 2000), ‘Applying the European Foundation for Quality Management (EFQM) Model’, Journal of the Association of Building Engineers, Vol. 75 (4).

Wiele van der, A., Dale, B. D. and Williams, A. R. T., (June 1997), ‘ISO 9000 Series Registration to Total Quality Management: the Transformation Journey’, International Journal of Quality Science, Vol. 2 (4).

---

---

# Appendices

## Appendix A

### Guiding questions for the interview of the owners on the quality management of the schools

#### Introduction:

Good afternoon and thank you for agreeing to have this interview with me. My name is Haimanot Tefera and I am a post-graduate student in St. Mary's University. I am working on a research paper and I selected your School for my study.

Please go through the purpose of my visit, the guiding questions as outlined below and I shall continue with the interview if the contents are ok with you.

#### Purpose:

I am writing a paper on "Quality Management Practices and Challenges in Addis Ababa Private Primary Schools, which will be submitted to St. Mary's University (SMU) graduate studies as a senior research paper. The purpose of academic paper is to enable us to study different issues in a society and contribute to the improvement or solutions. So this paper purposes on private primary schools to determine the extent of the practice of quality management, to identify the factors affecting it, and to recommend on what has to be done to improve the existing conditions.

I would also like to assure you that the information gathered from this interview will only be used for academic purpose and the copy of the report shall be submitted to your school.

#### Guiding questions:

1. How is the School established?
  - What motivates you to establish this school? Or to have a school?
  - When was the school established?
  - What were the challenges you faced at the establishment?
2. What do you wish your school to be in the future besides enlargement?
3. What are the specific features you wish your school to have in the future?
4. How do you define school quality? Are you interested in the quality of your school? Are you satisfied currently with the quality of your school? If not why do you want your school to acquire more quality?

5. What do you mention as a factor for the current attainment of quality? Adequate educational resources or efficient educational processes?
6. How do you evaluate the efficiency of the school management?
7. How many principals do you have? How do you communicate with the main principal of your school? Do you have a meeting with him? How frequent?
8. Do you have any communication with the PTA (Parent Teacher Association)? If so, is there anything you get out of it?
9. As the owner of the school what did you do to enhance and encourage total commitment to quality; total commitment to students' satisfaction; total commitment to continuous quality improvement?
10. Is there board of governors in the school? Who are the members? How did you select the members? What is the function of the board of governors? How frequently they meet? What was their accomplishment this year? What are the challenges you face concerning them? What do you say about their contribution to the quality of your school?
11. What is the requirement of your school to hire a principal for the primary school?
12. Are you satisfied with the current principal? Why?
13. How long the principal stayed in the school? What did he contribute to the quality of the school since his employment? What did he contribute this year?
14. Does the principal come up with new ideas of improving quality?
15. Does your school have specific quality goals to achieve?
16. Are the core values of your school related with “Leadership and quality culture; continuous improvement and innovation in educational processes; employee participation and development; fast response and management of information; customer-driven quality and partnership development, both internally and externally?
17. Is the school principal acting as social engineer? How is his communication skill with you and other staff members which he manages?

## Appendix B

**Guiding questions** for the interview of the principals on the quality management of the schools

### **Introduction:**

Good morning (afternoon) and thank you for agreeing to have this interview with me. My name is Haimanot Tefera and I am a post-graduate student in St. Mary's University. I am working on a research paper and I selected your School for my study.

Please go through the purpose of my visit the guiding questions as outlined below and I shall continue with the interview if the contents are ok with you.

### **Purpose:**

I am writing a paper on "Quality Management Practices and Challenges in Addis Ababa Private Primary Schools, which will be submitted to St. Mary's University (SMU) graduate studies as a senior research paper. The purpose of such academic paper is to enable us as students to study different issues in a society and contribute to the improvement or solutions. So this paper focuses on private primary schools to determine the extent of the practice of quality management, to identify the factors affecting it, and to recommend on what has to be done to improve the existing conditions.

I would also like to assure you that the information gathered from your documents and from this interview will only be used for academic purpose and the copy of the report shall be submitted to your school.

### **Guiding questions**

#### 1. Personal information

a. What is your educational background?

- . Do you have training on educational administration and teaching methodology?
- . Do you have experience in teaching?

b. For how long did you involve in teaching or administration of schools?

c. What do you say about the challenges you face in the management of private primary schools? What do you say biggest challenge in the management of private primary schools?

2. Do you believe in the saying “The quality of educational service depends essentially on the quality and ability of the managers”? To what extent?
3. How do you personally define primary school quality, quality education?
4. Do you set yearly quality objectives to attain in the given academic year separately or are your quality goals included in the others? If you set separately what are they? Were you able to achieve the quality goals you aimed at last year? If not what were the factors affecting the quality?
5. What do you say about the quality of this school in comparison with other private, public and government primary schools in your area (or where you work before)? What is your measure to say so? What do you mention as special and specific feature of your school which others can use for benchmarking purpose? If you worked for government or public schools before what do you see as the difference b/n private and the others?
6. Do you have personal quality goals to achieve concerning your work in the school which gives you meaning? What do you aspire to see in the students as a result of your stay in this school? What do you want to accomplish in this specific school before you leave this place? What do you wish the school to have to accomplish your goal?
7. Are there actions you are taking in the school system to determine whether the standard of education is maintained or not in terms of inputs, processes and outputs?
8. As the principal of the school what do you do to enhance and encourage total commitment to quality; total commitment to students' satisfaction; total commitment to continuous quality improvement
9. As the leader who endeavors to accomplish school aims and maintain the total school atmosphere, are you concerned with the individual needs of your staff and school social system?
10. Is there a mechanism you evaluate you own quality management activity?

11. Are you aware of Ethiopian educational policy and the standard of primary schools?  
Which part of the standard is difficult to achieve? Which do you think as unnecessary for the achievement of quality education? What do you suggest to be added as the requirement for better achievement?
12. How do you evaluate the quality of your educational system? Are you continuously focused on quality? How do you explain your focus on quality at daily basis on
- learners,
    - at the admission of students
  - environments,
    - in creating safe environment
    - in creating caring environment
  - content,
    - relevance for acquiring basic intellectual skills
    - relevance for acquiring basic life skills
  - process
    - application of the student focused methods and
    - utilization of the teacher's professional judgment for the enhancement of learning
  - outcomes
    - information obtained by the students
    - the acquired ability of students
    - the change perspective created in the students
13. How do you use the following indicators of quality in your specific school conditions: curriculum, achievements, learning & teaching, students' support, school ethos, resources, management and quality assurance?
14. Does your school have all the material requirements of MOE?
15. Are you teaching the Ethiopian curriculum only? Or are you using additional materials? If so how do you evaluate the relevance of the materials and why do you prefer to use the additional materials?

16. How many teachers do you have? What are your criteria for employing teachers? How do you examine them during employment?
17. How is the turnover rate of teachers? Are they leaving during the academic year or only at the end? How do you bind them to stay until the end of the year?
18. Does the school provide workshops and other skill updating activities to update teachers? How many times in a year?
19. What are the things the school does to keep up the morale of teachers? To create pleasant work atmosphere?
20. How do you evaluate the productivity of teachers?
21. Do you have a mechanism by which you discipline teachers? Do you have any experience related to disciplining teachers?
22. In which ways as the principal you interfere in the teaching-learning processes in classes at daily basis.
23. Is there any method you apply to increase the efficiency of teaching-learning process which differs from what is common in other schools?
24. How do you create awareness of quality among the teachers and other staff members? Is there a planned activity to do so?
25. How many sections do you have for each class?
26. How many students do you have in the school? In each class?
  - Does each class have its own homeroom teacher?
  - How many subjects are the students learning in each class?
  - At what interval do the students take exams in each subject?
  - How many times a year do you consolidate student's result?
27. Do you provide all the needed text books to the students? What is the student-book ratio?
28. Does your school work for student quality in terms of cognitive, personality, morality, ethics, and ability to live in agreement, working as a crowd, understanding freedom values? What are the methods?



29. Do you evaluate student quality in terms of cognitive, personality, morality, ethics, and ability to live in agreement, to work as a crowd, to understand freedom values?  
How?
30. How is your students' achievement in public examinations? When students score low results what do you do to identify the source of the problem and to improve the result?
31. Do you give attention to maintaining discipline in the school? Or is it only the task of teachers? If you give attention, what do you do? What kind of discipline measures have been taken yet? For what mistakes?
32. Do you utilize ICT in your school? (Radio lessons, TV- plasma, and Computer) ? For which classes? How many times in a week?
33. How do you communicate with parents? How do the teachers communicate with parents?
34. How much do you allow parents to participate in important decisions?
35. Is there PTA in your school? Who are the members? How did you select the members? How frequent are the meetings? What are the challenges you face concerning the association?
36. Is the PTA supportive for the management of the school?
37. Did the PTA contribute for the achievement of quality goals? If so how?
38. Is there any other way besides PTA for collecting parents view about the school?
39. As the principal what did you do to strengthen the interaction between the school and the parents; the school and the surrounding community?
40. How many students drop out of each class before the academic year completed? How many students repeat in each class?
41. What do you say about the contribution of this school for the surrounding government and public primary schools?

## Appendix C

### Questionnaire on the quality management of the schools for teachers

1. Personal information

- a. Sex  Male  Female
- b. Age  20 – 30  30 – 45  above 45
- c. What is your educational background?  
 Certificate  Diploma  Degree
- d. Are you trained in teaching methodology?  
 Yes  No
- e. Why do you choose to be a teacher?  
 because I am interested  accidentally
- f. For how long have you been teaching?  
 less than 2 years  2-5 years  5-10 years  greater than 10 years
- g. For how long did you teach in this school?  
 less than 2 years  2-5 years  5-10 years
- h. Are you enjoying your work in this school?  
 I love it  I hate it  I neither love it nor hate it
- i. What subjects, and in which grades are you teaching?  
(please write the subjects & grades consecutively)

Subjects \_\_\_\_\_

Grades \_\_\_\_\_

1. How do you perceive the role of the principal of your school? How is he doing?  
 Excellent  Good  Poor
2. How do you define your relationship with your principal?  
 Excellent  V.good  Good  Poor
3. Does the school provide workshops and other skill updating activities to update teachers?  
How many times last year?  
 Not at all  once  twice  3times and more
4. What extent is your satisfaction with the following?  
- Infrastructure of the school

Very good                       Good                       Poor

- Provision of teaching materials

Very good                       Good                       Poor

5. Are there things and processes in the school which enhances your commitment to your work?

Yes                       No

- If yes what are they \_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_

6. How many students are you teaching in one class on average?

\_\_\_\_\_

7. Did you work in government or public primary schools? How do you explain the difference between private and government schools?

\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_

8. What do you say about the commitment of the management for the quality of the school?

Excellent                       Good                       Poor

9. Does your classroom activity contribute for student quality in terms of

a. Cognitive development  very much    to some extent    nothing

b. Personality development  very much    to some extent    nothing

c. Morality & ethics  very much    to some extent    nothing

d. Ability to live in agreement & to work as a crowd  very much    to some extent  
 nothing

e. Understanding freedom values  very much    to some extent    nothing

10. Does the management keep up the moral of the teachers?

Yes, absolutely                       Not at all                       Medium

- If you answer is “yes absolutely” or “medium”, how?

\_\_\_\_\_

11. Is the principal’s communication with you smooth which enables you to respect him as well as forward your ideas & share your feelings about your work freely?

Yes, absolutely       Not at all       Medium

12. Are the teaching materials provided by the school related to what you teach in the class?

Yes, absolutely       Not at all       Average

13. Are you using all the available teaching materials in your school?

Yes       Sometimes       Not at all

14. Has the school code of conducts which bind you as a teacher, students and parents?

Yes       No       I don't know

15. Is the school system supportive in disciplining the students for the purpose of creating favorable condition for the teaching and learning process?

Yes       No       Average

16. As a teacher in the school are you totally committed to continuous quality improvement and to students' satisfaction?

I am doing my best       I am trying to do       I did nothing concerning that

17. Are you satisfied with your salary?

Very much       Medium       Not at all

18. Does the approach of the owner motivate you to work?

Very much       Medium       Not at all

19. Does the management of the school create team spirit in the compound?

Very much       Medium       Not at all

## Appendix D

### Questionnaire on the quality management of the schools for parents

#### Introduction

I am interested to have your opinion on the quality of education provided to your child by this private primary school. The intention of the questionnaire is to have feedback from you and assist all concerned in improving the educational quality of the school.

#### Personal Information

- a) Sex  Male  Female
- b) Age  18 - 25  26 - 35  36 - 45  above 46
- Educational background  below Grade 12  grade 12 +2(4)
- above first degree
- c) Job  government employee  other employee  self employed

1. The length of time in hours (minutes) you spend with your child.

Weekdays \_\_\_\_\_

Saturdays & Sundays \_\_\_\_\_

Other holidays \_\_\_\_\_

2. How many children do you have?

1  2  3  more than 3

3. How many of them are at the primary school level?

1  2  3  more than 3

4. How many of your children are in this school?

1  2  3  more than 3

5. For how many years are you using the service of this school for your child (children)?

2 years & less  3-5 years  5-7 years  8 years and more

6. Why did you prefer this school for your child (children)? Because

- It is near my residence
- I heard about its quality from my friends & neighbors
- Randomly I chose this school

If you have other reasons fill it here \_\_\_\_\_

7. What do you expect from your child after his/her completion of grade 8?

\_\_\_\_\_

8. How many times in a year did you have the opportunity of meeting with the school administrator?

1       2       3       4       5 and more

9. How many times in a year did you have the opportunity of meeting with the homeroom teacher?

1       2       3       4       5 and more

10. How many times in a year did you have the opportunity of meeting with the subject teachers?

1       2       3       4       5 and more

11. What do you say about the material resources of the school?

[thick (√) in the cell of your choice]

	Strongly disagree	disagree	neutral	agree	strongly agree	don't know
Spacious classrooms						
Good & safe compound						
Well furnished classes						
Sufficient provision of text books						

12. How do you define quality in education in general?

\_\_\_\_\_

13. What do you aspire this school to be in the future?

\_\_\_\_\_

14. What do you say about the human resources of the school?

[thick (√) in the cell of your choice]

	poor	satisfactory	sufficient	v.good	excellent	I don't know
principal						
Teachers						
Other support staff						

15. What did you observe as a short coming in the completed academic year?

---

16. Is there PTA in the school? Is it doing well? Is it behaving like a bridge between the parents and the school?

---

17. What are the things done by the PTA to improve the quality of the school so far which you are familiar with?

---

18. Did the school provide you the opportunity of telling or writing your comments, suggestions and your concerns to the teachers or principal?

Yes all the time  Not at all  Some times

19. Does the school system encourage you to participate in the learning process of your child? If yes how?

---

20. As the parent are you concerned about your child's acquirement of quality education and his satisfaction? If you are, what did you do to realize it?

---

21. Are you totally committed to your child's continuous quality improvement in his learning and the educational programme in every possible way? If so what did you contribute & are contributing to its realization?

---



## **Appendix E**

### **Questionnaire for students**

1. Personal Information
  - a. Sex
  - b. Age
  - c. Grade
  - d. Your last year's rank in the class
  - e. At which grade did you join this school?
2. In which subjects are you interested most? Why?
3. Which of the subjects are difficult for you?
4. Which of the teachers are you fond of?
5. Which of your teachers are difficult for you to get along with
6. What do you like to do in the school compound after class
7. Do your parents check your exercise books & communication book at home?
8. Is there anyone who helps you with your lessons after the regular school time?
9. Do you tell about your day in school for your parents at home? Are they listening to you?  
Do they have time?